United States District Court Southern District of Texas

#### **ENTERED**

August 04, 2023
Nathan Ochsner, Clerk

### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS GALVESTON DIVISION

| TERRY PETTEWAY, et al.,  | § |            |
|--------------------------|---|------------|
|                          | § |            |
| Plaintiffs,              | § |            |
|                          | § |            |
| VS.                      | § | 3:22-CV-57 |
|                          | § |            |
| GALVESTON COUNTY, TEXAS, | § |            |
| et al.,                  | § |            |
|                          | § |            |
| Defendants.              | § |            |
|                          |   |            |

#### **ORDER**

The parties have submitted several objections to the trial exhibits. *See* Dkts. 204-2, 207, 214, 216. The plaintiffs have also moved to admit expert reports under Fed. R. Evid. 807. Dkt. 213. The court grants the plaintiffs' motion in part and attaches to this order its rulings on the other evidentiary objections.

Non-expert-report exhibits for which the court has overruled all pending objections are admitted into evidence. For expert-report trial exhibits (including exhibits, tables, figures, and appendix materials from the reports), the court will not pre-admit these exhibits or admit them in lieu of live expert testimony. Instead, it will admit these exhibits subject to any

further objections in open court if the expert testifies and adopts the statements in the report while under oath and subject to cross examination.

Signed on Galveston Island this 4th day of August, 2023.

JEFFREY VINCENT BROWN

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

## Plaintiffs' Objections to Defendants' Exhibit List (Dkt. 204-2)

| DX No. | Objection   | Ruling                    |
|--------|---|---------------------------|
| 001    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained <sup>1</sup>    |
| 002    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 003    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 007    | FRE 401 (Relevance)   | Overruled                 |
| 011    | FRE 401 (Relevance), 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)                          | Overruled                 |
| 014    | FRE 106 (Completeness)  | Overruled                 |
| 015    | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)  | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 016    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 019    | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time); FRE 802<br>(Hearsay) | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 020    | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time); FRE 802<br>(Hearsay) | Overruled                 |
| 021    | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)                          | Overruled                 |
| 022    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 026    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 028    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 030    | FRE 802 (Hearsay), FRE 401 (Relevance), 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)       | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 031    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 033    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 039    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 040    | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> If the court sustains a hearsay objection, it will still allow the proponent of the evidence to prove at trial that the evidence is not hearsay or falls under a hearsay exception.

| 042 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
|-----|---|---------------------------|
| 049 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)                       | Overruled                 |
| 055 | FRE 401 (Relevance), 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time); FRE 802<br>(Hearsay) | Sustained                 |
| 057 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)                       | Overruled                 |
| 058 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 059 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 060 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 061 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 070 | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance);<br>Lacks Foundation; 702 (Expert testimony)     | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 071 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)                          | Overruled                 |
| 081 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)                          | Overruled                 |
| 083 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 090 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)                       | Overruled                 |
| 106 | FRE 106 (Completeness)  | Overruled                 |
| 117 | FRE 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)   | Overruled                 |
| 118 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 123 | FRE 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)   | Overruled                 |
| 124 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)                          | Overruled                 |
| 125 | FRE 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)   | Overruled                 |
| 126 | FRE 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)   | Overruled                 |
| 130 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)                       | Overruled                 |
| 131 | FRE 401 (Relevance)   | Overruled                 |
| 132 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)                       | Overruled                 |

| 133               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Sustained only on relevance   |
|-------------------|--|-------------------------------|
| 140               | FRE 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time); FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                     |
| 142               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)   | Overruled                     |
| 143               | FRE 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 144               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)   | Overruled                     |
| 145               | FRE 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 156               | FRE 802 (Hearsay)  | Sustained                     |
| 157               | FRE 106 (Completeness)   | Overruled                     |
| 158               | FRE 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 160               | FRE 401 (Relevance)  | Sustained                     |
| 161               | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)   | Sustained only on hearsay     |
| 162               | FRE 802 (Hearsay)  | Sustained                     |
| 164               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 165               | FRE 401 (Relevance)  | Overruled                     |
| 167               | FRE 401 (Relevance)  | Overruled                     |
| 170               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 171               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 172               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 173               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 174               | FRE 401 (Relevance)  | Sustained                     |
| 177               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time)  | Overruled                     |
| 178               | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)   | Overruled                     |
| 179               | FRE 802 (Hearsay)  | Sustained                     |
| 180               | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)   | Sustained only on hearsay     |
| 177<br>178<br>179 | FRE 401 (Relevance)  FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)  FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice, Confusion, Waste of Time)  FRE 802 (Hearsay) | Overruled Overruled Sustained |

