IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA SOUTHERN DIVISION

BOBBY SINGLETON, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WES ALLEN, in his official capacity as Alabama Secretary of State,

Defendant.

EVAN MILLIGAN, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WES ALLEN, in his official capacity as Alabama Secretary of State,

Defendant.

MARCUS CASTER, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WES ALLEN, in his official capacity as Alabama Secretary of State,

Defendant.

Case No. 2:21-cv-01291-AMM

THREE-JUDGE COURT

Case No. 2:21-cv-01530-AMM

THREE-JUDGE COURT

Case No.: 2:21-cv-1536-AMM

DEFENDANTS' AMENDED EXHIBITS LIST

Defendants respectfully amend their exhibit list to reflect that they now have the completed transcript for the July 13, 2023 proceedings before the Alabama Legislature's Permanent Committee Legislative on Reapportionment *sans* index and exhibits. A partial transcript was previously filed as Exhibit B. A number of the exhibits to this transcript have already been separately filed and are listed below (as well as on the original exhibit list). Defendants will make ten paper copies for delivery at Monday's hearings.

Exhibit/ Tab	Exhibit	Singleton	Milligan	Caster
I.	Defendants' Joint Response to Milligan and Caster Plaintiffs' Objections and Request for Preliminary Injunction		220	191
A	Transcript dated July 27, 2023 [(sic) June 27, 2023], Alabama Legislature's Permanent Legislative Committee on Reapportionment		220-1	191-1
В	Transcript dated July 13, 2023, Alabama Legislature's Permanent Committee Legislative on Reapportionment		220-2	191-2
B-2	Transcript dated July 13, 2023, Alabama Legislature's Permanent Committee Legislative on Reapportionment (complete, <i>sans</i> index and exhibits)	Filed as an exhibit to this amended exhibit list.		
С	2022 Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy: 5-Year Update 2022-2027 by the South Alabama Regional Planning Commission		220-3	191-3

Exhibit/ Tab	Exhibit	Singleton	Milligan	Caster
D	John Sharp, Redistricting Alabama: How South Alabama could be split up due to Baldwin County's growth, al.com (Sept. 20, 2021)		220-4	191-4
Е	Alabama Port Authority 2021 Economic Impact Study Report		220-5	191-5
F	Alabama State Port Authority's Annual Comprehensive Financial Report for the Fiscal Years Ended September 30, 2022 & 2021		220-6	191-6
G	BRATS Schedule for Baylinc Mobile-Fairhope		220-7	191-7
Н	Baylinc Connects Mobile-Baldwin County Public Transit Systems dated November 5, 2007		220-8	191-8
Ι	South Alabama Regional Planning Commission website information		220-9	191-9
J	Expert Report of Thomas M. Bryan dated August 3, 2023		220-10	191-10
K	Ala. Act No. 2023-563		220-11	191-11
L	Expert Report of Sean P. Trende dated August 4, 2023		220-12	191-12
M	Declaration of Lee Lawson		220-13	191-13
N	Kyle Hamrick, <i>ALDOT says new</i> bridge and Bayway are financially viable, Lagniappe Mobile (Dec. 5, 2022)		220-14	191-14
О	USA: A Brief History, University of South Alabama		220-15	191-15
P	About Us, Lagniappe Mobile		220-16	191-16
Q	Declaration of Mike Schmitz		220-17	191-17
R	Declaration of Brad Kimbro		220-18	191-18
II.	Defendants' Response to Singleton Plaintiffs' Motion for Motion for Preliminary Injunction	162		

Exhibit/ Tab	Exhibit	Singleton	Milligan	Caster
III.	Defendants' Notice of Filing Exhibits	167	227	197
S	Declaration of Jeffrey V. Williams	167-1	227-1	197-1
Т	Defendant Secretary of State Wes Allen's Objections and Responses to <i>Singleton</i> Plaintiffs' First Set of Requests for Admission	167-2	227-2	197-2
U	Exhibit M.1 at the July 13, 2023 proceedings before the Alabama Legislature's Permanent Legislative Committee on Reapportionment, namely the deposition testimony of Congressman Bradley Bryne in <i>Chestnut v. Merrill</i> , Case No. 2:18-cv-00907-KOB (N.D. Ala.), dated July 24, 2019, <i>sans</i> Exhibits 1 through 4 thereto and with highlighting having been added	167-3	227-3	197-3
V	Exhibit N at the July 13, 2023 proceedings before the Alabama Legislature's Permanent Legislative Committee on Reapportionment, namely the testimony of Congressman Bradley Bryne in the January 2022 preliminary injunction proceedings in these cases, with highlighting having been added, saved 4-up to mimic travel transcript format	167-4	227-4	197-4

Exhibit/ Tab	Exhibit	Singleton	Milligan	Caster
W	Exhibit O at the July 13, 2023 proceedings before the Alabama Legislature's Permanent Legislative Committee on Reapportionment, namely the deposition testimony of Congressman Jo Bonner in <i>Chestnut v. Merrill</i> , Case No. 2:18-cv-00907-KOB (N.D. Ala.), dated July 30, 2019, <i>sans</i> Exhibit 9 thereto and with highlighting having been added	167-5	227-5	197-5
IV.	Additional Exhibits			
X	Expert Report of Kosuke Imai, Ph.D. dated December 10, 2021		68-4	
Y	Rebuttal Expert Report of Kosuke Imai, Ph.D. dated December 20, 2021		76-3	
Z	Exhibit 7 to <i>Singleton</i> Plaintiffs' Renewed Motion for a Preliminary Injunction and Memorandum of Law in Support	57-7		
V.	Defendants' Second Notice of Filing Exhibits	168	231	199
C-2	2022 Comprehensive Economic Development Strategy: 5-Year Update 2022-2027 by the South Alabama Regional Planning Commission as submitted to the Alabama Legislature's Permanent Legislative Committee on Reapportionment	168-1	231-1	199-1
F-2	Alabama State Port Authority's Annual Comprehensive Financial Report for the Fiscal Years Ended September 30, 2022 & 2021 as submitted to the Alabama Legislature's Permanent Legislative Committee on Reapportionment	168-2	231-2	199-2

Respectfully Submitted,

Steve Marshall Attorney General

/s/ Edmund G. LaCour Jr.
Edmund G. LaCour Jr. (ASB-9182-U81L)

Solicitor General

James W. Davis (ASB-4063-I58J) Deputy Attorney General

Misty S. Fairbanks Messick (ASB-1813-T71F) Brenton M. Smith (ASB-1656-X27Q) Benjamin M. Seiss (ASB-2110-O00W) Charles A. McKay (ASB-7256-K18K) Assistant Attorneys General

OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL STATE OF ALABAMA 501 Washington Avenue P.O. Box 300152 Montgomery, Alabama 36130-0152 Telephone: (334) 242-7300 Edmund.LaCour@AlabamaAG.gov Jim.Davis@AlabamaAG.gov Misty.Messick@AlabamaAG.gov Brenton.Smith@AlabamaAG.gov Ben.Seiss@AlabamaAG.gov Charles.McKay@AlabamaAG.gov

Counsel for Secretary Allen

s/ Dorman Walker (with permission)
Dorman Walker (ASB-9154-R81J)
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP
Post Office Box 78 (36101)
105 Tallapoosa Street, Suite 200

Montgomery, AL 36104 Telephone: (334) 269-3138

Email: dwalker@balch.com

Counsel for Sen. Livingston and Rep. Pringle

Case 2:21-cv-01530-AMM Document 259-1 Filed 08/12/23 Page 1 of 157

2023 Aug-12 PM 07:59 U.S. DISTRICT COURT N.D. OF ALABAMA

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	ALABAMA PERMANENT COMMITTEE ON REAPPORTIONMENT
6	AND REDISTRICTING PUBLIC HEARING
7	
8	HELD ON
9	THURSDAY, JULY 13TH, 2023
10	
11	
12	LOCATION:
13	ALABAMA STATE HOUSE
14	11 SOUTH UNION STREET
15	MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA 36104
16	AND
17	ONLINE VIA ZOOM
18	
19	
20	TRANSCRIBED REMOTELY BY:
21	ANNA RUFFIN, CCR
22	COURT REPORTER
23	
24	
25	

SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Here.

SENATOR WILLIAMS: Here.

THE CLERK: Senator Williams?

23

24

```
1
     approve the meetings from the last meeting, which are
 2
     in your packets.
 3
                    SENATOR ORR: Mr. President?
     Mr. Chairman?
 4
 5
                   COCHAIRMAN LIVINGSTON: Senator Orr.
 6
                    SENATOR ORR: I move we approve the
7
     minutes from the previous meeting.
8
                    COCHAIRMAN LIVINGSTON: There's a
 9
     motion from Senator Orr. Is there a second.
10
                    SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Second. Second.
11
                    COCHAIRMAN LIVINGSTON: Mr. Smitherman
12
     seconded.
13
                   All in favor of approving the minutes
14
     say Aye.
15
                    (A collective Aye was heard throughout
16
                    the room.)
17
                    COCHAIRMAN LIVINGSTON: Like signed
18
     Aye and minutes are approved.
19
                   Mr. Pringle?
20
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: May the question
21
     now before the Bodies' adoption of the guidelines, do
22
     we have a motion? Do we have a motion for moving
23
     adoption.
24
                   REPRESENTATIVE HALL: Mr. Chair?
```

COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Ms. Hall, do you

- 1 second it.
- 2 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: Yes. And I
- 3 would like to speak when you finish.
- 4 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I second,
- 5 Mr. Chairman.
- 6 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: We have a motion
- 7 and we have a second --
- 8 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Role call voting
- 9 at the present time, Mr. Chairman, whenever --
- 10 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: If the clerk will
- 11 call the roll.
- 12 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: Mr. Chair,
- that's why I was asking. We have a proposed
- 14 amendment to the guideline plan, so when you plan to
- 15 consider those --
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: If Mr. England's
- 17 here, do you have an amendment.
- 18 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: Yeah, I have the
- 19 amendment. It should be in everybody's folder.
- 20 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Would you like to
- 21 present the amendment, Ms. Hall.
- 22 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: I'll be happy
- 23 too.
- 24 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you.
- 25 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: The amendment

```
1
     that you have is -- is -- for each one of the members
 2
     that is in the folders. And these -- just for
 3
     clarification for those that did not have a copy of
 4
     that.
 5
                    "Because the U.S. District Court in
 6
     Milligan v. Allen has ordered the State to enact a
7
     new congressional map that remedies the violations of
 8
     Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act, the
 9
     Reapportionment Committee shall prioritize all plans
10
     that follow the U.S. District Court's guidance.
     Accordingly, all proposals shall include at least two
11
12
     of seven congressional districts in which members of
13
     the plaintiff class identified in Milligan have an
14
     equal opportunity to elect candidates of choice.
15
     assessing compliance with the Court order, this
16
     committee shall consider the court's fact findings on
17
     communities of interest, racially polarized voting,
     and other factors that inform its conclusion that the
18
19
     congressional current map with a single
     majority-black district illegally dilutes black
20
21
     voting strength.
22
                    The committee shall also obtain an
23
     written report by an independent expert (a generally
24
     recognized authority on the Voting Rights Act) that
```

analyzes any plan submitted to a committee vote.

```
1
     Such report should specifically deliver an opinion
 2
     and supporting analysis as to whether and how the
 3
     proposed plan satisfies the U.S. District Court's
 4
     directives in Milligan. All reports should become
 5
     part of the record for legislative consideration and
 6
     shared with the public."
7
                    This is the amendment I move that we
8
     adopt at this time.
 9
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Ladies and
     gentlemen of the committee, the proposed amendment
10
     would embedded -- embedded in the guidelines
11
12
     arguments by counsel for the Milligan and Caster
     plans about the US Supreme Court's recent decision in
13
14
     Allen versus Milligan. And for that reason alone, it
15
     should be rejected. Guidelines are no place for a
16
     party's legal arguments.
17
                    Moreover, the proposed amendment is
18
     unnecessary and is not good practice. The first
19
     paragraph was a proposed amendment that will require
20
     the committee to comply with Section Two the Voting
21
     Rights Act. The guidelines already require the
22
     committee to comply with the Voting Rights Act, as
23
     well as the US Constitution, which the proposed
     amendment does not mention, to comply under Section
24
```

Two of the Voting Rights Act and what the US

1 Constitution necessarily means complying with court 2 decisions that interpret those provisions. The committee cannot feasibly amend 3 the guidelines every time a court interprets these 4 5 provisions, and it would be unwise to start picking 6 and choosing among court decisions to include some of them and guidelines and leave others out. 7 The proposed amendment is also subject 8 9 to different interpretations. The first paragraph 10 mentions congressional districts in which members of the plaintiffs class identified and, Milligan have an 11 12 equal opportunity to elect candidates of their choice. But even among plaintiff suing the State, 13 14 the meaning of an equal opportunity to elect candidates of choice is in dispute. 15 16 And Milligan plans apparently argued 17 this means districts with over 50% black voting age population, but the single complainers have advocated 18 19 remedial districts would be the APs and low to mid 40s, which incidentally, the Milligan plan is 20 21 repeatedly endorsed until just recently. 22 We should not include the guidelines 23 language that is at best unclear and at worst incorporates an unproven argument of one set of 24

plaintiffs. The proposed amendment would require the

```
1
     committee to consider the courts fact finding of
 2
     communities of interest. Whatever the trial court
     found about the Gulf Coast, being a community of
 3
     interest, was a preliminary finding based on limited
 4
 5
     record compiled in an expedited hearing.
                                               It's not a
     final judicial determination and does not preempt the
 6
     committee's ability and responsibility under the
 7
 8
     quidelines to identify and respect communities of
 9
     interest, including the Gulf Coast and the black belt
     when it trolls to those remedial districts.
10
                    One purpose of the hearing, the
11
12
     committee is considering is to receive public comment
     and communities of interest, and we should be open to
13
     that evidence and not instead default to the
14
     arguments of the Milligan, plaintiff's lawyers.
15
16
     second paragraph that the proposed amendment would
17
     require the committee to receive and review a report
     by an independent expert upon whether the proposed
18
19
     plan complies with the trial court's directives and
20
     Milligan, which directives this language refers to is
     unclear or whatever directives are intended or
21
     preliminary finding the conclusion of love, made in a
22
23
     hurry record.
24
                    They do not reflect what the court
25
     will say after it has had the opportunity to review a
```

```
1
     complete record. Moreover, no such report has been
 2
     submitted by Milligan and Caster plaintiffs and
 3
     supported their VRA plaintiffs' remedial plan that
     was presented and discussed in the last hearing.
 4
 5
                    That said, I anticipate that when the
 6
     House of Senate leadership submits a plan for the
     Committee's review will be supported by one more --
7
8
     one of more functionality reports. In short, the
 9
     proposed amendment is not needed and would
     incorporate into our guidelines, the arguments of the
10
     Milligan plaintiffs lawyers, and for these reasons,
11
12
     the motion to amend the guidelines should be denied.
                   REPRESENTATIVE FIGURES: Mr. Chairman?
13
14
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes.
15
                    SENATOR FIGURES: In light of the fact
16
     that Representative Hall's, amendment did not get a
17
     second, let it go on the record showing --
18
                    UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I will --
                    SENATOR FIGURES: You would --
19
20
                    UNIDENTIFIED MALE: No, I will.
21
                    SENATOR FIGURES: No. I was just
22
     going to let the record show that I second it.
```

25 SENATOR FIGURES: Also, Mr. Chairman,

COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE:

Thank you,

23

24

Senator Figures.

```
1
     can we get a copy of the statement you just read?
 2
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: It's in the
 3
     record, and I'll be glad to share it with you.
 4
                    SENATOR FIGURES: Thank you.
 5
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE:
                                         Senator
 6
     Smitherman.
7
                    SENATOR SMITHERMAN: To listen to
8
     report that the co-chair gave, I think that I feel
 9
     duly noted, based on my opinion and my own
10
     interpretation to make a few corrections. One is
     that in this -- in this proposed amendment, if you
11
12
     look at this from the middle part on down, it says,
     "In asserting compliance with the Court's order.
13
14
     This committee shall consider the Court's fact
     findings on community interest, racially polarized
15
16
     voting, and other factors that inform its conclusion
17
     that the congressional current map with a single
18
     majority black district, it legally dilutes black
19
     voting strength."
20
                    I think that's, I think that's why
21
     we're here in the first place. I think that's how we
     got here by the courts, saying this is what -- the
22
23
     map wasn't right. So I think that it makes only
     common sense to follow directives from the Court.
24
```

The second thing I want to say is

- 1 this: As I heard the response, I kind of heard
- 2 something like this and I'll stand corrected. But it
- 3 said that -- when we were talking -- you were talking
- 4 about the taking the directions that -- that this
- 5 amendment was trying to take us. It was something to
- 6 the effect that this would be carrying furthering the
- 7 ruling of the Court, it was something of that nature.
- 8 I want to set the record straight. This is a
- 9 two-part situation. This is not a continuation from
- 10 the first ruling on the merits that the Court did on
- 11 the initial complaint.
- 12 There is two phases to this. The
- 13 first phase is them ruling what they're ruling. This
- 14 phase -- and if you look in the orders, when he
- 15 talked to orders at the -- when he talked about that
- 16 they were going to use strict scrutiny in the
- 17 principles of coming up with the remedy. The end of
- 18 phase two is that the remedy now has to meet what the
- 19 Court says and has to meet the procedural --
- 20 substantive procedures that is -- that is used by
- 21 those have to meet those standards that they have.
- 22 So it would make to me only common sense to take that
- 23 part right there because the Court has said, that's
- 24 the flaw. And we got to go from here to try to
- 25 correct this and would you present us back if there's

- 1 going to be acceptable? So I want to make that very
- 2 clear to everybody in here that this is not one
- 3 carryover from the ruling. There's two parts to it.
- 4 Now we in the remedy phase, and the remedy phase is
- 5 totally independent, as it relates to the ruling that
- 6 we have to come up with another remedy. Thank you,
- 7 Mr. Chairman.
- 8 SENATOR ORR: Mr. Chairman?
- 9 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Mr. Orr.
- 10 SENATOR ORR: In light of Chairman
- 11 Pringle's comments, I would move to table the
- 12 amendment.
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: There's a motion
- 14 to table. Is there a second.
- 15 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Second.
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Second by Senator
- 17 --
- 18 (Cross-talk.)
- 19 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Roll-call vote.
- THE CLERK: Senator Barfoot.
- 21 SENATOR BARFOOT: Aye.
- THE CLERK: Senator Bell?
- SENATOR BELL: Aye.
- 24 THE CLERK: Senator Chesteen?
- SENATOR CHESTEEN: Aye.

