

OFFICERS
President
 Cheryl Fishbein
Vice Presidents
 Ester R. Fuchs
 Jonathan Greenspun
 Gene Rachmansky
 Craig S. Unterberg
Secretary
 Robyn Polansky Morrison
Treasurer
 M. Ronen Schwartzman
Executive VP & CEO
 Gideon Taylor
CEO Emeritus
 Michael S. Miller
Honorary President
 Jack D. Weiler*

BOARD OF DIRECTORS
 Jonathan Adelsberg
 Karen R. Adler
 Sanford Antignas
 George Arzt
 Shari Berg
 Abraham Biderman
 Charles R. Borrok
 W. Stewart Cahn
 Brian M. Cohen
 Steven D. Cohn
 Suzanne R. Davidowitz
 Harrison Denman
 Suzanne W. Doft
 Camille Dunst
 David A. Fine
 David J. Friedman
 Zoya Raynes Friedman
 Ruth Golani
 Dimitriy Goloborodskiy
 Bennett W. Golub
 Jay Hershenson
 Matthew J. Hiltzik
 JJ Hornblatt
 Suzanne Denbo Jaffe
 Donna Jakubovitz
 Richard I. Janvey
 Karen Spar Kasner
 Judy Kaufthal
 Bradley Korn

MEMBER ORGANIZATIONS

AMEINU-NY Region
 American Association of Jews from the FSU
 American Gathering and Fed. of Jewish Holocaust Survivors
 American Jewish Committee
 American Sephardi Federation
 AMIT
 Anti-Defamation League, NY Regional Office
 B'nai B'rith
 B'nai Zion
 Bronx Jewish Community Relations Council
 Concourse-North Bronx Jewish Community Council
 Co-op City Jewish Community Council
 Parkchester-Unionport Jewish Community Council
 Jewish Community Council of Pelham Parkway
 Riverdale Jewish Community Council
 Council of Jewish Organizations in Civil Service
 Council of Jewish Organizations of Bensonhurst
 Council of Jewish Organizations of Flatbush
 Council of Jewish Organizations of Staten Island
 Crown Heights Jewish Community Council
 Emunah Women of America
 Greater New York Coalition for Soviet Jewry
 Hadassah, NY Chapter
 Hillel: The Foundation for Jewish Campus Life
 Jewish Community Council of Canarsie
 Jewish Community Council of Greater Coney Island
 Jewish National Fund
 Jewish War Veterans
 Jewish Women International Greater NY Region
 Masada - Holocaust Survivors Organization
 NA'AMAT USA
 National Council of Jewish Women – NY Section
 National Council of Young Israel
 New York Board of Rabbis
 ORT America
 Queens Jewish Community Council
 Religious Zionists of America
 Shorefront Jewish Community Council
 The Jewish Education Project
 UJA-Federation of NY
 Union for Reform Judaism
 Union of Orthodox Jewish Congregations
 United Hebrew Trades/NY Jewish Labor Committee
 United Jewish Council of the East Side
 United Synagogue of Conservative Judaism
 Washington Heights-Inwood Jewish Community Council
 Westchester Jewish Council
 WIZO - Women's International Zionist Organization
 Workmen's Circle
 Zionist Organization of America

Past Presidents
 Martin S. Begun*
 Kenneth J. Bialkin*
 Judah Gribetz
 Gedale B. Horowitz*
 Alan S. Jaffe
 Ezra G. Levin
 Matthew J. Maryles
 Lester Pollack*
 Richard Ravitch
 Janice W. Shorenstein
 Charles Temel*
 Laurence A. Tisch*
 Peggy Tishman*
 Ronald G. Weiner
Honorary Officers
 George Klein
 Rabbi Israel Miller*
 Daniel Shapiro*
 *Deceased

Marlen Kruzhkov
 Seymour P. Lachman
 Alisa F. Levin
 Jerry W. Levin
 Jeffrey E. Levine
 Max J. Levine
 Richard S. Linhart
 Michael P. Lustig
 Joel R. Marcus
 Josh Moskowitz
 Mitchell L. Moss
 Shira Nadel
 Michael Nussbaum
 Shelley Lieff Parker
 Simon "Shimi" Pelman
 Joseph Rafalowicz
 Andrew Rechtschaffen
 Eric Rechtschaffen
 Anna Propri Riesenber
 Edward Schauder
 Eugene Schneur
 Eliad Shapiro**
 Marissa J. Shorenstein
 Rada Sumareva
 Richard M. Weinberg
 Jacob J. Worenklein
 Zachary Zetlin**
 ** Observer



May 17, 2022

Hon. Patrick McAllister
 Special Master Jonathan Cervas
 Steuben County Supreme & County Court
 3 East Pulteney Square
 Bath, NY 14810

Re: *Harkenrider v. Hochul* E2022-0116CV
Submission of Interested Party:
 Jewish Community Relations Council of NY

Letter of the
 Jewish Community Relations Council of New York
 and the
 UJA-Federation of New York
 Opposing elements of the Congressional Map
 As submitted by the Special Master

Dear Justice McAllister and Special Master Cervas:

We appreciate that the Court undertook a formidable and thankless task. Redistricting requires complex decisions balancing, often contradictory, priorities. Given the time constraints we salute the Court's efforts. Examining the proposed lines, we find many problematic issues that will be raised by our colleagues in other Jewish organizations, but we will focus on two, related, major concerns: 1) that the neighborhood distinctiveness and integrity of Manhattan's East Side and West Side should be maintained, and 2) that Boro Park's Jewish community should be connected to communities that share their interests so that they are less politically isolated, and their political voices are more likely to be heard.