| 181 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
|-----|---|---------------------------|
| 183 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 185 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 186 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 193 | FRE 401 (Relevance); 403 (Prejudice,<br>Confusion, Waste of Time) | Overruled                 |
| 197 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 198 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 205 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 206 | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)                            | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 207 | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)                            | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 210 | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)                            | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 211 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained                 |
| 212 | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)                            | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 214 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 215 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 216 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 217 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 218 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 219 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Overruled                 |
| 220 | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)                            | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 221 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony);                                       | Overruled                 |
| 222 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled                 |
| 223 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled                 |
| 224 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled                 |
| 225 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled                 |
| 226 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled                 |

| 227 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled |
|-----|---|-----------|
| 228 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled |
| 229 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled |
| 230 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled |
| 231 | FRE 702 (Expert Testimony); FRE 802 (Hearsay)                     | Overruled |
| 242 | FRE 802 (Hearsay); FRE 401 (Relevance)                            | Sustained |
| 243 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained |
| 244 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained |
| 245 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained |
| 247 | FRE 802 (Hearsay)   | Sustained |
| 259 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 260 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 261 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 262 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 263 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 264 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 266 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 267 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 268 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 269 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 270 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 272 | FRE 106 (Completeness) - lacks family                             | Overruled |
| 273 | FRE 901 (Authenticity / Foundation) -<br>Master Date is 9/12/2022 | Overruled |
| 275 | FRE 901 (Authenticity / Foundation) - Master Date is 9/12/2022    | Overruled |
| 276 | FRE 901 (Authenticity / Foundation) - Master Date is 9/12/2022    | Overruled |

| 277 | FRE 901 (Authenticity / Foundation) -<br>Master Date is 9/12/2022 | Overruled |
|-----|---|-----------|
| 278 | FRE 901 (Authenticity / Foundation) -<br>Master Date is 9/12/2022 | Overruled |
| 279 | FRE 901 (Authenticity / Foundation) -<br>Master Date is 9/12/2022 | Overruled |
| 280 | FRE 901 (Authenticity / Foundation) -<br>Master Date is 9/12/2022 | Overruled |
| 281 | FRE 901 (Authenticity / Foundation) -<br>Master Date is 9/12/2022 | Overruled |
| 283 | FRE 106 (Completeness) – lacks families                           | Overruled |

# Defendants' Objections to Plaintiffs' Exhibit List (Dkt. 207)

| PX No. | Objection  | Ruling  |
|--------|--|---|
| 1      | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 2      | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 3      | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 4      | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 5      | Authentication; Foundation; Hearsay;<br>Object to use of document not disclosed in<br>response to disclosures, copy not provided<br>until 7/14/2023; | Sustained   |
| 6      | Hearsay, Relevance   | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 7      | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 8      | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 9      | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 12     | Hearsay  | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 13     | Relevance, foundation  | Overruled   |
| 17     | Relevance, authentication, foundation<br>(unsigned letter; signed copy is at<br>DEFS00035811- 816)   | Authentication objection<br>withdrawn August 3, 2023<br>Overruled if replaced with<br>signed copy |
| 21     | Relevance  | Overruled   |