1	THE CLERK: Senator Figures?
2	SENATOR FIGURES: No.
3	THE CLERK? Senator Livingston?
4	(No response.)
5	THE CLERK: Senator Orr?
6	SENATOR ORR: Aye.
7	THE CLERK: Senator Roberts?
8	(No response.)
9	THE CLERK: Senator Scofield?
LO	(No response.)
11	THE CLERK: Senator Singleton?
12	SENATOR SINGLETON: No. No, no, no
13	THE CLERK: Senator Smitherman?
L 4	SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Aye.
15	THE CLERK: Senator Williams?
16	SENATOR WILLIAMS: Aye.
17	THE CLERK: Representative Almond?
18	(No response.)
19	THE CLERK: Representative Boyd?
20	(No response.)
21	THE CLERK: Representative Carns.
22	REPRESENTATIVE CARNS: Aye.
23	THE CLERK: Representative Clouse?
24	(No response.)
>5	THE CLERK: Representative Ellis?

1 REPRESENTATIVE ELLIS: Aye. 2 THE CLERK: Representative England? 3 (No response.) 4 THE CLERK: Representative Hall? 5 (No response.) 6 THE CLERK: Representative Jones? 7 REPRESENTATIVE JONES: No. 8 THE CLERK: Representative Lovvorn? 9 REPRESENTATIVE LOVVORN: Aye. 10 THE CLERK: Representative Reynolds? 11 (No response.) 12 THE CLERK: I have Aye as 13 and No to 13 6. 14 COCHAIRMAN LIVINGSTON: The guidelines 15 have been adopted in a 13-6 vote. Chairman Pringle? 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Ladies and 17 gentlemen, we're going to now move to a discussion of 18 a couple of things. We're gonna talk about some of 19 the plans that are pending before the committee. But I'd like to get started. If you would like to speak, 20 in general terms, about different issues, communities 21 22 of interest or historical sights, not specifically on 23 a plan, there's a signup sheet. There's a sign up 24 sheet right over here. 25 If you'll come sign up, we'll

- 1 recognize you. This is for people here to talk about
- 2 general communities of interest. Then we're going to
- 3 have you -- if you want to talk about a specific
- 4 plan, there's a sign up sheet for each specific plan,
- 5 and we'll be glad to call you up and let you talk
- 6 about each plan.
- 7 And you can sign up for multiple --
- 8 multiple plans. It doesn't bother me. But we just
- 9 want to make sure when we call you, you're going to
- 10 talk about the plan that we have before us.
- 11 SENATOR FIGURES: Mr. Chair?
- 12 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes, Senator
- 13 Figures?
- 14 SENATOR FIGURES: I understand that
- 15 plans -- were the -- the deadline for plan
- submittal was July 7, how many plans have been
- 17 submitted? And how will we know which plan --
- 18 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: We're actively
- 19 processing plans as fast as possible, but there was
- 20 an overwhelming number sent into the committee. From
- 21 all over, from France, from New Zealand and all over
- 22 out of state. Right now, we're trying to consolidate
- 23 and get our plans from Alabama residents to you as
- 24 fast as possible. We're just -- to be frank, we're
- just overwhelmed. We are working as diligently as

- 1 possible to do --
- 2 SENATOR FIGURES: How do we have a
- 3 public hearing on the plans that were submitted, if
- 4 we don't have the plans before us?
- 5 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I got some plans
- 6 that have been submitted that are run through our
- 7 computers. And we can put numbers on the screen for
- 8 you. We just haven't got to all of them. I'm doing
- 9 the best I can, Senator in a very, very, very
- 10 time-compressed --
- 11 SENATOR FIGURES: I'm not complaining.
- 12 I'm just saying it makes sense if we're having a
- 13 public hearing about plans submitted, we need the
- 14 plans.
- 15 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yeah. We've got
- 16 numerous plans we're gonna put up before --
- 17 Will -- will they be bringing us copies of the plan
- 18 -- we'll turn everything over to you as fast as we
- 19 can get it.
- 20 One of the problems is, some of the
- 21 plans are not compatible with Maptitude. So we have
- 22 to get the plans we have to get them in loaded in our
- 23 computer into Maptitude. And then process them so we
- 24 can run them.
- 25 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Mr. Chairman?

```
1
                   COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Mr. Smitherman?
 2
                   MR. SMITHERMAN: Mr. Chairman, I don't
 3
     mind yielding -- outspoken -- I like to be recognized
 4
     after that.
 5
                    SENATOR ENGLAND: Yes, Mr. Chairman,
 6
     as a member of this permanent legislative committee,
     and as part of the minority of this committee, we
7
     have not been privy to any maps drawn by this
8
 9
     committee itself. And we're talking about going into
10
     session on next week. I wrote a letter titled to
     Chairman Livingston, yourself, and Attorney Dorman
11
12
     Walker, asking for any maps or other functionality
     reports that can that this committee already has
13
14
     drawn, and we have not received anything.
15
                    Could you please respond to that in
16
     terms of maps, that this committee and where we are,
17
     and while we as the minority has not been a part of
     that process?
18
19
                    SENATOR FIGURES: That's drawn by the
     majority -- not by this committee that you're
20
21
     referring to.
22
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: And, Senator, as
23
     I told you, we just adopted guidelines a few minutes
24
     ago. I don't know how I can present plans to a
```

committee when I haven't guidelines to guide me

```
1 drawn.
```

- 2 REPRESENTATIVE ENGLAND: Why don't we
- 3 sit down together and draw our map?
- 4 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: We are working on
- 5 that as fast as we can. I've got nothing to hide,
- 6 Senator, and I'm ready to get started on that plan.
- 7 REPRESENTATIVE ENGLAND: Will I be
- 8 involved with that plan?
- 9 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes.
- 10 (Cross-talk.)
- 11 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I understand and
- 12 we're working as diligently as possible. We have --
- 13 committee staff has been completely overwhelmed. We
- 14 are working as diligently as possible to produce all
- 15 of the information.
- 16 REPRESENTATIVE ENGLAND: I'm not a
- 17 part of that "we" though.
- 18 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes, Senator
- 19 Smitherman?
- 20 MR. SMITHERMAN: Mr. Chairman, I --
- 21 you know I wrote a letter requesting the same
- 22 information, and I like that to be, you know, kind of
- 23 spread over out minutes. It's a letter. At some
- 24 point in time, I'm going to hand it back to -- it's
- 25 evident that I actually sent in a letter requesting

- that. But my statement is to give more to the fact
 we have already functionality reports.
- 3
 I'm not -- I'm not putting them out
- 4 map -- the map that we're talking about that we're
- 5 gonna try to put together as a group. I'm saying on
- 6 all these other maps, not all of them, but we have
- 7 many of these other maps, we have functionality
- 8 reports. And I mean, I'm not saying that's anybody's
- 9 keeping me from it. But anything that's spread in
- 10 that office, in this committee, to be a member you
- 11 should have -- all of us should have access to. So I
- 12 think it's very important and critical, that whatever
- 13 we do have now, if that that'd be presented an
- opportunity for every member on this committee to be
- able to get it. So as we go through this meeting,
- 16 and as we get ready to go through the next --
- 17 whatever next step it is, we will have a chance to
- 18 review some of that information and be able to
- 19 discuss it as we go through this process here.
- 20 That's why I had asked about the
- 21 meeting a little bit before the meeting up until
- 22 today. So if it can be produced, I still would like
- 23 to get it. And I don't mind looking at it as we go
- 24 through this process. But I need whatever we have.
- 25 Thank you.

```
1
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: And I understand
 2
     we are processing the maps. We've processed the
 3
     remedial maps we have been reviewing and running the
 4
     analysis on it. As fast as we can possibly do it.
 5
     We've processed the DRA plans for remedial map, which
 6
     we'll have today. We've processed the CLC Map 1. We
7
     processed a Singleton Congressional Map Plan 3, and
8
     we processed the Hatcher Remedial Congressional Plan
9
     1.
10
                    We had been reviewing the maps,
     putting them into computer and running the analysis
11
12
     on them, as fast as we can possibly do. We just got
13
     completely overwhelmed with the number of maps sent
14
     in. And so we picked y'all's maps first, and we ran
15
     those in length. We picked Senator Singleton's maps
16
     and the plaintiffs' maps. We've picked the maps that
17
     come in from Senator Singleton. That -- that -- the
18
     Singleton Congressional Plan Number three is -- does
     not -- is that your map?
19
20
                    SENATOR SMITHERMAN: No, I'm the
21
     sponsor of that one.
22
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Oh, you're the
23
     sponsor for the Singleton Map? I'm sorry, Senator
24
     Smitherman.
```

But anyway, again, we are -- we are

- 1 processing it as fast as possible. And we're going
- 2 to get you the information as soon as we can. We
- 3 just have a horribly compressed timeframe, yet again
- 4 in this committee. I wish we could go back to the
- 5 days when we had a year to do this, but we've never
- 6 been given that length of time to -- to draw these
- 7 maps has always been very late.
- 8 SENATOR FIGURES: We didn't have an
- 9 opportunity for a long time before.
- 10 SENATOR PRINGLE: Yes, Representative
- 11 England?
- 12 REPRESENTATIVE ENGLAND: Thank you for
- 13 the recognition. There's something interesting that
- 14 you said it kind of struck me, and please forgive me
- 15 him, no disrespect about this at all. But I wasn't
- 16 aware that this was like a y'all process. And I
- 17 thought that we had a court order where we were
- 18 trying to build a map that we were all supposed to be
- 19 working on to a certain degree.
- 20 And also since we have a public
- 21 hearing today, it's not since just a y'all situation
- 22 for us to present maps but everybody to present maps
- 23 so we can actually get a better idea of what, you
- 24 know, I guess for lack of a better term "public
- 25 communities of interest" are -- or what other

- 1 perception you have of the court order so we can
- 2 actually look at opposing maps and have a public
- 3 hearing where everybody's here as input on not only,
- 4 I guess, y'all's maps, but everybody else's maps too.
- 5 So it kind of puts us as members of
- 6 the committee and the public at a disadvantage
- 7 because they will not have an opportunity to provide
- 8 any public input on maps that y'all present. So
- 9 again -- I echo the sentiments of Senator Singleton
- 10 and Senator Figures when, I mean, I would prefer that
- 11 this is a process where we're all kind of building a
- 12 resolution to satisfy a court order that we all got
- 13 to look at everybody's proposal when we're not just
- 14 seeing it on Monday when we -- when we arrive at the
- 15 State House for a special session and then be
- 16 expected to vote on it within five days.
- 17 So I'll yield but that's just --
- 18 that's just interesting to me.
- 19 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Mr. Chairman, I
- 20 would like to present this to the community.
- 21 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Senator
- 22 Smitherman has presented it to me, and if you don't
- 23 mind, I like to change your memorandum to read
- 24 Cochairman Livingston and Cochairman Pringle. I'm
- 25 not Vice Chairman.

```
1
                    Thank you.
 2
                    And with that, I like to recognize
 3
     Frank Schmitz, former mayor Dothan, currently serving
     as civilian aid to Secretary of the Army.
 4
 5
                    When you get to the microphone, please
 6
     speak into the microphone and state your name and
7
     where you're from there because there are people
8
     listening to us. It was very difficult last time to
 9
     people that are listening to. The clerk is in the
     back room to hear you, so speak into your microphone.
10
     And, Members, if you'll turn your mics off, I
11
12
     understand we had a problem with back feed last time.
13
     Thank you so much.
14
                    MR. SCHMITZ: Thank you so much.
     Well, good afternoon. First of all, thank you for
15
16
     this opportunity. My name is Mike Schmitz. I'm from
17
     the great City of Dothan, Alabama. I'm in the
     automobile business there for 35 years. I sell
18
     Hyundai's and Mercedes made in Alabama, by Alabama
19
20
     folks. So I'm proud of that. I also had the honor
```

of being mayor of the city and the privilege of being

mayor from 2009 to October 2017 in Dothan, and then I

stepped down from there after two terms into our

public school system became chairman of the board,

COVID hit. So it was an exciting, interesting four

21

22

23

24

- 1 years. I learned a lot. And then after I stepped
- 2 out of that, I got appointed by the Secretary of the
- 3 Army. It's a volunteer position. I represent
- 4 Alabama South. I represent Fort Novosel Army
- 5 Reserve, and anything to do with the military JROTC,
- 6 Army National Guard and report directly to the
- 7 Pentagon and to the Secretary of the Army.
- 8 I'm here as a concerned -- not a
- 9 concerned -- I am a concerned citizen, involved
- 10 citizen. As someone who's been involved with
- 11 economic development with partnerships with southeast
- 12 Alabama, I'm very protective of us. Because we stand
- 13 alone, most of us are small communities. And as we
- 14 stand alone, we can't succeed. So we have created
- partnerships that have lasted 50 and 100 years that
- 16 have helped all our communities grow, and my purpose
- 17 today is simply ask you, I don't have a map. I don't
- 18 know what maps you have. But I would love to see
- 19 those in Houston County stay in line with Montgomery
- 20 and all the communities that were involved going out
- 21 to southeast edge of Alabama.
- 22 We have many partnerships. One is
- 23 southeast Alabama gas, we're 14 municipalities from
- 24 Dothan up to Greenville -- southeast Alabama gas and
- 25 that creates profits or benefits for -- for each

- 1 community and helps them grow. The 14 mayors sit
- 2 down every month, and we work together and see how we
- 3 can help each other because we don't have anyone
- 4 else. And so we work together. We have prospered.
- 5 We are booming, and I hate to see that change. We
- 6 other -- we also have an education Troy, Troy
- 7 University and Troy Dothan, the medical school we
- 8 have in Dothan in economic development. We, as City
- 9 of Dothan, go out -- not out of our way, but we try
- 10 to partner with all these smaller communities and
- 11 help them create jobs because we know floats all
- 12 boats, right?
- We know it helps Geneva, helps us what
- 14 helps Enterprise helps us or Greenville, so we worked
- 15 really, really hard together to do that. We also
- 16 have -- the biggest purpose I have today for this is
- 17 we -- the world is changing and with Fort Novosel --
- 18 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: One minute.
- 19 MR. SCHMITZ: Okay. Fort Novosel and,
- 20 and Maxwell Air Force Base. We got to be careful.
- 21 We got to protect the values. We got to stay
- 22 together to make sure they are benefited. And they
- 23 continue to grow to protect our country. And we have
- 24 incredible amount of partnership to help protect
- 25 that. We cannot lose this. We also -- if you move

- 1 us West, I believe Houston and Dothan County will
- 2 lose our voice and lose our vote. Thank you very
- 3 much. God bless you.
- 4 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you so
- 5 much.
- 6 The Chair now recognized Jeff Brandon,
- 7 CEO of Flowers Hospital in Dothan.
- 8 MR. BRANDON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- 9 My name is Jeff Brandon. I -- thank you -- I'll be
- 10 happy to do that. I am the CEO of Flowers Hospital.
- I have lived in this district all my life. I'll be
- 12 65 years old in September of this year. My dad is
- 13 93. He served in the Military, Alabama National
- 14 Guard, Civil Service, and we are very -- as Mayor
- 15 Schmitz just said. I'm here today as a concerned
- 16 citizen as someone that realizes the benefit of
- 17 collaboration, cooperation communication, all of
- 18 those things that he just referenced that are
- 19 critically important for us not to forget.
- I believe that our economy is strong
- 21 today because of the things that Mayor Schmitz just
- 22 mention. I can tell you that our health care
- 23 community is stronger than it's ever been in our
- 24 district. We have a Southeast Alabama Hospital
- 25 Council that met yesterday that goes over five

different counties that we're all focused on making 1 2 sure that everyone has access to excellent health 3 care in our community, and I don't think that we should shy away from being very proud of that. 4 5 Certainly, he mentioned the medical 6 school. My hospital alone is about to stand up internal medical permanency program. I can just say 7 8 this from a personal perspective, not just from 9 personal -- from a professional perspective, but I'm six generations living in this particular district. 10 My children have been educated in this district and 11 12 continue to live and work in this area. 13 I'm very blessed to see my seven 14 grandchildren and my two great-grandchildren on a 15 regular basis. I'm very proud of all the things that 16 they've accomplished, as well as continuing to see 17 people in our community to grow and thrive. I think 18 again -- that's our main reason for being here today, 19 again, is to talk about what's good, what's right, 20 what's worked, and we want to continue to support 21 that. We certainly be open to hear from others as 22 well, but I think that's what makes our community 23 strong is the fact that I mentioned those three C's:

Communication, collaboration, and cooperation. Want

25 to continue see that happen.