The *Sidewalks of New York* – a *Fin de Siècle* ditty – defines the communities of interest of Manhattan for the ages: East Side, West Side. Even without mentioning the current incumbents, New York City's electoral history spanning decades and multiple redistrictings, shows the East Side “Silk Stocking District” represented by such giants as John Lindsay, Ed Koch, and Bill Green; the West Side's representatives include such legendary figures as William Fitts Ryan,

520 Eighth Avenue, Suite 1400 | New York, NY 10018 | Tel. 212-983-4800 | www.jcrcny.org
 1740 Old Jericho Turnpike | Jericho, NY 11753 | Tel. 516-433-0433 | www.jcrcny.org



Bella Abzug, and Ted Weiss. Each masterfully represented their districts, with district population cores reflecting true communities of interest, with distinction. Each of these elected officials played or plays an outsized role on the national scene. New York City benefited.

Our expertise is the demographics, communal structure and defined interests of Jewish communities in New York City, Long Island and Westchester. Zooming into the Jewish communities of Manhattan we observe that there are obvious differences between the East Side and West Side Jewish communities.

While both the East Side and the West Side support synagogues and Jewish schools of national stature, East Side Jews can be clearly differentiated from West Side Jews. Rarely do the East Side Jews belong to synagogues located on the West Side, or vice versa. To a great extent, seldom do Jewish parents on the West Side send their children to Jewish schools on the East Side or the other way around.

While it is impossible to analyze the Special Master's proposed districts in the time allotted, there are stark differences between the current CD 10 and CD 12. According to our 2014 study, ("Brief Profiles of the New York Congressional Districts") CD 12 Jewish households have almost triple the number of children (33% vs. 12%) compared to CD 10. On the other hand, the East Side has far more vulnerable seniors (Age 65 and living alone): 24% vs. 17%. Nine percent of the Jewish households in CD 10 include a Holocaust survivor vs. five percent in CD 12.

Most strikingly, 37% of the households in CD 10 identify as Orthodox Jews, compared to 6 percent of households in CD 12. Much of this imbalance is due to the inclusion of Boro Park in the West Side district. However, it should be noted that the Modern Orthodox population of the West Side often supports the interests of the Yeshivish (centrist Orthodox) and Hasidic populations of Boro Park, reducing their political isolation.

While we acknowledge that the Special Master's proposed plan keeps the corpus of Boro Park's Jewish community intact within the proposed CD 10, Boro Park is cut off from the adjoining neighborhoods of Flatbush, Kensington and Midwood. These neighborhoods can be easily defined as sharing Boro Park as a community of interest. Instead, Boro Park's interests are distinct from even the Jews of Lower Manhattan, Park Slope, Windsor Terrace and Brownstone Brooklyn. The Special Master's proposed map makes it incredibly difficult to make their political voices heard.

The Jewish-religious aspects of the East Side/West Side dichotomy only reflect a fraction of the uniqueness of the two, somewhat adjoining neighborhoods. It is hard for a non-New Yorker to understand how different the East Side and West Side are. Every level of New York politics and government respects that geographic/urban planning distinction: City Community Planning Boards, Police Precincts, School Boards, City Council, State Senate, State Assembly and Congress. Even New York State Judicial Districts are drawn respecting East Side and West Side boundaries. All of these districts clearly reflect the distinct communities of interest. The Special Master's map ignores that and would yield the biggest geographic/tectonic shift in New York politics since the opening of Central Park before the Civil War.

We understand the inherent difficulties in the drawing of district plans weighing the Constitutional priorities. Unfortunately, the Special Master's plan puts the greater emphasis on "Compactness" as opposed to "Communities of Interest", ripping fraying threads of the social fabric. In this case, the proposed plan sets off a political game of musical chairs resulting in the fact that communities will not know their representatives and their elected representatives will neither know nor understand their constituencies.

We humbly implore the Court and Special Master to reconsider his plan and develop a plan that reflects the clear communal integrity and communities of interest of the East Side and the West Side and the Jewish neighborhoods of Brooklyn.

We thank the Court and the Special Master for their consideration of this matter.

Respectfully submitted,



Cheryl Fishbein
President



Gideon Taylor
Executive Vice President and CEO