| 22 | Relevance   | Overruled                 |
|----|---|---------------------------|
| 23 | Relevance   | Overruled                 |
| 26 | Hearsay, relevance  | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 29 | Relevance   | Overruled                 |
| 40 | Relevance, foundation   | Overruled                 |
| 47 | Relevance   | Overruled                 |
| 48 | Relevance   | Overruled                 |
| 49 | Relevance   | Overruled                 |
| 51 | FRE 106 - Incomplete document (MSJ PDF Exhibit incomplete; should be submitted in native format)  | Overruled                 |
| 59 | Inadmissible under FRE 408 as a settlement negotiation; incomplete document   | Withdrawn July 27, 2023   |
| 60 | Relevance, hearsay  | Overruled                 |
| 61 | Inadmissible under FRE 408 as a settlement negotiation; incomplete document   | Withdrawn July 27, 2023   |
| 62 | Hearsay   | Sustained                 |
| 65 | Relevance, Hearsay (news article in body of email)  | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 66 | Improper designation of entire deposition<br>transcript as documentary evidence; entire<br>transcript is not evidence and contains<br>inadmissible testimony and attorney<br>discussion | Sustained                 |
| 67 | Improper designation of entire transcript as documentary evidence; entire transcript is not evidence and not all portions are relevant  | Sustained                 |
| 68 | Relevance; Hearsay  | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 69 | Hearsay   | Sustained                 |
| 70 | Hearsay   | Sustained                 |
| 71 | Hearsay   | Sustained                 |
| 73 | Relevance; hearsay; authentication; FRE 403   | Overruled                 |
| 74 | Relevance; hearsay; authentication  | Overruled                 |

| 75  | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
|-----|---|---|
| 76  | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 77  | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 78  | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 79  | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 80  | Relevance; hearsay; authentication; not disclosed prior to exchange of exhibit list; improper format for record | Authentication objection<br>withdrawn August 3, 2023<br>Sustained                 |
| 81  | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 82  | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 83  | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 84  | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 85  | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 86  | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 88  | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 89  | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 91  | Relevance; hearsay; authentication; foundation  | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 92  | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 97  | Relevance; authentication   | Overruled   |
| 98  | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 99  | Relevance; incomplete document  | Overruled   |
| 100 | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 102 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 106 | Relevance; hearsay  | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 107 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 108 | Hearsay; Authentication; Reliability/FRE 703  | Authentication objection<br>withdrawn August 3, 2023<br>Sustained only on hearsay |
|     |   |   |

| 109 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
|-----|--|---|
| 110 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 111 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 112 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 113 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 115 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 118 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 119 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 120 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 127 | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 129 | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 134 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 135 | FRE 106 - Incomplete document, need attachments  | Overruled   |
| 136 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 137 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 139 | Object to use of document not produced until pretrial exchanges; Authentication; errors in transcription | Sustained, if plaintiffs cannot show a substantial justification or that it is harmless |
| 140 | Object to use of document not produced until pretrial exchanges; Authentication; errors in transcription | Withdrawn July 27, 2023   |
| 141 | Relevance; FRE 403   | Overruled   |
| 144 | Hearsay  | Overruled   |
| 146 | Hearsay, relevance   | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 150 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 151 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 152 | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 153 | Relevance  | Overruled   |
| 154 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |

| 157 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
|-----|---|---|
| 158 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 162 | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 168 | Relevance, Foundation, Authentication, Not provided prior to exhibit list exchange, hearsay, attempt to provide legal opinion as evidence | Sustained on hearsay  Sustained on timeliness, if plaintiffs cannot show a substantial justification or that it is harmless |
| 190 | FRE 106 incomplete document, complete Excel spreadsheet should be submitted   | Overruled   |
| 206 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 210 | FRE 106 - Incomplete document; DX 264 is complete native version  | Overruled   |
| 220 | FRE 106 Incomplete document, lacks attachments through DEFS00027972   | Withdrawn July 28, 2023   |
| 273 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 278 | Pages Holmes 323-24, 344, 346 contain<br>hearsay and previously undisclosed expert<br>analysis  | Sustained   |
| 279 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 280 | Relevance, Hearsay; FRE 403   | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 286 | Relevance, authentication   | Overruled   |
| 294 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 300 | Relevance, hearsay  | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 301 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 302 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 305 | Relevance, hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 308 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 310 | Relevance, Hearsay; FRE 403   | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 311 | Hearsay   | Sustained   |
| 313 | Relevance, Hearsay; FRE 403   | Sustained only on hearsay   |
| 315 | Authentication; foundation (No bates label, witness did not recall it); relevance   | Authentication objection withdrawn August 3, 2023   |