- Thank you very much for allowing me to speak and appreciate all the hard work that everyone
- 3 sitting up there does each and everyday. Very
- 4 appreciative of all of your service. Thank you.
- 5 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you so
- 6 much.
- 7 And let me -- for people that are
- 8 watching us on live stream, if you would like to
- 9 comment, send your emails to district@alsenate.gov,
- 10 district@alsenate.gov. We'll be glad to take your
- 11 comments, and we'll be glad to take your comments and
- 12 we'll read them from the podium.
- From that now, the Chair recognizes
- 14 Ronald Jackson from Birmingham, for three minutes.
- 15 MR. JACKSON: Good morning,
- 16 Legislatures and my fellow citizens of Alabama. I'm
- 17 Ronald Jackson. I'm a formal member of the Alabama
- 18 legislature. I'm hear to speak today on behalf of
- 19 citizens of better schools and sustainable
- 20 communities, and legal evaluations, and action
- 21 project. We are here to support the Blacksher the
- 22 plan -- everything is going be on the Internet. But
- 23 we're here to tell you that -- I'm from Birmingham,
- 24 Jefferson County, Alabama.
- But these plans, these proposals that

- 1 have been put out, that I have seen thus far. They
- 2 are unfair, inequitable, noncompliant with the recent
- 3 decision by the United States Supreme Court and --
- 4 for Jefferson County, which if you all will go back
- 5 to that original Singleton decision that created this
- 6 one person, one vote.
- 7 And I want everybody to understand
- 8 this, what this legislature must do when they adopt
- 9 what they're going to adopt. That -- that
- 10 preservation of one person, one vote, must be active,
- 11 that's the euphemism they use about continuity,
- 12 making sure your vote count.
- We want to say to you today, and let
- 14 you be placed on public notice, that citizens with
- better schools and sustainable communities, with
- legal evaluation and action project, we have counsel.
- 17 And we are prepared that we will respond to a special
- 18 master, and if you don't keep Jefferson County
- 19 together and not split it off anywhere to pull up
- 20 some votes that you think you need to have, just
- 21 think about what Attorney Blacksher has written to
- 22 you.
- In conclusion, Jefferson County is the
- 24 economic engine of this State. Those of you that
- 25 talk about the automobile industry, no, you really

- 1 got it. Mayor Richard Arrington, Governor Polson,
- 2 when out of Birmingham we gave you the money to get
- 3 the Mercedes plan, and you think we going to let you
- 4 split us up? You got another funk coming.
- 5 All I wanted say to you is this, we
- 6 stand on this cardinal principle, autonomous --
- 7 defendere. If you don't know what that means, I'll
- 8 tell you in Alabama language: We dare defend our
- 9 rights, and I leave you with one other Latin
- 10 expression: "Illegitimus non carborundum" because
- 11 what I see on these plans is that. Now, you look it
- 12 up. I'm not going to say what it means, because it's
- 13 a language I would not say, with children listening.
- 14 Support the Blacksher Plan. Thank you.
- 15 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you,
- 16 Mr. Jackson.
- 17 The Chair now recognizes William Bowan
- 18 from Opelika. Did I say that correctly?
- 19 MR. BOWHALL: The name is William
- 20 Bowhall of Opelika, Alabama. I'm here to talk to
- 21 this member body and the public about some overlooked
- 22 issues that this State needs to take care of.
- 23 Because I've been a citizen of this state and
- 24 resident for 25 years. And my needs have not yet
- 25 been observed or tended to by the Republicans or

- 1 Democrats. I demand representation. I have a reason
- 2 for it. I'm going to present it to you. It involves
- 3 technology, advanced aerospace applications for land,
- 4 air, sea, and space. And this will contribute to
- 5 national security in both economic and military
- 6 applications.
- 7 It's been overlooked. I went to my
- 8 representatives, starting with Riley back in '99
- 9 before he began governor. I talked to multiple
- 10 representative and attempted to talk to others, such
- 11 as Mike Rogers -- as recently as 2018 before the last
- 12 state election Whatley, Joe Lovvorn. I don't know if
- 13 that's the same person. I have never spoken to him
- in person. But I made multiple phone calls and
- 15 Whatley was the only that I caught actually in
- 16 session with aid, quote on quote.
- 17 Now, I moved down to Alabama 25 years
- 18 ago. I gave up an inheritant house that was given to
- 19 me from my grandparents raised me as a child --
- 20 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: One minute.
- MR. BOWHALL: -- all right? I gave
- 22 that up to come down to bring -- to try to establish
- jobs and bring technology to this state when you
- 24 needed it. I've been ignored ever since. My life's
- 25 been turned upside down. I've been forced into low

- 1 income, 9, \$10-hour-job, which I used to do some
- 2 research for my needs of this technology, industry
- 3 never got establish. This state needs to bring a
- 4 crap-load of money into this state to establish this
- 5 technology because it's not individual applications
- 6 that we're speaking of the way you would establish an
- 7 auto industry or an aircraft industry.
- 8 This is cross-over technology. I need
- 9 to get all phases established, so it makes it more
- 10 economically to manufacture, and the fact -- the
- 11 technology I'm about to show you, just a child --
- 12 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Your time is
- 13 expired, sir.
- MR. BOWHALL: Well, let me do this
- 15 because this is why I came here, and the public needs
- 16 to know about it because the mapping does not cover
- 17 the contingency of third party independent
- 18 representation and that's an absolute must to see
- 19 that this technology is protected, that the labor
- 20 force gets established, the future needs of
- 21 infrastructure get established to support its gross.
- This hasn't been done in this state,
- and you put millions of dollars in road work,
- 24 refurbishing in Birmingham. Now y'all see me take
- 25 this that can be manufactured over and over again.

- 1 This is just a basic application of an air foil --
- 2 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: You need to speak
- 3 into the microphone.
- 4 MR. BOWHALL: You got in manufacture
- 5 now. It has nothing you have in manufacture now that
- 6 can provide a safer needs for transportation for
- 7 land, air, sea, and space. And I can't go into
- 8 additional components that would be added to it, but
- 9 it supports it's own -- own means of flight. And
- 10 with attachable and re-attachable units, compartment
- 11 to be saved --
- 12 SENATOR FIGURES: Mr. Chair?
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Sir, your time's
- 14 expired, sir. We're here to talk about congressional
- 15 redistricting, not technology. So your time is
- 16 expired, sir. I'm sorry. I gave you three minutes
- 17 to talk about congressional redistricting, and I
- 18 yielded extra time to you. You're here talking about
- 19 technology.
- 20 MR. BOWHALL: But the redistricting
- 21 refers to the black community.
- 22 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Well, we're here
- 23 to talk about, sir --
- MR. BOWHALL: You can't --
- 25 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Sir, I'm going to

- 1 ask you to sit down, and if you don't sit down, that
- 2 gentleman will remove you.
- Now, the next one is David -- is it
- 4 L-U-S-S-E-U from Birmingham? I can't read the
- 5 handwriting. David Lusseu or -- okay. I'm sorry. I
- 6 can't read your handwriting. Thank you. Come
- 7 forward. I'm going to hold you to three minutes.
- 8 MR. LUSSEU: It won't take three
- 9 minutes. I'm David Lusseu. I was here last week,
- and my mind still hasn't wrapped around the
- 11 chairperson and vice chair. You know, when I left
- out of here last week, they told me there were two
- 13 professors up there on the -- one of them is not he
- 14 today, but one of them had a PHD from the University
- of Alabama, and we had two attorneys and one of them
- 16 attorneys was from the prestige University of
- 17 Montevallo, and then we got a former mayor over
- 18 there, was the major of the third largest city.
- Now, out of all of that qualification,
- 20 and we could not any much find to get vice chair from
- 21 that group. You know, it seem kind of obvious that,
- 22 you know, this is a two-black district and with all
- of that qualification, and we could not pull out a
- vice chair out of that community. It was kind of
- 25 hard -- until Alabama get they act together, there's

- 1 no state that can get their act together. Everything
- 2 starts here in Alabama. When we become like the
- 3 University of Alabama football team, then we will
- 4 begin to look upon a different perspective. When
- 5 Nick Saban puts his players out there, he puts his
- 6 players out to win. He doesn't put his players on
- 7 the field, saying that this player is a Republican,
- 8 this player is a Democrat, this player is black, this
- 9 player is white. He puts players on the field to win
- 10 and that's what we should start off at the beginning.
- 11 You started off in the wrong area by not selecting a
- 12 vice chair.
- 13 I'm hoping that when the legislature
- 14 go in session on the 17th, that we can formulate a
- 15 football team. We formulate a football that we going
- 16 to win for the State of Alabama. This is two-black
- 17 districts. Now, Blacksher's maps, which I was kind
- of concerned about, but it's not about me, it's
- 19 what's best for the State of Alabama. I think this
- 20 is what we need to start doing looking for the State
- 21 of Alabama. Thank you.
- 22 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you. The
- 23 Chair now recognizes former member Mike Holmes from
- 24 Wetumpka, Alabama. Welcome back, Mike.
- 25 MR. HOLMES: Thank you, sir. Well, I

- 1 see in the last couple of speakers, we've veered off
- 2 the topic quite a bit. I'm going to try to get back
- 3 toward the topic at hand, which is redistricting.
- 4 I've come up with a former -- I don't know if I call
- 5 it constituent anymore, but a former constituent of
- 6 mine, when I was serving up until November of 2022 in
- 7 the House of Representatives. My name is Mike
- 8 Holmes, served there for about nine years, enjoyed
- 9 every minute of it. I see a lot of old friends from
- 10 college. It's good to see you again.
- I want to zero in on something that --
- 12 let me get my glasses, so don't miss anything. This
- 13 constituent brought me a brief from the University of
- 14 Alabama policy -- policy center. The title of the
- 15 study is "Defining Alabama's Black Belt Region."
- "For the purposes of this issue brief
- 17 series, the University of Alabama's Education.
- 18 Policy Center used an expansive definition of the
- 19 Black Belt encompassing 24 counties. But we note
- 20 that Crenshaw, Montgomery, Pike and Russell counties
- 21 have had modest growth, which means that the
- 22 population loss, K12 enrollment decline, lower
- 23 employment, and labor force participation rates, and
- 24 other issues identified are likely more severe in the
- 25 remaining Black Belt counties especially those west

- 1 of Montgomery. Readers should keep this in mind as
- 2 they review the data presented below. All of this
- 3 speaks to the need for a uniform, agreed-upon
- 4 definition of the Black Belt, an issue discussed in
- 5 detail in this brief."
- The whole point, as I stated in the
- 7 beginning, you cannot measure what you cannot define.
- 8 You cannot measure what you cannot define.
- 9 "Every Alabamian knows the Black Belt.
- 10 They know it from their history books as the area in
- 11 south central Alabama where the cotton was and is
- 12 still grown. The Black Belt is where slaves tended
- 13 the fields, and where sharecropping replaced
- 14 plantations after Reconstruction. Everyone knows the
- 15 Black Belt from iconic novels such as Harper Lee's,
- 16 'To Kill a Mockingbird.'"
- 17 "For far too long, the Black
- 18 Belt has been known for exporting its most talented
- 19 young people. But the Black Belt has been poorly
- 20 defined. There are different definitions of which
- 21 counties constitute it for federal, state, and
- 22 local/regional programs. These include the federal
- 23 Delta Regional Authority, the State of Alabama's
- 24 Black Belt Action Commission, the University of
- 25 Alabama-led Institute for Rural Health Research, and

- 1 the University of West Alabama's Alabama Black Belt
- 2 Heritage Area. Inconsistent definitions make it
- 3 difficult to develop and sustain political coalitions
- 4 over time to positively impact policies and
- 5 programs."
- The final step in any comprehensive,
- 7 research-based approach to help lift up Alabama's
- 8 Black Belt region is to develop a consistent
- 9 definition. This is a necessary precursor to
- 10 creating actionable programming for the long-term,
- 11 and to synchronize state and federal policy. In a
- 12 press statement that accompanied his signing of the
- 13 2004 Executive Order creating the Black Belt Action
- 14 Commission, Governor Bob Riley declared:
- 'This is not another effort to study
- 16 the Black Belt. I'm not appointing the commission so
- 17 we can have another report on conditions
- 18 In the Black Belt. The Black Belt has been studied
- 19 and studied. The problems there have already been
- 20 identified.'"
- 21 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you,
- 22 Mr. Holmes.
- MR. HOLMES: Thank you.
- COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I would for you
- 25 to do me a favor please. Would you sign that and put

- 1 your name on there, and pass it to me.
- 2 I'll have it entered into the
- 3 permanent record --
- 4 MR. HOLMES: Did you get a copy?
- 5 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I got a copy. I
- 6 would like to have --
- 7 MR. HOLMES: Can I sign yours? I
- 8 think that's the last one I had. Here's one.
- 9 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I just need one
- 10 with your signature -- yeah, if you don't mind,
- 11 please, sir. Thank you. I'll put it into the
- 12 permanent record.
- 13 The Chair now recognized Kathy Jones
- 14 from Huntsville.
- 15 MS. JONES: All right. Good
- 16 afternoon. My name is Kathy Jones, and I am from
- 17 Huntsville, Alabama. I'm the president of the League
- 18 of Women Voters of Alabama. Start off by saying,
- 19 this past year the League of Alabama joined with
- 20 several other organizations who filed amicus brief in
- 21 support of the Milligan plaintiffs.
- 22 And I'm here today to express our
- 23 continued support for the plaintiffs and their
- 24 request to create two black-majority districts where
- voting age adults have a real opportunity to elect

41

```
1
     the candidates of their choice. Yesterday, I was
 2
     reading through the Supreme Court opinion, and I
 3
     found several quotes that I thought it would really
 4
     benefit everyone here, as well as the folks watching
 5
     online, if I mentioned them because they were frankly
 6
     shocking.
7
                    I felt like it's so important for us
     to realize what the Supreme Court said about what the
8
 9
     Alabama map represented. First of all, the Supreme
10
     Court held that the District Court's determination
     that the Plaintiffs demonstrated a reasonable
11
12
     likelihood of success on their claim that HP1
     violates the Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act.
13
14
                    As a matter of fact, they quoted the
     fact that the District Court said that the Section 2
15
16
     violation was "not even close." The District Court
17
     also, and this is a direct quote, "The District Court
     concluded that Plaintiffs had carried their burden of
18
19
     proof given the racial polarization of elections in
     Alabama, where 'Black Alabamians enjoy virtually zero
20
21
     success in statewide elections' and where 'Alabama's
22
     extensive history of repugnant racial and
23
     voting-related discrimination is undeniable and well
```

Alabama also -- this is another --

documented.'"

24

42

```
1
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: One minute.
 2
                    MS. JONES: All right. I'll hurry it
     up. "Alabama argues that the Gulf Coast region in
 3
     the southwest of the State is a community of
 4
 5
     interest."
 6
                    The Supreme Court says, "We do not
     find the State's argument persuasive." They also,
7
8
     that's the end of the quote, but the Supreme Court
 9
     opinion also went into a lot of detail to explain why
10
     they felt like Alabama's theory of race neutral map
     drawing was wrong and erroneous and disagreed in
11
12
     every respect.
13
                    And so the only viable option is left
14
     for the reapportionment committee is to create a
     congressional map, which complies with this --
15
16
     direction, meets all three, the Voting Rights Act,
17
     federal law, and meets all three of the Gingles
18
     preconditions, and creates two black-majority
19
     congressional districts where black voting age adults
20
     have an opportunity that long lasts to elects the
21
     candidates of their choice. Thank you.
22
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Your timing was
23
     perfect. Thank you so much.
24
                    The Chair now recognizes Camilo Fuller
```

from Bessemer. Am I saying that right? Thank you.

```
1
                   MR. FULLER: To all you guys, I really
 2
     appreciate you taking time to listen to us, and I'm
 3
     glad that you took time to listen to the public. I'm
 4
     one of the public, and my name is Camilo. That's a
 5
     Spanish name. In my life, the whole of my life,
 6
     people have stereotyped me as being something that
7
     I'm not. I have on the constitution shirt.
8
     reason I do, because we have a lot of people that
9
     have opinions.
10
                    I really like the opinions of our
     forefathers. They started with, "We the people."
11
12
     And we the people have been left out, and
     particularly me, I'm a -- in Jefferson County. And
13
14
     frankly, I vote Republican. That would probably get
     me stoned in here because I got a lot of Democrats --
15
16
     so I take persecution. In fact, I've been named
17
     everything from, if you say Republican, well, you
18
     racist. Although, I grew up black. My mom's black,
19
     and my dad's black. So now I'm experiencing all this
     other stuff that's going on.
20
21
                    So what has happened to me is I've not
22
     been represented. And I got people that go, well,
23
     you've been represented because you're in Jefferson
24
     County. No, because I've been stereotyped, and
25
     thought because I was black, I was Democrat. That
```

- 1 mean I didn't have the ability to think. If somebody
- 2 -- some thing, I'm just supposed to agree with it.
- 3 I'm sorry. I was born a soul. I'm an individual
- 4 person. And I stick to the Declaration of
- 5 Independence, that says "We hold these truths
- 6 self-evident that all men are created equal."
- 7 So I stand by that and that's why I'm
- 8 here today. I want to make sure no matter where
- 9 you're at, that you recognize that there are people
- 10 like me that -- well, I've been stereotyped. They
- 11 say, well, you're black, so you must vote this way.
- 12 This is what -- I'm determined to the vote.
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: One minute.
- MR. FULLER: Thank you.
- And I think that is wrong. I think
- that is wrong on all of our parts, whether you're
- 17 black or whenever you're white just to label
- 18 somebody. Are you Democrat? Republican? I just
- 19 happen to vote how I think. So I'm a person that
- think a particular way. Most people don't think the
- 21 way I think and that's okay. I think you got a right
- 22 to think and that's good. I'm an individual soul.
- 23 So, please, keep in mind: Do not do what you're
- doing based on stereotypes. Because most of my
- 25 neighborhood is black, most of my neighborhood is

- 1 Democrat. I'm totally left out, so I guess I'm
- 2 supposed to move or something. I don't think that's
- 3 so. I think you should not do it based on
- 4 stereotype.
- 5 Thank you very much for your time.
- 6 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you.
- 7 The Chair now recognizes Davin
- 8 Rosenberry (phonetically)? From Pennsylvania? Do I
- 9 have Davin here? Who's Davin? You are.
- MR. ROSBOROUGH: Hello.
- 11 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Okay. Because
- 12 I've got -- I recognize several of my friends
- 13 standing behind you who have all signed up to speak.
- 14 They are the Milligan plaintiffs. Is that correct?
- 15 Are you speaking on their behalf, or do they want to
- 16 speak?
- 17 MR. ROSBOROUGH: No. They are going
- 18 to speak on their own behalf. Actually, I like to
- 19 turn my time over to them, if that's all right.
- 20 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Three minutes for
- 21 all of them or three minutes each?
- MR. ROSBOROUGH: Three minutes each, I
- 23 think. Thank you.
- COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Who's the first?
- 25 MR. SIMELTON: Good afternoon,

- 1 everyone.
- 2 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: And you are?
- 3 MR. SIMELTON: My name is Benard
- 4 Simelton. I'm president of the Alabama of the
- 5 Alabama State Conference of the National Association
- 6 for the Advancement of Colored People. I just like
- 7 to say thank you all for giving us this opportunity
- 8 to explain to you why we are and what we are asking
- 9 you to do.
- 10 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I'm assuming
- 11 y'all are here to talk in general terms and not about
- 12 your specific plan, correct? Or do you want to come
- 13 back and talk about your specific plan when we put it
- 14 up it on the screen.
- 15 MR. SIMELTON: I'm here to talk about
- 16 general terms.
- 17 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: That's fine.
- Just making sure we're on the same page.
- 19 MR. SIMELTON: Okay. But that didn't
- 20 -- the clock hasn't started yet, has it?
- 21 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yeah, it started,
- 22 but I'll give you 15 more seconds.
- MR. SIMELTON: Okay. I too would like
- 24 to say that I served in the United States Air Force,
- 25 protecting many of you all. While you were sleeping,

- 1 i was in the launch site in Grand Forks, North
- 2 Dakota, so that you all could sleep well.
- But as we learn that we're still in
- 4 the process of protecting our freedom and it's a
- 5 different type of protection from a different enemy.
- 6 Alabama is often has been on the wrong side of
- 7 history and the wrong side of justice, from school
- 8 segregation, to voting rights, to employment, to
- 9 criminal justice issues, Alabama has been many times
- on the right side -- I mean, the wrong side.
- 11 Usually, congress and the courts have
- 12 had to step in to correct the wrong that has been
- done. And now the Supreme Court of United States of
- 14 America has found that Alabama has, again, erred in
- its responsibility to be fair and equitable,
- 16 especially when it comes to its people of color,
- 17 black people.
- The Supreme Court found that the
- 19 legislature in 2021 map violated Section 2 of the
- 20 Voting Rights Act of 1965 by failing to create a
- 21 second-majority district and dividing communities of
- 22 interest, like the Black Belt. The Court found that
- 23 the map passed by the legislature in 2021, dilutes
- 24 the votes of black Alabamians violated Section 2 of
- 25 the Voting Rights Act.

- 1 But I state through this legislature
- 2 has been given another opportunity to correct and to
- 3 get it right this time. The legislature can correct
- 4 this wrong by discriminating -- against black voters.
- 5 But if either the legislature fails to act or the map
- 6 that the legislature adopts does not completely
- 7 remedy the violation of Voting Rights Act, then the
- 8 court will take over and process and impose a map of
- 9 its own. The legislature will lose control of
- 10 map-joining process.
- 11 My fellow plaintiffs and I will
- 12 discuss the many benefits of our plans, but the
- primary benefit is that the Voting Rights Acts
- 14 Plaintiffs remedial plan gives the legislature the
- 15 opportunity to get it right this time. And I urge
- 16 you to support the Plaintiffs' plan. Thank you so
- 17 much.
- 18 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Your timing was
- 19 almost perfect.
- MR. SIMELTON: Pardon me?
- 21 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Your timing was
- 22 perfect.
- MR. SIMELTON: Okay. Thank you. I'm
- 24 a perfect person.
- 25 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: All right. Who's

- 1 next? Please step to the microphone and identify
- 2 yourself.
- MS. DOWDY: Will we be allowed to
- 4 start talking about our plan now that the Plaintiffs
- 5 are up here? Can we talk about our plan since all
- 6 the Plaintiffs are up here, or are we still on the
- 7 open commentary section?
- 8 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Let's go ahead
- 9 and put the plan on the screen. Can we put it up
- 10 there? We're kind of getting out of order. I was
- 11 trying to say general, then we'll be on the plans.
- 12 We're going to get to it. That's the plan on the
- 13 screen right there. Is that it?
- MS. DOWDY: That is.
- 15 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: And you are?
- I'll get into it.
- 17 Good afternoon. Thank you for
- 18 allowing me to speak today. My name is Shalela
- 19 Dowdy. Currently, a major in the United States Army
- 20 and a plaintiff in the Allen versus Milligan voting
- 21 rights case, representing the first congressional
- 22 district as a citizen from Mobile. I joined the
- 23 lawsuit because I want someone in congress who is
- 24 adamant about equality and empowerment in all areas
- of the congressional district. I joined because I

- 1 want someone who is not afraid to engage in the
- 2 demographic, that is the majority in the first
- 3 congressional district, which will be the black
- 4 citizens of Mobile.
- 5 I want myself and my community to have
- 6 a seat at the table, rather than be on the menu. I
- 7 urge the Alabama legislature to support the VRA
- 8 Plaintiffs' remedial plan because it gives the City
- 9 of Mobile, which has a deep and long standing ties
- 10 with the Black Belt, an opportunity for real
- 11 representation.
- 12 At the trial in the case, I testified
- 13 about the difficulty that Mobile voters face in
- 14 getting their congressional representatives to
- 15 support -- infrastructure projects to fully fund our
- school and support broad access in health care and
- 17 hospitals.
- 18 The VRA Plaintiffs' plan connect
- 19 Mobile with the Black Belt that is very similar to
- 20 the State Board of Education plan passed by the
- 21 legislature in 2021. Since 2010, when the
- legislature began connecting Mobile and the Black
- 23 Belt in the State Board of Education District 5,
- 24 Mobilians have been able to select black preferred
- 25 candidates to the State Board of Education.

1 The VRA Plaintiffs' plan is also very 2 similar to the plans approved by the three-judge 3 court and the United States Supreme Court as constitutionally acceptable remedies to the VRA 4 5 violations. The VRA Plaintiffs' plan is the only 6 plan which has already been evaluated in a similar 7 form by both District Court and the Supreme Court. 8 Both of these courts found the VRA 9 Plaintiffs' plan decision to connect parts of Mobile 10 County to the Black Belt, very constitutionally acceptable. The Court also found that the VRA 11 12 Plaintiffs' plans were reasonably configured as they were similar to or better to the legislature's plan 13 14 in complying with redistricting principles. Plaintiffs' plan has the strongest defense against 15 16 any argument that the plan either uses race in a 17 unconstitutional manner or doesn't comply with the 18 VRA. 19 This cannot be said of any other plan that has been introduced. Please remove the work 20 21 that has been done this far to get us here and respect those efforts by choosing to support the VRA 22 23 Remedial Plan. I wholly support our plan and ask that the Committee and the legislature support it 24 25 too. I thank you for the opportunity and your time.

- 1 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you so
- 2 much. And you are?
- 3 MS. STONE: Khadidah Stone. Let me
- 4 know can I go --
- 5 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes, Ms. Stone.
- 6 Thank you.
- 7 MS. STONE: Good afternoon, everyone.
- 8 My name is Khadidah Stone. I'm also a plaintiff in
- 9 the Allen v. Milligan Case. I joined the --
- 10 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Where you from?
- MS. STONE: Oh. I'm from Montgomery,
- 12 from here, Montgomery, Alabama. I joined this case
- 13 because I could not go another ten years without fair
- 14 representation for me or my community. In addition
- to what my fellow Plaintiffs have said, I support the
- VRA Plaintiffs' remedial plan because it addresses
- 17 the Court and the communities concerns about the need
- 18 for a district that would actually elect
- 19 black-preferred candidates.
- In its decision, the three-judge court
- 21 instructed that, as a legislator considers remedial
- 22 plans, it should be mindful of the practical reality
- 23 based on the ample evidence of intensely racially
- 24 polarized voting adduced during the preliminary
- 25 injunction proceedings. That any remedial plan will

- 1 need to include two districts, in which black voters
- 2 are either comprised of voting-age majority or
- 3 something quite close to it.
- 4 Congressional District Two in our plan
- 5 is 51 percent black citizens voting-age population.
- 6 Congressional District Two would also have about 5
- 7 percent other minority population and a 44 percent
- 8 white citizen voting-age population. 52 percent of
- 9 the registered voters are black according to the
- 10 Secretary of State's voter registration records.
- 11 Congressional district seven is 56 percent black
- 12 citizen voting-age population and 58 percent of the
- 13 registered voters are black.
- 14 The two majority black districts will
- 15 give black voters in those districts the ability to
- 16 elect candidates of their choice and statewide
- 17 elections from 2014 to 2020. The VRA Plaintiffs'
- 18 expert witnesses in the litigation analyzed that
- 19 black candidates carried these districts even though
- 20 they lost at a statewide level. We have heard
- 21 concerns about the presence of people in prisons in
- 22 our district, meaning that black voters won't have an
- 23 opportunity to elect their candidates of choice in
- 24 these districts. But even accounting for people in
- 25 prisons, our districts are still majority black.

- 1 According to the Alabama Department of
- 2 Corrections there are about 4000 people -- okay.
- 3 There are about 4000 people in the prisons in Bullock
- 4 and Butler County in our VRA Plaintiffs'
- 5 Congressional District Two. And although the Alabama
- 6 Department of Corrections does not provide a racial
- 7 breakdown, even if all 4000 of those people in prison
- 8 were black, the VRA Congressional District Two would
- 9 still have a black majority for over 2500 citizens.
- 10 Like my fellow plaintiffs, I'm
- 11 confident that our plan will provide black voters
- 12 with a fair opportunity to elect candidates of their
- 13 choice. Thank you so much for your time.
- 14 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you. And
- 15 you are welcome.
- 16 MS. DANIELS: Good afternoon. I'm
- 17 trying to get my comments here, sir. Okay. Here we
- 18 go. Good afternoon. My name is Latetia Daniels
- 19 Jackson, and I am from the great circle city of
- 20 Dothan, Alabama. You all heard from my former mayor,
- 21 who I'm also called to my friend earlier. And I'm
- 22 glad that he agrees that Dothan should stay with
- 23 Montgomery because that is exactly what our map does.
- Representation matters. Having
- 25 someone who understands your community and -- your

```
1
     community issues and concerns in an elective body is
 2
     important. I decided to join this lawsuit because I
 3
     hadn't felt represented on a federal level for a
 4
     very, very long time. In fact, I never received any
 5
     correspondence at all from my congressional member
 6
     until I became a plaintiff in this case. He has,
7
     never to my knowledge, been in my community, never
8
     held a town hall meeting or any other meeting in the
 9
     black community. And when I received notices of
     meetings, they are never anywhere near where black
10
     voters live and frequent.
11
12
                    When elected, even though we may be
13
     from different political ideologies and may not agree
14
     on much, it is important that the elected leaders of
15
     our community represent the whole community. To talk
16
     to us and to attempt to gain some knowledge and
17
     understanding of our issues and things that concern
     us, to communicate with us about federal dollars
18
19
     coming into the state that can be accessed by our
20
     communities to address the needs that we have, such
21
     as the digital divide, but we understand there are
     millions, millions of dollars set to come in from the
22
23
     state to address the broadband issues --
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: One minute.
24
```

-- the gap.

- 1 Billions of dollars will be spent to
- 2 make broadband accessible to rural communities like
- 3 the Black Belt. However, we haven't received any of
- 4 information in our community from out congressional
- 5 member about these dollars. Representation matters.
- 6 And that is the key premise of Section 2 of the
- 7 Voting Rights Act, on which we base our lawsuit.
- 8 So I urge you all to listen to our
- 9 concerns, to hear us, to understand the importance
- 10 that representation does matter. And we need
- 11 representation. And we need our voices heard. Thank
- 12 you.
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you. I
- 14 think we all recognize you.
- I recognize you too, sir.
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: But you do have
- 17 to state your name for those who are watching on live
- 18 stream.
- 19 MR. MILLIGAN: Yes, sir. Good
- 20 afternoon. My name is Evan Milligan, Executive
- 21 Director of Alabama Forward. I'm also long-time
- 22 resident of Montgomery, and my maternal side, my
- 23 mother's side, have been living in the Black Belt
- 24 area for at least eight generations. I'm six
- 25 generations removed from enslavement, and my son and

- 1 daughter are the seventh generation. When I look at
- 2 them, I want to commit to them inheriting in Alabama
- 3 that allows them an opportunity to lead, to dream,
- 4 and to make contributions to the community. The same
- 5 that you want for your children and you
- 6 grandchildren.
- 7 When you look out in the audience
- 8 today, you see lots of young people. And what I hope
- 9 is that -- you see them as your children, as
- 10 Alabama's children. There are young people here that
- 11 are participating in summer activities to learn about
- 12 leadership. They can be doing anything. And what I
- want for these young people to know that there is a
- 14 future for them in this state.
- Representative Pringle, you mentioned
- 16 that there are maps that have been sent in from New
- 17 Zealand, from far, Australia, maybe. We all know
- 18 there are Alabamians living all around the world
- 19 making contributions. Many of them have left the
- 20 state. We talked about exporting our home, growing
- 21 our babies. We need to build a state that actually
- looks into our future in this country, embraces our
- 23 promise as a multicultural community and provides a
- 24 path forward, so that young people like we see
- 25 sitting here today, can see themselves in position of

- 1 leadership. This congressional district that we're
- 2 talking about today can provide one path forward for
- 3 that. We've mentioned some of the things that are
- 4 featured on our map, but I really just want you think
- 5 about the soul of the matter. Do you see as your
- 6 children?
- 7 You, as the State of Alabama
- 8 representing us, do you see us as people that are
- 9 qualified to lead, to serve, those of that are
- 10 serving in the military to die, to show up when there
- 11 are tornadoes, to show up when there are accidents on
- 12 our highways? If we qualified to serve in those
- 13 areas, then please consider how you can design a map
- 14 that can allow us to serve at the federal level. In
- 15 the eyes of the nation -- and the eyes of the nation
- 16 are looking at you, I know it's hard. I know you
- 17 have people that you answer to. I know this is not
- 18 an easy job. But if you can cut out the noise, look
- 19 within, you can look to history.
- 20 You can make a mark in history that
- 21 will set a standard for this country, the same way we
- 22 done with NASA and technology up in Huntsville down
- 23 to all the aquatics industry down in Mobile and the
- 24 sports that we talked in Tuscaloosa and Auburn. We
- 25 can do that same thing with our government and our

- 1 education, and it starts with this conversation.
- 2 So I hope that you would consider what
- 3 we've said. Consider our map. We thank you for your
- 4 time.
- 5 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you,
- 6 Mr. Milligan.
- 7 MR. ROSS: How are you all doing? My
- 8 name is Deuel Ross. I see my name on the list there.
- 9 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I see. And
- 10 you're from where?
- 11 MR. ROSS: I'm the lead attorney for
- 12 the Milligan Plaintiffs to argue the case in the
- 13 Supreme Court.
- 14 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: And you live?
- 15 MR. ROSS: I live in DC.
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Okay. That's
- 17 what I thought.
- MR. ROSS: I was asked by the attorney
- 19 for the cochairs to read from a letter that we sent
- 20 to him on behalf of the Milligan and the Caster
- 21 plaintiffs. I'll try to paraphrase. I think you all
- 22 have copies of it. The letters make four points.
- 23 The first is that our clients were brave enough to
- 24 speak today in this case. The only ones who won a
- 25 case so far, the only ones who were in the Supreme

- 1 Court, were the Milligan and the Caster plaintiffs,
- 2 my clients here.
- 3 The Singleton Plaintiffs respectfully,
- 4 have not won anything in the District Court or in the
- 5 Supreme Court. Second, there's been some
- 6 conversation from my good friend and colleague Jim
- 7 Blacksher about whole county plan. We have looked at
- 8 the results of the elections that Mr. Blacksher
- 9 provided to you. The black and black-preferred
- 10 candidates lost 5 out of the 11 biracial elections in
- 11 the Singleton whole county plan.
- They lost four of the biracial
- elections in the CLC Plan, that Mr. Blacksher is
- 14 talking about. As my clients testified, that's not
- true for the elections that were analyzed for the
- 16 Plaintiffs' remedial plan. The black-preferred
- 17 candidates and black candidates won all of the
- 18 biracial elections that were analyzed between 2014
- 19 and 2020.
- I think -- one other thing is really
- 21 important to emphasize here. Because my clients are
- the only ones who have actually won a case, the
- 23 Supreme Court considered arguments about communities
- of interests, considered arguments about the Black
- 25 Belt as a community that has been discriminated

- 1 against for close to 200 years. And the Supreme
- 2 Court found that the Black Belt is a significant
- 3 community of interest. It's a community that
- 4 deserves representation, just like every other
- 5 community in Alabama.
- So with that, I'll leave you all. As
- 7 I said, I'm trying to summarize this letter that we
- 8 sent to Mr. Walker at his request. But if you all
- 9 have any questions, I'm happy to -- my clients and I
- 10 are happy to answer them. Thank you.
- 11 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I thank you for
- 12 your testimony. We're going to talk about your plan
- 13 later. Y'all jumped in front of everybody else. So
- 14 before we start a question and answer on your plan,
- we're going to finish -- we're going to go in the
- 16 order.
- 17 I don't mind doing it. I want you to
- 18 understand that, but y'all kind of jumped in and
- 19 wanted to talked about your plan when we're in
- 20 general discussion. Let me talk to Davin Rosborough.
- 21 And we're going to get back to you and let you talk
- 22 about your letters and your plan.
- MR. ROSBOROUGH: Thank you. My name
- 24 is Davin Rosborough. I'm cocounsel for the Milligan
- 25 Plaintiffs. I'm a lawyer with ACLU Voting Project.

- 1 I just want to make a few comments addressing some
- 2 things that have been said today that I hope will be
- 3 helpful for consideration as you all consider to vote
- 4 on plans.
- 5 First of all, although the victory in
- 6 the Milligan/Caster cases, which was affirmed by the
- 7 Supreme Court was from a preliminary injunction. It
- 8 is a final judgment for purposes of the 2024
- 9 elections at least. Second, we've heard a lot today
- 10 about the redistricting guidelines that this
- 11 committee passed. We heard about Voting Rights Acts
- 12 compliance. We've heard about communities of
- 13 interest.
- 14 Communities of interest are obviously
- an important consideration in drawing any plan. I
- like to point out, though, the committee's own
- 17 quidelines here, recognize that the Voting Rights
- 18 Act, Voting Rights Act compliance take precedence
- 19 over some of those other provisions, specifically
- 20 Part J of the redistricting guidelines say, the
- 21 following redistricting policies are to be followed:
- 22 "To the extent they do not violate or subordinate the
- 23 following policies prescribed by the constitution and
- laws in the United States and the State of Alabama,
- 25 that of course includes the Voting Rights Act."