|     | **  | Overruled                                    |
|-----|---|--|
| 319 | Hearsay   | Sustained                                    |
| 320 | Hearsay   | Sustained                                    |
| 321 | Hearsay, inadmissible under FRE/FRCP 33, Not current version (4-21-2023)    | Overruled, if plaintiffs use current version |
| 323 | Hearsay, inadmissible under FRE/FRCP 33,<br>Not current version (2-27-2023) | Sustained                                    |
| 327 | Object to designation as an exhibit; witness testimony                      | Sustained                                    |
| 328 | Hearsay, authentication   | Sustained                                    |
| 329 | Hearsay   | Sustained                                    |
| 335 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                  | Overruled                                    |
| 337 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                  | Overruled                                    |
| 340 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 341 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 342 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                  | Overruled                                    |
| 343 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 344 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802;<br>Reliability/FRE 703                           | Overruled                                    |
| 345 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 346 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 347 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 348 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 349 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 350 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 351 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 352 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled                                    |
| 353 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, object to format as not viewable as exhibit      | Overruled                                    |
| 354 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, object to format as not viewable as exhibit      | Overruled                                    |

| 355 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, object to format as not viewable as exhibit | Overruled               |
|-----|--|-------------------------|
| 356 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802             | Overruled               |
| 357 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Withdrawn July 28, 2023 |
| 358 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Withdrawn July 28, 2023 |
| 359 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 360 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 361 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 362 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 363 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 364 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Withdrawn July 28, 2023 |
| 365 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Withdrawn July 28, 2023 |
| 366 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 367 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 368 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 369 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 370 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 371 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 372 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 373 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 374 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 375 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 376 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 377 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 378 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 379 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 380 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled               |
| 381 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703  | Overruled               |

|     | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                                  |  |
|-----|--|--|
| 382 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802 | Hearsay objections<br>withdrawn July 28, 2023;<br>helpfulness objection<br>overruled |
| 383 | Hearsay  | Overruled  |
| 384 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802 | Overruled  |
| 385 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802 | Overruled  |
| 386 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802 | Overruled  |
| 387 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Withdrawn July 28, 2023  |
| 388 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 389 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 390 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 391 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 392 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 393 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 394 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 395 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 396 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 397 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 398 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 399 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 400 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 401 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 402 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 403 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 404 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802                                  | Overruled  |
| 406 | Hearsay, authentication                                    | Sustained  |

| 409 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, object to format as not viewable as exhibit | Overruled                 |
|-----|--|---------------------------|
| 410 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, object to format as not viewable as exhibit | Overruled                 |
| 411 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, object to format as not viewable as exhibit | Overruled                 |
| 412 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802             | Overruled                 |
| 413 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |
| 414 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802             | Overruled                 |
| 415 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |
| 416 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |
| 417 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |
| 418 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |
| 419 | Objection Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, not useable as exhibit            | Overruled                 |
| 420 | Objection Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, not useable as exhibit            | Overruled                 |
| 421 | Objection Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, not useable as exhibit            | Overruled                 |
| 422 | Objection Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, not useable as exhibit            | Overruled                 |
| 423 | Incomplete document; authentication                                    | Withdrawn August 3, 2023  |
| 425 | Relevance, Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                                   | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 427 | Hearsay  | Sustained                 |
| 429 | Hearsay, inadmissible under FRE/FRCP 33                                | Sustained only on hearsay |
| 432 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Sustained                 |
| 438 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802             | Overruled                 |
| 439 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802;<br>Reliability/FRE 703                      | Overruled                 |
| 440 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |
| 441 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |
| 442 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |
| 443 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled                 |