- 1 Finally, I want to address a comment
- 2 that a gentleman made earlier today about
- 3 redistricting based on stereotype. The rulings that
- 4 this Court made were based on hours and days of
- 5 testimony, hundreds of thousands pages in the record,
- 6 many hundred page decision, which was then heard and
- 7 affirmed by the United States Supreme Court. They
- 8 show stark racially polarized voting in Alabama.
- 9 Race still infuses the political system here. And
- 10 that's why the race-conscious remedy that's
- 11 presented, which still respects political boundaries
- 12 and communities of interests, like the Supreme Court
- 13 recognized is a proper remedy. Thank you.
- 14 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Again, thank,
- 15 y'all after we get off the general discussion portion
- 16 of this.
- 17 So with that, the next person that is
- 18 signed up is Kenneth Paschal from Pelham, Alabama.
- MR. PASCHAL: Thank you for the
- 20 recognition.
- 21 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you for
- 22 being here. State your name for the record so they
- 23 can hear you.
- MR. PASCHAL: My name is Kenneth
- 25 Paschal from Pelham, Alabama. After 21 years in the

- 1 military, I could have moved anywhere in the world,
- 2 anywhere in the country, I decided to move back to
- 3 Alabama. I live in Pelham. And today, July 13, two
- 4 years ago something specially unique happened in
- 5 Alabama. I stand before you today, as celebrating a
- 6 two-year anniversary of being elected to the Alabama
- 7 State Legislature as some people it's say it's a
- 8 historical event.
- 9 The first person of color elected to
- 10 Alabama State Legislature since reconstruction,
- 11 approximately 140 years ago -- although I capture
- 12 that historic moment for about five seconds, but my
- 13 takeaway is what Dr. King said in 1863. He said, "I
- 14 look to the day where people would not be judge by
- the color of their skin, but by the contents of their
- 16 character."
- 17 The people Shelby County, my district,
- they did not vote for me because the color of my
- 19 skin. They voted for me because they saw a
- 20 God-fearing man, a veteran who serves the country,
- 21 loves the country, who got out and engaged with the
- 22 people in the community.
- And so your task to represent the
- 24 people in your district, and also everyone else in
- 25 this state, you have a tough task before you. I just

- 1 wanted to take a few minutes and to kind of share
- 2 that with you because what I'm hearing -- what I've
- 3 been hearing is, a lot of focus on -- and skin color.
- I just wanted to let you know, Alabama
- 5 -- once again, I could have moved anywhere in the
- 6 world, anywhere in the country. And I stand before
- 7 you today as a proud American, as a proud father, as
- 8 a proud black man that lives in Alabama and
- 9 represents the great people in Shelby County in a
- 10 Republican party.
- I just wanted to say you have tough
- 12 task before you. But just please listen to what I
- 13 share with you, and say Dr. King's dream is alive in
- 14 Alabama. We have come a long way, and I'm living
- 15 proof that it is not based on color, as far as
- 16 representative -- I represent everybody in Shelby
- 17 County. Thank you for your time.
- 18 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: The Chair now
- 19 recognizes Donna George from Newton.
- 20 MS. GEORGE: Thank you, Chairman. I'm
- 21 here today to talk about an important issue and
- 22 something that is deeply concerning to me. It's a
- 23 stereotype that leaves black voters completely
- 24 forgotten and ignored. I'm a black Republican, and
- 25 I'm here to represent thousands of black voters, who

- 1 are also Republicans, that stereotypes of all black
- 2 voters are not Democrats.
- 3 And it's disrespectful to black
- 4 Republicans across the state and across the country.
- 5 I hope that you all take us and our opinions into
- 6 account when drawing district lines. We deserve a
- 7 voice too. Thank you for your time.
- 8 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you so
- 9 much.
- 10 Now, the Chair recognizes Belinda
- 11 Thomas from Newton.
- MS. THOMAS: Good afternoon. My name
- 13 is Councilwoman Belinda Thomas. I represent the
- 14 great town of Newton, Alabama in the great area of
- 15 the Wiregrass. I am the first African American to be
- 16 elected council. I was the only female to be elected
- 17 council. I'm a patriot. I'm a Republican. I love
- 18 this state. I love my party.
- 19 It is unfair that we talk about
- 20 redistricting based on color. Because the city I
- 21 live in, the state I live in, it's not a lot of us.
- 22 So I was elected for my beliefs. And what I wanted
- 23 to do for the people, not because of my color.
- 24 I'm also a business woman bringing industry to the
- 25 state of Alabama, through my company, Alabamboo, not

- 1 based on color, based on building infrastructure,
- 2 bringing jobs bringing opportunity. I'm also the
- 3 founder of a nonprofit that bills farmers, not based
- 4 on color, not based on districting but based on need.
- 5 I pray that when you look at this, you
- 6 see me as a black Republican, but as a woman, and not
- 7 based on whether I'm Democrat or Republican based on
- 8 what's right. I feel that Wiregrass is an area that
- 9 needs to stay together, and stay with Montgomery.
- 10 Thank you.
- 11 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you so
- 12 much. The Chair now recognizes Tia -- is Lennora
- 13 Pierrot? I got it. Yay.
- 14 MS. PIERROT: Good afternoon. I am
- 15 Tia Lennora Pierrot. I am representing Macon County.
- 16 I am here today truly thankful for the opportunity
- 17 the be here in Alabama. I have been here for 11
- 18 years, and within those 11 years, I have really seen
- 19 the lack of for us for African Americans. And it is
- 20 really important as leaders who are representing us,
- 21 we need to be informed. We, as citizens, are not
- informed. We vote for you, and we don't get the
- 23 information that we need. We don't know what it is
- that's happening. We don't know what and how you
- 25 guys are leading our lives.

1 So today, I am here to ask on your 2 behalf to please if we vote for you, let us know what's going on, let us know how our lives are being 3 impacted, let us know what we need to do. The 4 5 information that's been given here today and so many 6 people do not know that this stuff is happening. 7 It is necessary for us, as citizens of Alabama to be aware what it is that's going on in 8 9 your community. As a associate for the Black Belt Foundation, it is important because we have 10 individuals who are doing the work, and they're not 11 12 getting recognized for anything that they're doing in 13 Alabama. It's really sad that while we're here, at 14 this point in history, in 2023 we are the living legacy of the individuals that have died for the 15 16 opportunity to sit in a seat for the opportunity to 17 sit over here and lead the individuals. 18 So whether or not, I am a black 19 Republican or a black Democrat, should not matter as 20 to whether or not the things that we do and the 21 things that you -- the laws that you dominate us within our community, we as individuals, we as 22 23 citizens, it is necessary that we are informed. 24 And Alabama Forward, I thank you guys

for the work that you do. Because if it wasn't for

- 1 that you did, a lot of us within our communities
- 2 would not be aware of the things that's been going
- 3 on. So I say thank you because we do need to have
- 4 forward movement, but it has to be from a place of
- 5 consistently united. We have to unite. The
- 6 Republicans and the Democrats have to come together
- 7 because we live together.
- 8 So being two percent Republican in
- 9 Macon County that doesn't mean I'm a "anti-my
- 10 people," it means I want to work for my people. And
- I am here today to ask my leaders, the people who
- 12 represent me, the people that I voted for, to please
- inform the people. Because we don't know what's
- 14 going on. I live in Macon. Lee County has such a
- 15 better educational system in Macon County, and it's
- 16 not right. So I need representation. Thank you.
- 17 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you so
- 18 much. The Chair recognize Benard Simelton -- you
- 19 already started -- I love you, but no.
- 20 Yolanda Flowers from Birmingham?
- 21 Yolanda Flowers from Birmingham? Okay. I heard a
- 22 voice.
- MS. FLOWERS: Good afternoon. I'm
- 24 Yolanda Flowers from Birmingham. I was told that I
- 25 am -- I just sign in. So I just followed suit. I

```
1
     just did what I was told to do. But -- in regards --
 2
     since I'm here, I would like to talk about
 3
     representation as we've heard several people have --
     have voiced. And it is important. We do know the
 4
 5
     schism that is taking place in our state, which is
 6
     not good. But none of us know if it's fair.
7
                    And so I'm being as one is
     representing many others, both Democrat and
8
 9
     Republican because we are here and we do have
10
     liberals as well. To -- to think about the whole, to
     not think about one party or the next but to think
11
12
     about what is best for everybody and I believe that's
13
     what -- Legislators, you all have been missing the
14
     mark in terms of us citizens, to hear our voices, to
     know what is fair, considering the history of Alabama
15
16
     and all so please bear that in mind in regards to all
17
     of us, because it behooves all of us. If Alabama is
     to -- to thrive and to do better than what Alabama
18
19
     has done. The history of Alabama is not good. And
     we know that and you all are in a prime position to
20
21
     make it best for all of us. The whole country, even
     the whole world as I stated during the campaign, if
22
23
     we're looking at Alabama, we know Alabama is a racist
             I gotta say it, you know, the foundations
24
```

have not been fair, and as much blood has been spilt

- 1 on this ground and -- and has produced strange fruit.
- 2 So I've just -- just thank you for
- 3 listening. And I pray that God will arrest y'all's
- 4 heart when you all go to make the decision that you
- 5 will make it right. If Alabama is to be healed,
- 6 please make it right for us all. Thank you.
- 7 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you, Ms.
- 8 Flowers.
- 9 The chair now recognizes Patrick
- 10 McWilliams from Spanish Fort.
- MR. McWILLIAMS: Good afternoon,
- 12 Cochair Livingston and Cochair Pringle as esteemed
- 13 committee members. I am Patrick McWilliams from
- 14 Spanish Fort. I am also the chairman of Baldwin
- 15 County Republican Party. I am here today because the
- 16 Senate and the House leadership saw fit not to
- 17 appoint anyone to this committee that resides in
- 18 Baldwin County. I think it is worthwhile to state
- 19 the merits of Allen versus Milligan and how it
- 20 pertains Baldwin County and Coastal Alabama.
- 21 Baldwin County because of Alabama. We
- 22 need to call it like it is with this ruling. This
- was a 4.75 to 4.25 vote. Justin Cavanaugh said that
- on Part 3 B1 of Chief Justice Roberts' opinion. This
- 25 margin is as razor thin as it gets concerning the

14th and 15th Amendments. I have not heard anyone 1 2 bring up the dissenting opinion -- opinion of Justice 3 Thomas, who has been hearing cases on Voting Rights Act for over 30 years. Thomas' opinion specifically 4 5 addresses congressional district -- and communities 6 of similar interest. It specifically states, it is indisputable that the Gulf Coast region is a sort of 7 8 community of interests that Alabama Legislator might 9 reasonably think and congressional districts should 10 be built the route. With the Plaintiffs' remedial map, you 11 12 can have a congressional district that is Mobile to Dothan lumping a congressional district from Alabama 13 14 Mississippi lines into Dothan region will complicate major economic policy initiatives like the Interstate 15 16 10, Mobile River Bridge and Bayway project that 17 connects downtown Mobile to Baldwin County. Is that a priority for someone that lives in Enterprise? Or 18 19 will for -- the Ross Clark Circle in Dothan be a top priority for somebody in Foley. 20 21 Another issue that should concern all of us as earmarks for federal budget appropriations. 22 23 We would to have two large universities with South Alabama and Troy. Then you have Coast Guard aviation 24

training center in Mobile, and army -- aviation

- 1 training center at Fort Novosel. Both are critical
- 2 training for aviators for national defense. There
- 3 are only so many earmarks you can get in one
- 4 congressional district. They close -- Mobile,
- 5 Baldwin counties are a community of interest. I will
- 6 remind this committee that none of you had any
- 7 problem reaching in the Baldwin County and absorbing
- 8 the entire city of Spanish Fort to create a new
- 9 senate District 33, which is 73 percent black and 23
- 10 percent white.
- I think we can all agree there is no
- 12 easy way to make this fair and equitable for
- 13 everyone. But however, this may fall out the
- 14 Plaintiffs' remedial map will negatively impact not
- only coastal Alabama, but the socioeconomic health of
- 16 the entire state. Thank you.
- 17 SENATOR FIGURES: Mr. Chairman?
- 18 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you. Yes,
- 19 Senator Figures?
- 20 SENATOR PRINGLES: I just like to tell
- 21 the young man that I was a part of that person who
- 22 got in Baldwin County, and you're my constituent.
- 23 But I didn't vote for that plan, so -- the same
- 24 people who voted for this congressional plan and went
- 25 to the Supreme Court, and they voted it down, then --

- 1 those are the same people who put me in your county.
- 2 I just wanted to make that clear to you.
- 3 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you,
- 4 Senator. Thank you, Mr. McWilliams.
- Now, the Chair recognizes the final
- 6 person on our general then we'll go to the individual
- 7 plans. Reverend Rayford Mack.
- 8 MR. MACK: Good afternoon, committee
- 9 members. I came here today with a written-out
- 10 appeal, but after hearing and feeling what has
- 11 happening, I had to throw that out the window. If
- 12 the committee itself that's working on the plan, is
- 13 not initiating and doing the right things to come up
- 14 with -- what needs to be done, how is it going to
- 15 move forward?
- 16 Senator Smitherman stated that this is
- 17 a new start. We're here today because of power and
- 18 privilege. We still fighting for power and
- 19 privilege. There's no way you could deny. We want
- 20 the privilege to vote, which would give us power.
- 21 The committee wants to retain a certain power for a
- 22 certain demographic. We're here for the same reason
- 23 that got us here before. We're tired of this
- 24 situation.
- 25 So I'm going to read the first

- 1 statement. We find ourself at a critical junction --
- 2 always at a critical junction in this state. So for
- 3 once and for all, let's do the right thing. You
- 4 know, if I had been born white, I would not want to
- 5 give up my privilege, this unforeseen, unknown
- 6 privilege that I have. I would not want to do that.
- 7 In all honesty, it's no way that you can come about
- 8 this being fair, but you can't be fair, but you can
- 9 do the right thing.
- 10 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: One minute.
- MR. MACK: So I grew up in Mobile. I
- 12 spent the past 30 years in Montgomery. I know what
- 13 city-wide elections -- everybody in the county voting
- 14 for who they wanted to vote for, majority is white.
- 15 It's time for a change. It's time for a change.
- 16 And, if you there sitting on the committee, don't see
- 17 that, we will be right back here again in 2053,
- 18 fighting these same issues because of power and
- 19 privilege, and nobody wants to share in this power
- 20 and privilege.
- But we'll be here to fight for our
- 22 rights as citizens in the state of Alabama and
- 23 citizens of America. Thank you very much.
- 24 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you so
- 25 much, Reverend.

```
1
                    That concludes our discussion on the
 2
     general issue of redistricting and reapportionment.
 3
     Now, we'll move to -- if the clerk will please put up
     the VRA Plaintiffs' remedial map on the screen, and
 4
 5
     we'll begin discussing this particular map.
 6
                    The Chair now recognizes Travis
7
     Jackson for the purposes of discussing this plan.
8
                    MR. JACKSON: Thank you all for
 9
     allowing me to be here, Chairman, and all the
10
     reapportionment committee members. Thank y'all for
     what you do for our community, as well as state.
11
12
                    My name is Travis Jackson, just like
13
     many countless people that have spoken, I am too a
14
     war veteran. I am a war veteran of the Iraq
     Campaign. I deployed for 15 months during Bush Jr.'s
15
16
     -- from 2007 through 2008. I'm also a huge advocate
17
     for Black Lives/Voters Matter. I'm a firm believer,
     as you all should believe, that not all voters cannot
18
19
     matters until black voters matter.
20
                    I am a huge supporter of the VRA
21
     Plaintiffs' remedial map. I say that because after
22
     researching on my own accord, as well as reading the
23
     opinion of the Supreme Court, I've come to realize
24
     that we for years and years and decades and decades,
```

Alabama has been national embarrassment, for not just

- 1 America but a world-wide embarrassment.
- 2 It is long overdue for us to recognize
- 3 that black voters are -- black voters do deserve not
- 4 only fundamental rights, but they do need to have
- 5 their proper recognition as being political
- 6 superheroes of the land. I -- if you all do vote and
- 7 support of the VRA Plaintiffs' remedial map, I have
- 8 some few suggestions for y'all to take into
- 9 consideration, and I will speak on the
- 10 recommendations.
- I highly recommend that there is
- 12 voters with disability. I urge you all to consider
- voting accessibility, as well as disable
- 14 accessibility in the buildings, inside and outside of
- 15 the buildings. I highly recommend that there will be
- 16 actually adequate or adequate or healthy water. I
- 17 recommend that there is no police presence whatsoever
- 18 because in the year and years since black voters have
- 19 had the fundamental rights to vote. The police have
- 20 been camouflaged as, many of them, as the Ku Klux
- 21 Klan by intimidating black voters every time they go
- 22 to the voting poll. They do so through unethical
- 23 search methods, whether it's patting down or
- 24 commanding them to empty all the items in their
- 25 clothing or purses or bags or whatsoever.

- 1 And they also -- and they also stopped
- 2 and pulled people over, black voters in particularly.
- 3 This is in my opinion, this is not the Ku Klux Klan,
- 4 but any police force that intimidates minority
- 5 voters, I like to call them the "Blue Klux Klan."
- In consideration -- in conclusion, I
- 7 would just like to say when this map is voted upon
- 8 that you look at all voters as equal and not just
- 9 white voters only. Because all voters can't matter
- 10 until black votes matter. Thank you.
- 11 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you, sir.
- 12 I'm going to ask people testifying, talk about the
- 13 plan. What we're here to talk about is the VRA
- 14 Plaintiffs' remedial map. That's the issue before
- 15 this committee. We need to stay on the issue before
- 16 the committee and what this map before you looks
- 17 like.
- 18 The Chair now recognizes Khadidah
- 19 Stone from Montgomery? Y'all don't want to speak
- 20 again. Okay.
- 21 Reverend Mack has already spoken.
- 22 Mike -- I can't read. Looks like from Montgomery
- 23 Mike Mila [sic]?
- 24 Didn't she already speak? Latetia
- 25 Daniels Jackson -- Commissioner Sheila Tyson.

```
1
                    MS. TYSON: It's lunchtime, now,
 2
     y'all, right?
 3
                   Good afternoon. I brought some maps
 4
     since y'all have maps, you have so many, but I
 5
     brought the Plaintiffs' map, and I wanted y'all to
 6
     know that's the one I'm supporting. And my speech
     today, to what I wrote -- I'm just going to disregard
7
            I want you to know I am a county commissioner
8
 9
     in Jefferson County. I have people that represent me
     that sit on this committee in Jefferson County. I am
10
     here as a county commissioner, but I'm also here for
11
12
     a convenor for the Black Women's Roundtable.
                    I am became a convenor for the Black
13
14
     Women's Roundtable because of the representation of
15
     black people and black women and children that we
16
     were not receiving in the state of Alabama. We work
17
     out four counties in this state. We have women and
18
     children that are not being represented in this
19
     state. We have access to resources from out of the
     state of Alabama that we have bring to this state in
20
21
     order to cover the counties that they are being
22
     represented in. From clean water, health care, food
23
     deficiencies, throughout this state, educational
24
     program. I can go -- utilities -- I can go on and on
```

25

and on.

```
1
                    I would like for you to look at these
 2
     lines, just from this paper that I have received that
 3
     Senator Smitherman and three, four other senators,
     Representative Hall have brought to y'all's
 4
 5
     attention.
                The disrespect of the court system, that
 6
     y'all turn around and rewrote something to fit what
     y'all wanted. I just really hope that you all do
7
8
     this on no -- be on the right side of history, on
9
     this decision.
10
                    We have the whole world looking at us.
     They already think we're a bunch of country bumpkins
11
12
     and the most racist state in the world. Make sure
13
     that you represent your families. Y'all have
14
     families that's going to look back in history and see
15
     what you were doing because of a race issue that
16
     should not be addressed through this. Do the right
17
     thing. Draw the lines right. Do not send us back to
18
     the court system. Used the maps that the Plaintiffs
19
     that have given you. Everyone told me, you go up
     there, they are not going to pay any attention to
20
21
     nothing that you say. They are going draw it on
22
     party line. But I am hoping that you don't.
23
                    I am hoping that you would be on the
24
     right side of history and do what the courts ask you
```

to do.

```
1
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you so
 2
     much, Commissioner.
 3
                    Chair now recognizes Bianca Baxter
 4
     from Montgomery.
 5
                    MS. BAXTER: Good afternoon, everyone.
 6
     My name is Bianca Baxter. I am 16. I am in the 11th
     grade at Brewbaker Tech Magnet High School. I'm
7
     speaking today on the Southern Youth Leadership
8
 9
     Development Institute founded by Ms. Doris Crenshaw.
10
     While my fellow students had to leave, I am here to
     speak on our behalf and bring awareness to a
11
12
     situation.
13
                    First, I would like to open with a
14
     quote from Kofi Annan, "We may have different
     religions, different languages, even different color
15
16
     skins, but we belong to all one human race." This
17
     summer we've been learning about the current status
     of the Allan vs. Milligan case. We are grateful for
18
19
     those who have taken extreme efforts to bring
20
     attention to this state issue of restricting. As
21
     Milligan stated earlier, we deserve to know and be
22
     acknowledged as a part of this human race as well.
23
                    Soon, we will be included in civics,
24
     processes, as well as informed citizens. We hope to
```

make the greatest impact possible with our vote. As

- 1 youth in Alabama, we will be included in the voting
- 2 process in these upcoming years. This aspires us to
- 3 learn about other injustices that may impact my
- 4 future, our future.
- 5 My question is, or if this map is not
- 6 passed nor acknowledged by the State of Alabama, what
- 7 rights and opportunity will be at risk for my youth
- 8 as future voters? Also what statutes will be
- 9 implemented to ensure the fairest map and effectively
- 10 abided by if this map is in fact passed? That is my
- 11 question to you all. If this is not passed, what
- 12 will future look like here?
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: One minute.
- 14 MS. BAXTER: I'm going to let that sit
- for my one -- I will stand here for my one minute
- 16 and, I will acknowledge my question. I will keep
- 17 repeating it. If this is not passed, what will my
- 18 and my siblings, my children, your children, what
- 19 will their future look like here in Alabama? I'll
- 20 say it again. What will my future look like here in
- 21 Alabama if this is not acknowledged? I matter, you
- 22 matter, we all matter. We are all the same. We all
- 23 believe. 16 young and educated.
- 24 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you. Your
- 25 time has expired.

```
1
                    The Chair now recognizes Tammie Smith
 2
     from Birmingham.
 3
                   MS. SMITH: Good afternoon. I just
     got one thing -- well a couple of things.
 4
 5
     line wasn't drew right this time, what insurance do
 6
     we have that it's going to be drawn right now?
     Because if the same people are rewriting them and
7
     then do it right, what makes it so special that
8
 9
     you're going to draw them properly -- right -- this
10
     go-round?
                    It's no secret that we've been stacked
11
12
     and packed -- and cut up and spit out as black
     people. And on this side of the panel, looking up
13
14
     there, we fighting the news about it anyway. What
     insurance are we going to get? Because some of you
15
16
     have no idea how it feels that we still being fight
17
     -- still fighting about -- it's 2023. We still are
     fighting for rights to be counted as voters. We
18
19
     fighting to be counted as voters. They're fighting
20
     get to decide what they're going to put they next
21
     million-dollar project at.
22
                    It's -- uneven the playing field is.
23
     We still don't get justice. That's so, so unfair.
     Even with this stacked and packed and cut up and
24
```

diced up, it's still the blacks -- it's still the

- 1 blacks that being affected the most. You can't know
- 2 how it feels. We always talk about being accounted,
- 3 being accounted. If it ain't the census, it's
- 4 something else.
- 5 And with this redrawing line, why was
- 6 it necessary to cut us up and dice us up and spit us
- 7 out anyway? So is it beneficial for the ones that's
- 8 writing it? For us to be not include or included?
- 9 Is it benefit -- for their personal gain? We always
- 10 been the political puns in Alabama. And being from
- 11 Birmingham, I don't have to tell you nothing.
- 12 Because even there, if we leave Jefferson County
- 13 Birmingham, like it is. It don't need to be cut up
- 14 and diced up just to set -- power they be.
- Because the problem we got down here,
- 16 it start right down here it behind these walls. It's
- 17 so unfair to people of color. It always amazing that
- 18 the ones who made the decision about the people of
- 19 color never is the ones that's the people of color.
- 20 So it don't make sense. So try to understand from
- 21 this side, being still counted in 2023, 1965 Voters
- 22 Rights Act. What kind of since do that make? It's a
- 23 horrible feeling. We have to travel to go down there
- just to be recognized. They don't have to try --
- just to vote all in favor. And it's still not right.

- 1 So factor that in when you want to 2 chop them up again and redraw -- what difference is 3 it going to make if it's going to be redrawn, and we going to end right back here with the same problem. 4 5 So if you draw fairly in the first place, because you 6 don't separate the money when it come to what we have to pay for. You know, we pay for a lot of the stuff 7 8 that you do, so you don't separate that money. So 9 stop separating us. Thank you. 10 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you. 11 The chair now recognizes Ron Jackson from Birmingham. 12 13 Sheila Dowdy from Mobile? Okav. 14 Okay. Are any of the members of 15 committee have any questions on the VRA Plaintiffs' 16 remedial map? Are there any questions from the 17 members of the committee on the Plaintiffs' map? there anybody else that would like to discuss the 18 19 Plaintiffs' -- yeah. 20 Senator Figures? 21 SENATOR FIGURES: Thank you, 22 Mr. Chairman. I just wanted to say that I am honored 23 to be the sponsor of that map, and we'll introduce it
- 25 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Okay. Thank you.

on Monday.

- 1 No other comments on that matter?
- Now, if the clerk will please put the
- 3 Hatcher Remedial Congressional Plan 1 on the board.
- 4 Yes, Representative Almond?
- 5 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: I'm a little
- 6 slow. But I do have one question about the VRA
- 7 Plaintiffs' remedial map. Which groups support this
- 8 plan?
- 9 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: That's the
- 10 plaintiffs. I don't think any of the plaintiffs
- 11 left, have they? I see you. I'm sorry.
- 12 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: So is it only
- 13 the Milligan plaintiffs --
- 14 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: -- y'all experts
- 15 have drawn, correct? Your attorneys and experts --
- 16 well, I'm sorry. Mr. Ellis was blocking you.
- 17 MR. ROSS: I can answer your question.
- 18 What was it?
- 19 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: My question is
- 20 who supports this plan? Is it just the plaintiffs or
- 21 do you have other groups?
- 22 MR. ROSS: The Milligan plaintiffs and
- 23 the Caster plaintiffs support the plan. You heard
- 24 folks from the audience, including my client, the
- 25 president of the Alabama NAACP spoke. I heard the

- 1 president of the Legal Women Voters speak. I heard
- 2 Commissioner Tyson speak. So there's a number of
- 3 groups and individuals who are supportive of the
- 4 plan. My clients are the one who brought this case
- 5 and the Caster plaintiffs. Those are the plaintiffs
- 6 who have won so far.
- 7 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: Thank you.
- 8 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Any more
- 9 questions for members of the committee while we have
- 10 the attorney here?
- Thank you so much.
- MR. ROSS: Thank you.
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: We're ready to
- 14 move on. Let's move to the next map please, which
- 15 will be Hatcher Remedial Plan 1.
- The Chair recognizes Dr. Joe Reed.
- 17 Thank you, Dr. Reed, for being here.
- 18 DR. REED: Thank you for receiving me,
- 19 sir. I'll get straight to the point. First, let me
- 20 thank you for taking time to hear us out, and I hope
- 21 it's meaningful. A few things I call to your
- 22 attention. There are three names I like to put
- 23 before you, going to ask you to do what they did.
- One is Lister Hill Proctor, a former senator from
- 25 Talladega. Jimmy Clobb, a former Speaker of the

- 1 House from Barbour County. And John Teague, a former
- 2 senator from Talladega. I want you to do what they
- 3 did. What did they do? They put Alabama first.
- 4 They put Alabama first.
- 5 We were doing reapportionment plans
- 6 back in 1980, and John Teague and Proctor were in the
- 7 same county, Talladega County, but they were two
- 8 different districts. At that time, we were trying to
- 9 put ties together. And those guys met. They knew
- 10 one of them was going to fall through the political
- 11 process, but they agreed to support a reapportionment
- 12 plan that put them in the same district. Because we
- were trying to put all the counties back together.
- 14 They said they wanted to put Alabama first.
- 15 A few years later, Jimmy Clobb, and
- 16 most of you remember him --
- 17 (Technical difficulties.)
- 18 DR. LEE: -- the reapportionment plan.
- 19 He said he was tired by the federal government having
- 20 to do what Alabama ought the do. Jimmy Clobb's
- 21 talking now -- be surprising me too, yeah.
- 22 We talked and put the plans together.
- 23 If you go back, you are going to find a court case on
- 24 it at that time. What did he do? He pulled it
- 25 together, told Jimmy Evans to come over, said we've

- gotten together, we got a plan that fair to blacks, and it was. It's a plan fair to white, it was. And
- 3 he told Jimmy Evans, former Attorney General, he said
- 4 go and tell that judge that we are together and that
- 5 he had to be with us.
- 6 You know how Jimmy Clobb talks, well,
- 7 it was conveyed to the judge that we had a settlement
- 8 and we had one. That ended it. We put it together.
- 9 We had more blacks in the Legislature and the House
- 10 and in the Senate. I want to remind you -- something
- 11 else another Alabamian said, he said that, today as
- 12 an American, what he likes is constitutional, what he
- 13 dislikes is unconstitutional.
- 14 So the average Legislature -- if your
- 15 district is a good district. If it doesn't fit it --
- 16 it be kind of strange. The point I'm making, is that
- 17 -- I'm not going to spend a lot of time rehashing the
- 18 history. We know that there will be two majority
- 19 black districts. I believe that -- of the committee
- 20 and other members are you committed, ought to get
- 21 together with the plaintiffs, and let's get this
- 22 matter settled. Why spend all this time when the end
- 23 results going to be -- this is going to be a results
- 24 tests when it's all over. There will be two majority
- 25 black districts.

- 2 of the one that I drafted because it's right.
- 3 Because it's right. It is right. This is 48th year.
- 4 I've been drawing reapportionment plans for 48 years.
- 5 I'm an old man now. And I look forward to the day,
- 6 as Judge Johnson said in 1980, when the citizens of
- 7 Alabama can come together and draw a plan itself.
- 8 Now, there will be a plan and that will be two
- 9 majority black districts. Whether we put them
- 10 together as Alabamians or whether we let some
- "outside expert" come in and draw a plan and give it
- 12 to us. And we still got that to abide by. That's
- 13 all I'm going to say.
- 14 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you, Mr.
- 15 Reed. I have a question for you.
- DR. REED: And I thank you for
- 17 listening to me. Let's get together and put the plan
- 18 together.
- 19 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I have a couple
- 20 questions on the Hatcher. How many counties are
- 21 broken in this plan?
- DR. REED: My plan?
- 23 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes.
- DR. REED: Eight.
- 25 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Eight?

```
1
                   DR. REED: All of north Alabama is in
 2
     good shape. And let me just say one little thing, I
 3
     saw one plan where a lot the economy was broken and
     it should not be broken. It doesn't have to be.
 4
 5
                   COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Okay. How many
 6
     voting precincts are broken in this plan?
                              How many what, sir?
7
                   DR. REED:
                   COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Voting precincts.
8
9
                    DR. REED: Oh, when I draw
     reapportionment plan, I count people, not precincts.
10
     Because precincts vary from -- depends on what you
11
12
     want. They county commission may want one kind,
     Legislature may want another kind. Basically, it's
13
14
     people. And all the district lines are together --
15
     and the people -- are you talking about plus or
16
     minus?
17
                   COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE:
                                        Yep.
18
                   DR. LEE:
                              Zero.
19
                   COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: You got ten
     counties split. You have 87 voting precincts split,
20
21
     and you've got --your deviation are higher than zero.
                    DR. LEE: One of them is a deviation.
22
23
     I can tell you exactly why it's deviated. It was
24
     question whether we were going to break Morgan
```

County. We're going to break Morgan County. We

- 1 broke Morgan County to get to one person, one vote --
- 2 District 5 is very compact. We broke Morgan County.
- 3 We got a couple of them we did not break. We could
- 4 have broken Blount County and Jefferson. We did not
- 5 break that because of 42 people.
- And we figured it was easier and
- 7 better. That should be a footnote in this plan here.
- 8 It should've been better to keep it as it is, really,
- 9 rather trying to get the 42 people so that Jefferson
- 10 County have to set up another voting place. All of
- 11 those splits, necessary splits, for constitutional or
- 12 statory purposes. Because the -- to one person, one
- 13 vote, what we call necessary splits. The other ones
- 14 are statutory to comply with Section 2 of the Voting
- 15 Rights Acts. They all, what we call necessary
- 16 splits, not -- splits. But they are there and their
- 17 explanation for it and -- we did at one time have
- 18 another time, but the Court thought it was all right.
- 19 We don't know what this Court is going to thing
- 20 because you got different judges.
- COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: You're okay with
- 22 it not achieving de minimis deviations? The other
- 23 plans are zero deviations and yours is not. So
- 24 you're okay --
- DR. REED: Now, some plans are zero

- 1 deviation, and we can be zero deviation if we break
- 2 more counties. But 42 people shift to say from
- 3 Blount County to Jefferson County is not enough for
- 4 Jefferson County is not enough for Jefferson County
- 5 to -- another preset. And that is very minus. If
- 6 this was a plus or minus one plan, we wouldn't have
- 7 the problem. Plus or minus five, we wouldn't have a
- 8 problem.
- 9 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: You broke ten
- 10 counties and broke 87 voting precincts.
- DR. REED: What's that?
- 12 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: You broke ten
- 13 counties and broke 87 voting precincts.
- 14 DR. REED: Yeah. And all of them,
- 15 what we call necessary splits.
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Did you pair any
- incumbents together in this plan?
- DR. REED: One, you ain't got to.
- 19 Well, you don't really have to. It depends on what
- 20 -- wants to be. If an incumbent wants to be any
- 21 black majority district and this would have done in
- 22 the Mobile in the second congressional district
- 23 areas. That's what that would have been. If that
- 24 person want to be in a majority black district, you
- 25 can either make that change.