| 444 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Withdrawn July 28, 2023                           |
|-----|---|---|
| 445 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 446 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 447 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 451 | Hearsay   | Overruled   |
| 452 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 453 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 454 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                    | Overruled   |
| 455 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                    | Overruled   |
| 459 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 460 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 461 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 462 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 463 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 464 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 465 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                    | Overruled   |
| 468 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 469 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802, format not viewable as exhibit                     | Overruled   |
| 472 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802; relevance; foundation; authentication; reliability | Overruled   |
| 475 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802; relevance; foundation; authentication; reliability | Authentication objection withdrawn August 3, 2023 |
| 476 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703   | Overruled Overruled                               |
|     | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802   |   |
| 477 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 478 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802                    | Overruled   |
| 479 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |

| 480 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled   |
|-----|--|---|
| 485 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 486 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 487 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 488 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled   |
| 489 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled   |
| 490 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled   |
| 491 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled   |
| 492 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802; foundation;<br>Witness not on Disclosures, not on<br>Plaintiffs' witness list, not designated as an<br>expert, analysis not provided in discovery,<br>not deposed | Sustained on hearsay  Sustained on timeliness, if plaintiffs cannot show a substantial justification or that it is harmless |
| 493 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802; Witness not on Disclosures, not designated as an expert, not on Plaintiffs' witness list; analysis not provided in discovery, not deposed                         | Sustained on hearsay  Sustained on timeliness, if plaintiffs cannot show a substantial justification or that it is harmless |
| 494 | Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802; Witness not on<br>Disclosures, not designated as an expert, not<br>on Plaintiffs' witness list; analysis not<br>provided in discovery, not deposed                | Sustained on hearsay  Sustained on timeliness, if plaintiffs cannot show a substantial justification or that it is harmless |
| 495 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 496 | Hearsay  | Overruled   |
| 498 | Hearsay  | Sustained   |
| 499 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Sustained   |
| 500 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802  | Sustained   |
| 501 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 503 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |

| 504 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
|-----|---|---|
| 505 | Helpfulness - FRE 702 and 703<br>Hearsay - FRE 801 and 802  | Overruled   |
| 507 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Withdrawn July 28, 2023                           |
| 508 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 509 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 510 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 511 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 512 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 513 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 514 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Overruled   |
| 515 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 516 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 519 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 524 | Object to description not matching bates<br>number, should be DEFS00036199<br>(identified bates is a spreadsheet) | Overruled   |
| 525 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 528 | Hearsay – FRE 801 and 802   | Sustained   |
| 531 | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 532 | Relevance   | Overruled   |
| 539 | FRE 401, 403  | Overruled   |
| 540 | FRE 401, 403  | Overruled   |
| 563 | FRE 401   | Overruled   |
| 564 | FRE 401   | Overruled   |
| 565 | FRE 802   | Sustained   |
| 566 | FRE 802   | Sustained   |
| 567 | FRE 802   | Sustained   |
| 568 | FRE 802; Not Timely Produced; authentication  | Authentication objection withdrawn August 3, 2023 |

|     |                         | Sustained   |
|-----|-------------------------|---|
| 569 | FRE 802                 | Sustained   |
| 571 | FRE 802                 | Sustained   |
| 572 | FRE 802, authentication | Authentication objection<br>withdrawn August 3, 2023<br>Sustained |
| 573 | FRE 802, authentication | Authentication objection withdrawn August 3, 2023 Sustained       |
| 575 | Not Timely Produced     | Withdrawn July 27, 2023   |
| 578 | FRE 802                 | Sustained   |
| 580 | FRE 802                 | Sustained   |
| 596 | FRE 802                 | Overruled   |
| 597 | FRE 802                 | Overruled   |
| 598 | FRE 802                 | Overruled   |
| 599 | FRE 802                 | Overruled   |
| 600 | FRE 802                 | Overruled   |
| 601 | FRE 802                 | Overruled   |
| 602 | FRE 802                 | Overruled   |
| 603 | FRE 802                 | Overruled   |