- 1 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I know where
- 2 Mr. Carl lives.
- 3 DR. REED: The bottom list is if you
- 4 don't put him in a majority black district, you got
- 5 -- two incumbents together --
- 6 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: And which
- 7 incumbents did you pair together in your plan?
- B DR. LEE: As far as I recall, it's
- 9 first district and the second district. That's
- 10 Mobile and Coffee County. But the first and second
- 11 district.
- 12 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: You did not care
- 13 to represent Congresswoman Sewell and Congressman
- 14 Palmer together?
- DR. LEE: Who's that?
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Sewell and
- 17 Palmer?
- DR. LEE: I don't think so.
- 19 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: So you did not
- 20 pair those two together?
- DR. LEE: No, sir -- I was just double
- 22 checking with my assistants here. No. They're not
- 23 together. One is in Hoover, and one is in
- 24 Birmingham. They in different districts altogether.
- 25 This plan does not have a crooked stuff, sliders fast

- 1 balls, curves, anything. It's an old plan designed
- 2 for two things. That's as clean as I can be with
- 3 you.
- 4 This plan is to get two majority black
- 5 districts, not close, two majority black districts.
- 6 That's all. Not trying to trick the Republicans. I
- 7 -- there's going to be five white districts, and
- 8 they're all going to be Republicans. Now, how they
- 9 come out, I have no fight with anybody, not trying to
- 10 make one. We're trying to get two majority black
- 11 districts. That's all we're trying to get.
- 12 Let me say one other thing about
- 13 Mobile. Mobile got a hundred and some thousand black
- 14 folks to put Mobile with Baldwin County, and the
- 15 first congressional district is ridiculous. Because
- 16 you done killed every one of those black voters,
- 17 because they're not going to win anything, darling,
- 18 as long as they are in that first congressional
- 19 district. That's how it voted.
- 20 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Senator Figures?
- 21 Yes?
- 22 SENATOR FIGURES: Thank you, Mr.
- 23 Chairman.
- Dr. Reed, with all due respect, and I
- 25 know you have done so much with drawing maps over the

- 1 years. But with this many split precincts, that's a
- 2 big problem for us and other elections, even when
- 3 it's just a few split precincts. And you're talking
- 4 about 87, you're talking about chaos at its highest.
- DR. REED: Let me say this about
- 6 precincts: You're going to have to split them
- 7 anyway -- county commission districts. You got to
- 8 split them. There's no such thing -- city council.
- 9 You're going to have to split those districts again.
- 10 Right now in Mobile right now throwing district lines
- 11 for city council. You're going to have to split
- 12 those districts again. One thing that y'all will
- 13 have, and I'll tell you. Anytime you draw city
- 14 council districts, county commission districts,
- 15 legislative districts, school board districts, all of
- 16 those will impact a precinct. All of them. There's
- 17 no such thing as a precinct being sacred.
- 18 SENATOR FIGURES: But we definitely
- 19 need to focus on these districts in the congressional
- 20 --
- 21 (Cross-talk.)
- 22 SENATOR FIGURES: We are -- that vote.
- 23 Get that to see.
- DR. REED: It does not matter,
- 25 Senator. I can promise you it don't matter.

- 1 SENATOR FIGURES: I won't argue with
- 2 you, Dr. Reed. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- 3 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you,
- 4 Senator. Does anybody else have a question of the
- 5 Hatcher Remedial Congressional Plan?
- 6 We have several people signed up to
- 7 speak on it. Thank you, Dr. Reed. Please stay with
- 8 us unless something else comes up.
- 9 The Chair now recognizes Richard
- 10 Williams from Montgomery.
- MR. WILLIAMS: I want to share with
- 12 you that I'm a Methodist and I signed up on the wrong
- 13 paper. My expectation was to sign up on the general
- 14 paper, and I do believe the amount of papers in the
- 15 process maybe because it was paper, and I'm a
- 16 millennial that I needed a tech to be able to press a
- 17 button. But if it would be your pleasure, I would
- 18 really love to give general comments to this, if it
- 19 would be allowed.
- 20 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: That'll be fine.
- 21 Thank you so much.
- 22 MR. WILLIAMS: My name is Richard
- 23 Williams. I live in Montgomery, Alabama, where I
- 24 made the biggest purchase of my life in purchasing a
- 25 home. I also serve as a pastor Metropolitan United

```
1
     Methodist Church, but these views are mine. Psalms
 2
     37: 27 and 29, "For those who follow the gospel,
     since turn from evil and do good, then you will dwell
 3
     in the land forever. For the Lord loves the just and
 4
 5
     will not forsake his faithful ones. Wrongdoers will
 6
     be completely destroyed. The offspring of the wicked
     will perish. The righteous will inherit the land and
7
8
     dwell in it forever."
9
                    Clearly, this is a polarizing issue,
     and I know that many decisions have already been
10
     made, but I do believe that God still has a way of
11
12
     waking us up in the morning and allowing us to lie
     down in the evening. Thank you for allowing me for
13
14
     this opportunity to share with you as we embark on
     the importance task of redrawing Alabama's
15
16
     congressional maps. I urge each of you to keep in
17
     mind of the fundamental principles that I think you
18
     believe, that all young folks and persons of seasons
19
     as yourselves should hold near and dear to your
     hearts, fairness, representation, and inclusivity.
20
21
                    It is our duty to ensure that all
     voices are heard and that the diverse population of
22
23
     this great state are adequately represented in all
24
     that we do. Today, I stand before you as an advocate
```

for inclusion and empowerment for Alabama's black

1 voters and redistricting process. 2 We must recognize the historical context that communities of color including African 3 American citizens have faced significant barriers 4 5 over and over again. Now, is the time for us to be 6 able to rectify what has already been done. I know there are many opinions within this space, and I know 7 8 there are those that you must go home and have 9 conversation with. That's a political reality that 10 we must all deal with, but I do believe that there is a God that will allow you to wake you to wake up in 11 12 the morning and that will give you the strength to 13 make bold decisions that are not just based on party 14 lines and not just based on your comfort for an 15 election. 16 I do believe that you can create a 17 congressional map that gives voice to Alabama's black voters and a means of insuring that communities are 18 19 not fractured or even diluted. I do believe that there is way because of these minds that you have, 20 21 that have been given to you that there is a real way that the democracy can exist, where all are able to 22 23 have voice and representation. And I also believe that because you were elected, and you were given the 24

responsibility to be able to serve not just those who

- 1 fund, but also the ones that you represent. We will
- 2 make it happen.
- In conclusion, I am implore each and
- 4 everyone of you to approach this redistricting
- 5 process with a commitment to justice and equality,
- 6 and the wellbeing of Alabama residents. We are
- 7 thankful for the plaintiffs that have served and done
- 8 the work. Now, it's your turn to stand up.
- 9 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Amen.
- I like to hear you preach on Sunday.
- 11 The Chair now recognizes Tammie Smith from Birmingham
- 12 to speak on the Hatcher Remedial Congressional Plan.
- 13 Going once, going twice.
- 14 The Chair now recognizes Ron Jackson
- 15 from Birmingham to speak on the -- he spoke? Well --
- 16 okay.
- 17 And the last is -- I can't tell if
- 18 it's Felix Dawn from Montgomery. F-E -- okay. Fine.
- DR. LEE: I just want to thank you
- 20 very much. And, Mr. Chairman and members of the
- 21 committee, I think all of y'all ought to pay
- 22 attention what I'm about to say. All precincts are
- 23 realigned after reapportion -- all of them are
- 24 realigned. There's no such thing as a precinct
- 25 standing in the way of reapportionment. You do it at

- 1 the county level, you do it at the city council
- 2 level. You do it all over the county, and all of our
- 3 counties must be realigned. And you got to realign
- 4 precincts the same way.
- 5 Often times, when you realize what was
- 6 in one district last time around going to be in
- 7 another district this time around. The same thing in
- 8 the Legislature. So I want to make the committee
- 9 mindful of that fight. Precinct lines don't make the
- 10 voters. The voters make the precinct. That's very
- 11 much you need to know that. And again, I want to
- 12 say you get necessary splits.
- I want to point out one other thing to
- 14 you and that is, if you're to going have majority
- 15 black districts, you're going to where black people
- 16 are. You got to go where the black people are. And
- 17 what we did in this plan, we followed some things,
- 18 you already set as Legislatures. The State Board of
- 19 Education district, run from Montgomery, where, to
- 20 Mobile, District 5. We couldn't count it piece by
- 21 piece, but we couldn't count it county by county, but
- 22 we followed it tremendously in many, many respects.
- So that happens and that's what we
- 24 call communities of interests, tradition -- we follow
- 25 all of that. But the splits we have are necessary

```
1 splits. If you don't want to split it all, you're
```

- 2 not going to get the numbers we have. And I think as
- 3 far as I can tell, our numbers -- we have some reason
- 4 for chance, a good chance of electing two blacks,
- 5 Montgomery, Mobile. That's the same quarter that we
- 6 use in State Board District Number 5, and we
- 7 compacted some of it.
- 8 I think -- we started really doing
- 9 District 5 first in Huntsville. It was just so
- 10 compact. We put it right together. I talked to
- 11 people in Lauderdale County. I went up there two
- weeks ago to conduct some hearings. And the people
- 13 up there don't want Lauderdale County split. You
- 14 don't have to split it because nobody want that kind
- of split -- but fundamentally -- more particular
- 16 about the issues on the precinct lines that is very
- 17 crucial. They all have to be redrawn when you
- 18 reapportion, whether you're at the congressional
- 19 level or whether you're at the council level.
- 20 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you,
- 21 Mr. Reed. I can assure you in the ten county splits
- you have, I can find people that can disagree about
- 23 having their county split. I like to analyze the 87
- voting precincts. Did you vote -- those 87
- 25 precincts, did y'all split those along racial lines?

```
1 Were y'all looking for African Americans when you
```

- 2 split those voting precincts and pull them in one
- 3 district to the other?
- DR. REED: I keep saying, we looking
- 5 for people --
- 6 CHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Were you looking
- 7 for African American --
- B DR. REED: -- no, no. I'm not going
- 9 to say that. If anybody tell you draw two black
- 10 districts and that you weren't looking for blacks,
- 11 they lying to you. Anybody else is lying who said
- 12 they weren't looking for them. Just like your
- district, the one you're in now. In all due respect,
- 14 you look for people help you get elected when you --
- 15 everybody in here wanted districts to help them. And
- 16 I'm not going to sit here and tell you and I'm not
- 17 going to even tell the Court that we didn't look for
- 18 blacks to get black folks in the district. We surely
- 19 did.
- 20 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: You drew on
- 21 racial lines then?
- 22 DR. REED: Not on the racial lines,
- 23 because that would have been 100 percent black, but
- 24 the bottom line is, we did look for communities of
- interests, the same thing when you put District 5

- 1 together. I'm talking about the Legislature. You
- 2 put District 5 together, you put Mobile and
- 3 Montgomery together.
- 4 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: You do remember
- 5 in 2017 a federal court told us that we split too
- 6 many voting precincts --
- 7 DR. REED: Because I ask them not to
- 8 do it.
- 9 COCHAIRMAN: You formed that lawsuit
- 10 saying we can't split voting precincts along racial
- 11 lines.
- DR. REED: District 26 --
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: It wasn't that
- 14 long. The Court told that we couldn't split voting
- 15 precincts along racial lines. And you won.
- 16 DR. REED: You the Chairman of the
- 17 Committee, but I'm going to debate you one way or the
- other because you're the Chairman of the Committee --
- 19 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: In 2017 --
- 20 DR. REED: When Jimmy Clark and I sat
- 21 down and put it together, back in 1990, we put blacks
- in the district. You can't put blacks in a district
- 23 without putting blacks in a district. You can't put
- 24 whites in a district without putting whites in a
- 25 district. And anybody tell you -- anybody in this

- 1 committee -- we drew it in a blind.
- 2 Lady Liberty had all of these --
- 3 blindfolds on her head. It was done. That was not
- 4 done. It's never been done. You never done it here.
- 5 Since 1975, I've been drawing reapportion plans and
- 6 never been done. The drafter who drafts the plan,
- 7 has something in mind. And finally --
- 8 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: This is his plan.
- 9 I'm going to yield to him. I have a lot of respect
- 10 for him.
- DR. REED: When the Supreme Court says
- 12 go back and draw some districts, what do they mean?
- 13 They are going to find some black folks to put in
- 14 these districts. That's what that meant.
- 15 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Let me ask this,
- one more question. You did pair more members of
- 17 congress together? You put congressman from the
- 18 first and second in the same district?
- DR. REED: If so, we didn't know that.
- 20 We missed where they were located.
- 21 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: All right. Thank
- 22 you so much. Do we have any more questions on this
- 23 plan at all? Okay.
- I'm trying to be fair and give
- 25 everybody time to --

```
Now, we'll put up CLC Map 1.
```

- The Chair now calls Deuel Ross from
- 3 DC.
- 4 Senator Singleton?
- 5 SENATOR SINGLETON: I'll be very
- 6 brief. I won't hardly take the three minutes because
- 7 we'll put it in the record. The CLC map basically
- 8 draws two districts. One, keeping Jefferson County
- 9 whole, and we're keeping community interest of the
- 10 Black Belt whole. And when you look at -- we have
- 11 split there in Tuscaloosa, that splits Tuscaloosa,
- 12 and you get a small split down in Elmore County.
- 13 This is a -- District 6 with
- 14 56.3 percent of African-Americans. And District 7 is
- 15 59.13 percent. I'm sorry. 59.19 percent
- 16 African-American and the other one -- in Democrats.
- 17 And the other one is 56 percent democratic leaning.
- 18 And we have a black population that shows District 7,
- 19 a majority black population, another majority black
- 20 population in the District 6 is going to be right at
- 21 49.83 percent.
- 22 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Do any members of
- 23 the committee have a question? Anybody from the
- 24 audience have a question?
- 25 Yes, ma'am. Please come forward and

- 1 state your name in the microphone. Some people that
- 2 are watching online.
- 3 MS. JACKSON: Yes. Latetia Daniels
- 4 Jackson, on of the Milligan plaintiffs. I was just
- 5 wanting to know why did you have CLC Milligan on this
- 6 map because it's not a Milligan map.
- 7 SENATOR SINGLETON: It's not a
- 8 Milligan map. No, it's not.
- 9 MS. JACKSON: So that's an error?
- 10 SENATOR SINGLETON: That's an error.
- MS. JACKSON: Okay. Thank you for the
- 12 record.
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Anybody else?
- 14 (Inaudible.)
- 15 MR. MILLIGAN: Campaign Legal Center.
- 16 Evan Milligan, Montgomery, Alabama. I also wanted to
- 17 note that Campaign Legal Center wrote a letter, I
- 18 believe, stating that they no longer support this
- 19 matter.
- 20 SENATOR SINGLETON: We're fine with
- 21 that. Again, we are utilizing this map and the
- 22 Campaign Legal Center gave us the right to utilize
- 23 this map. We also have a letter rebutting some of
- 24 that statement he just made from Campaign Legal
- 25 Center.

- 1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Repeat your
- 2 percentages.
- 3 (Inaudible.)
- 4 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: That is true,
- 5 Dr. Reed. You do not have to reside in your
- 6 congressional district to be elected in it. 180 days
- 7 after your election, you must establish a residency
- 8 in that district. But to get elected in it, you do
- 9 not have to reside in it. You are absolutely
- 10 correct. And you can move into the district one day,
- and you are a resident of that congressional district
- 12 and have the legal right to run.
- 13 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: We don't have
- 14 a copy of the letter that was referenced, I don't
- 15 believe, do we --
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I'm listening.
- 17 Yes, ma'am.
- 18 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: The letter
- 19 that Mr. Milligan referenced, we don't have a copy of
- 20 that, do we?
- 21 SENATOR SINGLETON: It came last week
- 22 some time.
- 23 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yeah. I believe
- 24 this is the letter that the -- yes. I believe this
- is the letter here. It should be on your maps. "On

- 1 behalf of the Plaintiffs Milligan, et al, Allen, we
- 2 write to provide additional information related to
- 3 the VRA Plaintiffs' remedial plan" -- I'm trying to
- 4 scan through all this legal fees. I'm sorry.
- 5 "Counsel for the Singleton plaintiffs
- 6 spoke out against the VRA Plaintiffs' remedial plan
- 7 and offered a plan found in an amicus brief that the
- 8 Campaign Legal Center filed in support of the VRA
- 9 Plaintiffs in the Supreme Court. According to him,
- 10 the CLC Plan is a viable remedy for the VRA violation
- 11 because it has two "crossover" districts in which
- 12 Black voters do not form the majority but can elect
- 13 preferred candidates."
- 14 Y'all have to understand we're
- 15 swimming in a sea of papers up here. I mean, it's
- 16 flying. As an additional matter, CLC has not
- 17 proposed -- I'm looking at it. Deuel, it's you. And
- 18 Davin Rosborough. Okay. And that's where you are
- 19 saying you do not support this plan, correct?
- 20 Okay. That's -- ladies and gentlemen,
- 21 that plan is the July 11th, 2023, letter. It should
- 22 be in your packet somewhere.
- Yes, sir. Mr. Milligan?
- MR. MILLIGAN: Yes, sir. The Campaign
- 25 Legal Center drafted a letter for the Legislature

- 1 committee on reapportionment. It was dated June 30th
- 2 of this year. I'll just read the first two
- 3 paragraphs. "Dear Reapportionment Committee Members,
- 4 Campaign Legal Center is a nonparty or CLC is a
- 5 nonparty nonprofit organization committed to advance
- 6 democracy through law. We write this letter to
- 7 provide context for the committee's consideration and
- 8 crafting a remedial plan to correct the existing
- 9 congressional plan violation of Section 2 of the
- 10 Voting Rights Act.
- A map derived from a brief written by
- 12 CLC has been proposed by some as a potential remedial
- 13 plan, but the committee must understand the context
- 14 in which that plan arose. Additionally, we wish to
- dispute the claim the VRA Plaintiffs' map may be
- 16 unconstitutional." The letter is five pages long. I
- 17 believe they submitted it to you, but I can text this
- 18 to Ms. Overton.
- 19 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: We do have
- 20 that, yes. I didn't realize it.
- 21 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Okay. I think I
- 22 have my plan mislabeled. Senator Smitherman, I think
- 23 we're ready to move on to your plan, but I have it
- listed as Singleton Congressional Plan 3. That's
- going to be Senator Smitherman's plan.

- 1 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Yes, sir. That's
- 2 the one I'm offering.
- 3 SENATOR FIGURES: Mr. Chairman?
- 4 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes, ma'am,
- 5 Senator Figures?
- 6 SENATOR FIGURES: Let it be noted that
- 7 I can add much information to the VRA plan, but I
- 8 think the Plaintiffs did a wonderful job in
- 9 explaining it. So in the interest of time, I won't
- 10 read out mine.
- 11 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: We're going to
- 12 put all that in the record. All the letters and the
- 13 correspondence back and forth will be a part of the
- 14 plan.
- 15 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Are you ready?
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I'm ready.
- 17 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Oh, okay. I was
- 18 waiting on you to give me the green light. Thank you
- 19 very much.
- As you can see on the map that is
- 21 Singleton Plan 3. I want to share some preliminary
- 22 information prior to going into it. Mr. Chairman,
- 23 the information is going to be in part that's part of
- 24 the packet. In our packet that we received today as
- 25 it relates to that plan. I was going to ask that it

- 1 would be made part of our public hearing today and
- 2 the record thereof. So if that's the case, I will
- 3 request that -- I'll give it back to you with my name
- 4 on it, where as you see fit.
- 5 My name is Roger Smitherman. I
- 6 represent District 18. I can't set -- for accuracy
- 7 about how long my colleagues have been on
- 8 reapportionment, but I came into Alabama Legislature
- 9 in 1994. And I've been on the reapportionment
- 10 committee everyday of my life, ever since I've been
- 11 on the Legislature. I think -- I said that for a
- 12 simple reason. I don't say that -- expert and
- 13 everything. There ain't many people sitting in here
- 14 that I have more knowledge over 29 years, than I do.
- 15 So I want to say that first.
- Secondly, I want to say by profession,
- 17 I'm an attorney. Been one before I even came into
- 18 the Legislature.
- I will share some information with you
- 20 in part -- the letter that's part of our packets, but
- 21 for the people who do not have a packet like ours or
- 22 may not have this letter. I'm going to share this
- 23 information and put it into the record. We're
- 24 talking about the Singleton Plan Number 3 -- and by
- 25 the way this last leg, I would say regarding this.

- 1 If you look on the list of the Plaintiffs in the
- 2 Singleton case, you'll see Senator Singleton name,
- 3 Number 1. And you'll see my name Number 2. I'm the
- 4 main plaintiff on -- to try to get adequate
- 5 representation in the state of Alabama for
- 6 minorities.
- 7 "Counsel suggest that we have no role
- 8 to play in proceedings to remedy the Voting Rights
- 9 Act violation affirmed by the Supreme Court, because
- 10 the District Court deferred ruling on the Singleton
- 11 Plaintiffs' claim that the 2021 enacted Congressional
- 12 plan is an unconstitutional racial gerrymander. That
- 13 is incorrect. As the Alabama Attorney General keeps
- 14 reminding us, trial on the merits is still pending,
- and it may be necessary to decide the Singleton claim
- in order to enter final judgment. Singleton remains
- 17 consolidated with Milligan and Caster." " Singleton
- 18 remains consolidated with Milligan and Caster."
- 19 And I state that twice because it has
- 20 been stated it does not involve where we are now.
- 21 The courts put them together.
- 22 "And Paragraph 5 of the District
- 23 Court's order entered June 20, 2023, says 'any set of
- 24 Plaintiffs' may object to the remedial plan enacted
- 25 by the Legislature."

```
1
                    Any set of Plaintiffs -- and right
 2
          "The question before the Legislature is whether
     a remedial plan that splits Jefferson County and
 3
     Mobile County along racial lines complies with both
 4
 5
     the Voting Rights Act and the Constitution."
 6
                    Now, let me say this: As we people
     talk about the qualifications up here. I just
7
8
     haven't' had the opportunity to teach constitutional
 9
     law to seniors in law school for 25 straight years.
10
     I'm not saying anybody know -- I don't know it better
     than anybody in here, there ain't nobody in here that
11
     knows the Constitution better than I do. I know as
12
     good as you do. I'm not saying I know it better than
13
14
     you. I'm guaranteeing you don't know it better than
15
     I do.
16
                    "The District Court's opinion says:
17
     The Legislature retains 'flexibility' in their work,
     subject to the rule that a 'district drawn in order
18
19
     to satisfy § 2 must not subordinate traditional
     districting principles to race substantially more
20
21
     than is reasonably necessary to avoid § 2 liability.'
22
                    At the hearing on June 27, I told the
23
     Reapportionment Committee that the Singleton
     plaintiffs support plans that do not split Jefferson
24
25
     County, specifically, Singleton plan no. 3 and the
```

- 1 Campaign Legal Center (CLC) plan no. 1. They show
- 2 that it is not necessary to draw districts along
- 3 racial lines in order to provide two "opportunity"
- 4 districts, i.e., districts in which Black voters have
- 5 a realistic opportunity to elect candidates of their
- 6 choice."
- 7 And let me share this: Is that -- the
- 8 district that I represent from '94 to now, and I
- 9 stand to be corrected by our reapportionment
- 10 committee, but the voting population is only, to my
- 11 knowledge, has been more African-American. Also, I
- want to share with everybody in here, and I stand
- 13 corrected by the experts, that's our reapportionment
- office had something like maybe 45 or 46 percent
- 15 African-American vote, yet I think at our last two
- 16 elections we elected nine African-American females to
- 17 serve in district judgeships.
- That's what we were talking about,
- 19 democratic votes. That's what we were talking about
- 20 opportunity districts.
- "Counsel for the Milligan and Caster
- 22 Plaintiffs contend that "the CLC Plan is not a viable
- 23 remedy for the VRA violation because it does not
- 24 provide Black voters with a sufficient opportunity to
- 25 elect their preferred candidates." That is

- 1 incorrect. We have provided you and the Milligan and
- 2 Caster Plaintiffs spreadsheets showing that, based on
- 3 statewide elections going back to 2012, CLC Districts
- 4 6 and 7 consistently elect candidates favored by
- 5 Black voters. Enclosed with this letter is a summary
- 6 of those results.
- 7 But legal issues aside, there are
- 8 reasons why the CLC plan, which is a modification of
- 9 Singleton 3, is good for all Alabama citizens. The
- 10 two most important communities of interest in this
- 11 state are the Black Belt and Jefferson County. CLC
- 12 plan Number 1 places all of the majority-Black Black
- 13 Belt counties except Barbour County, in one
- 14 district."
- The significance of that is simply
- 16 this: I heard somebody get up here, and I'm not
- 17 going to single them out to have them come back and
- 18 explain it. But I sat right here and heard them talk
- 19 about how the assets of the funds come into a certain
- 20 area. But yet, that area does not have a an
- 21 opportunity to take advantage of it. And that's
- 22 true.
- So many times in these split districts
- 24 that there are organizations or entities that put all
- 25 these black voters in for the number, but yet that

- 1 money never get over there because it stays in that
- 2 particular area. This gives the Black Belt a chance
- 3 to bring all their resources straight into the Black
- 4 Belt. And I said that with a lot of strength and
- 5 vigor and vitality. And I don't represent the Black
- 6 Belt. I care about everybody in this state, but I
- 7 definitely care about those resources being
- 8 concentrated in that complete area of the Black Belt.
- 9 So that they can enjoy the economic fruits that we've
- 10 enjoyed in so many other areas in our state.
- 11 And it keeps Jefferson County whole.
- 12 Jefferson County has developed more biracial
- 13 electoral correlations in any other Alabama county.
- 14 This is a trend that should be celebrated and
- 15 encouraged. Most people don't know this: Jefferson
- 16 County is the -- prod example of this state. We --
- 17 close to the majority of the Latino community, of the
- 18 Jewish community, of the Greek community. We have
- 19 the majority of most of our communities who pull
- 20 together, who pull together, not on racial lines.
- 21 Pulled together on issue lines. And the same thing
- 22 with candidates.
- "Moreover, CLC plan no. 1 preserves
- 24 the Gulf Coast community of interest." I just heard
- 25 about what was going to happen in the Gulf Coast

- 1 interest and being split. This map preserves that
- 2 entrance.
- "We urge the Legislature to adopt a
- 4 plan that keeps Jefferson County whole." Jefferson
- 5 County you heard people get up here and say that
- 6 we've been used as a pawn to satisfy all other
- 7 districts. With the sacrifice and the risk to the
- 8 county itself because we don't have a one voice and
- 9 one interests as it relates to this county. The
- 10 population will sustain a congressional district.
- 11 It's the largest county in the state of Alabama.
- 12 "The following table shows the results
- 13 of previous statewide races in Congressional
- 14 Districts 6 and 7 of the proposed Singleton 3 Plan
- 15 and CLC 1 Plan. For each race -- "
- In the 2012 presidential race with
- 17 President Obama and the candidate, I think, it was --
- 18 Romney -- the democratic voting percentages was 53.2
- 19 in District 6 as it stands. And 55.7 in District 7.
- 20 In 2014, Governor's race was Governor Bentley.
- 21 District 6 as it stands up there voted 50.3 Democrat.
- 22 And the District 7 voted 53.5 Democrat.
- In the 2014 Lieutenant Governor's
- 24 Race -- in 2014 Auditor's race, you had Joseph and
- 25 Ziegler, and it voted 50.5 in 6 and 53.6 in

- 1 Democratic in 7. The presidential race in 2016 with
- 2 President Clinton and President Trump -- not
- 3 President Clinton but Hilary Clinton and Trump.
- 4 District 6 voted Democratically, 53.6. And district
- 5 53.9.
- In the senate race with Crumpton as a
- 7 Democratic and Shelby as a Republican. The
- 8 democratic in favor voted in that race was 52
- 9 percent, and 62.5 in 7. In the Senate race with
- 10 Jones and Moore. In District 6 as it's comprised on
- 11 that map. It voted Democratic 68.8 percent in the
- 12 District 6 and voted Democratic 65.4 percent in
- 13 District 7.
- 14 In the Governor's race, with Maddox as
- 15 a Democratic and Governor Ivey as a Republican,
- 16 District 6 voted 58.7 percent Democrat, District 7
- 17 voted 56 percent Democrat.
- 18 In the Lieutenant race with Boyd as a
- 19 Democrat and Ainsworth as a Republican --
- 20 (Zoom cut out/technical difficulties.)
- I'm not here to criticize any other
- 22 areas. But I will say this: You look past the votes
- 23 that are African-American votes, and you look at the
- 24 percentage of people who are willing to vote
- 25 independently and openly, who are not

- 1 African-American. And I think that you would find
- 2 that there is a serious lacking in just about every
- 3 where in this state, but in Jefferson County in that
- 4 area of the state. The figures don't lie. They
- 5 speak for themselves.
- In closing, Mr. Chairman, I want to
- 7 say that I fully support the Plan Number 3, and I
- 8 also support the Senator Singleton's CL -- CLC Plan.
- 9 And I support any plan that's going to provide us the
- 10 opportunity to have representation in Washington.
- 11 And I also support any plan that's going to keep
- 12 Jefferson County whole. We're tired of being the
- 13 split -- the surplus of everybody else around the
- 14 state when we have -- particular in that area, 1.2
- 15 million people in our Metropolitan area.
- Just as it was said up here earlier,
- 17 we are definitely economic engine of the state. If
- 18 you look at gasoline taxes, we provide 25 percent or
- 19 more of the taxes for the whole state -- highways.
- 20 We do in that one county. And as much, we have
- 21 unique issues, and we need to have our county held
- 22 together and not our issues five or six different
- 23 districts that don't have an interest whatsoever --
- 24 as well.
- 25 Also the fact that this map has zero

- 1 -- I want everybody to hear that. Zero deviation.
- 2 You can't get a better deviation on any map that's
- 3 out there. No one person, not 1.29, not 2.8, but
- 4 zero deviation. And it keeps 99 -- I say 97 percent
- of our counties whole, and that's part of the
- 6 constitution of interest -- myself being lead
- 7 Plaintiff that case to the Supreme Court. Because
- 8 the Constitution must take into consideration that
- 9 you have to do everything that's possible to keep
- 10 your counties whole.
- 11 So I thank you, Mr. Chairman for
- 12 allowing me that opportunity. And at the proper
- 13 time, I'd like to offer that information to be a part
- of the permanent record.
- 15 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: If you would sign
- that and give it to me, I'll put it in the permanent
- 17 record.
- 18 Let me just read this email that came
- 19 in. "As a livelong citizen of Florence Alabama, I
- 20 would like the new map to keep Lauderdale County
- 21 whole in the same district. The current map splits
- 22 Lauderdale County into 2 different districts and it
- 23 led to confusion for St Florian voters. Sincerly,
- 24 River Alyxander Zurinsky."
- Now, the Chair recognizes Senator

- 1 Figures for some comments and then we're going go to
- 2 Representative Jones.
- 3 SENATOR FIGURES: Thank you,
- 4 Mr. Chairman. As sponsor of the VRA Plaintiffs'
- 5 remedial plan, I would like to spread on the record
- 6 the following: "The Remedial Plan offered by the VRA
- 7 Plaintiffs in the Milligan and Caster litigation has
- 8 three key features.
- 9 Number one: The VRA Plaintiffs'
- 10 remedial plan creates two majority-Black districts
- 11 that will remedy the Voting Rights Act violation by
- 12 ensuring that Black voters can consistently elect
- 13 candidates of choice in those districts and fixing
- 14 the cracking of the Black Belt.
- One district, Congressional District
- 16 7, is very similar to existing Congressional District
- 17 7, CD7 is currently Alabama's sole majority-Black
- 18 district. CD7 has existed in this form since a prior
- 19 round of Voting Rights Act litigation in the 1990s.
- 20 CD7 keeps Birmingham together with the western Black
- 21 Belt counties, including Dallas County.
- The second remedial district,
- 23 Congressional District 2, unites the remainder of the
- 24 Black Belt counties and connects them to the city of
- 25 Mobile. In the 2021 plan, those Black Belt counties

- 1 are split among multiple congressional districts,
- 2 weakening the voice of the Alabamians who live there
- 3 and diluting their votes.
- 4 The VRA Plaintiffs' plan puts that
- 5 community back together. CD2 includes all of
- 6 Montgomery County, which has been split among two or
- 7 even three districts in recent decades. The VRA
- 8 Plaintiffs' plan unites all of the 18 traditional
- 9 Black Belt counties are in the two majority Black
- 10 districts in the Plaintiffs' plan, and doesn't split
- any of those counties Those counties are Barbour,
- 12 Bullock, Butler, Choctaw, Crenshaw, Dallas, Greene,
- 13 Hale, Lowndes, Macon, Marengo, Montgomery, Perry,
- 14 Pickens, Pike, Russell, Sumter, and Wilcox.
- Number two: The VRA Plaintiffs plan
- is not vulnerable to a constitutional challenge. The
- 17 VRA Plaintiffs' plan is very similar to the plans
- 18 approved by the three-judge District Court and the
- 19 U.S. Supreme Court as constitutionally acceptable
- 20 remedies for the Voting Rights Act violation. The
- 21 VRA Plaintiffs' plan is the only plan which has
- 22 already been evaluated in a similar form by both
- 23 District Court and the Supreme Court. Both of those
- 24 courts and found the VRA Plaintiffs plans in the
- litigation were not drawn using race as the

- 1 predominant factor in a way that would be
- 2 constitutionally unacceptable.
- 3 The courts also found the VRA
- 4 Plaintiffs plans were reasonably configured, as they
- 5 were similar to or better than the legislature's plan
- 6 in complying with traditional districting principles.
- 7 The VRA Plaintiffs' plan has the strongest defense
- 8 against any argument that the plan either uses race
- 9 in an unconstitutional manner or doesn't comply with
- 10 the VRA. This cannot be said of any other plan that
- 11 has been introduced.
- 12 Number three: As much as possible,
- 13 Plaintiffs' plan makes minimal or no changes to other
- 14 districts in the 2021 plan enacted by the
- 15 legislature. It maintains CD 4 and CD 5, exactly as
- the Legislature drew them in 2021. Those two
- 17 districts stretch across the north of the state,
- 18 north and south of the Tennessee River. It makes as
- 19 minimal change as possible to CD 6 and CD 3 in the
- 20 center and east side of the state.
- Some changes were necessary there to
- 22 allow for the remedial districts to be created, but
- 23 the changes are minimal. Those changes include
- 24 adding Autauga County to CD6 and adding Elmore County
- to CD3, and removing Russell and Macon Counties from

- 1 CD3. Only CD 1 and CD 2 are significantly
- 2 reconfigured to allow for the creation of a second
- 3 majority-Black district as required by the Supreme
- 4 Court.
- 5 Demographics and performance: The
- 6 three-judge court instructed that 'As the Legislature
- 7 considers [remedial] plans, it should be mindful of
- 8 the practical reality, based on the ample evidence of
- 9 intensely racially polarized voting adduced during
- 10 the preliminary injunction proceedings, that any
- 11 remedial plan will need to include two districts in
- which Black voters either comprise a voting-age
- 13 majority or something quite close to it.'
- 14 Milligan v. Merrill, 582 F. Supp. 3d,
- the VRA Plaintiffs' plan complies with the Court's
- 16 instructions CD2 is: 51 percent Black Citizen Voting
- 17 Age Population. CD2 would also have an about 5
- 18 percent other minority population. And a 44 percent
- white citizen voting age population. 52% of the
- 20 registered voters are Black according to the
- 21 Secretary of State's voter registration records.
- 22 CD7 is 56 percent Black Citizen Voting
- 23 Age Population. 58 percent of the registered voters
- 24 are Black. The two majority Black districts will
- 25 give Black voters in those districts the ability to

- 1 elect their candidates of choice. In statewide
- 2 elections from 2014 through 2020 that the VRA
- 3 Plaintiffs' expert witnesses in the litigation
- 4 analyzed Black candidates carried these districts,
- 5 even though they lost at the statewide level
- 6 background.
- 7 In November 2021, two groups of
- 8 plaintiffs, the Milligan Plaintiffs and the Caster
- 9 Plaintiffs, sued to stop the implementation of the
- 10 congressional map the legislature passed and the
- 11 governor signed. The lawsuits claimed that the
- 12 legislature's map violated Section 2 of the Voting
- 13 Rights Act by failing to create a second
- 14 majority-Black district. Two courts, the Supreme
- 15 Court and the federal court in the Northern District
- of Alabama have now agreed with the Plaintiffs. They
- found that the map passed by the legislature in
- 18 November 2021 dilutes the votes of Black Alabamians,
- 19 violating Section 2.
- The legislature has been given the
- 21 first opportunity to correct that historic wrong
- 22 itself, if either: One, the legislature fails to act
- or two, the map the legislature adopts does not
- 24 completely remedy the violation of the Voting Rights
- 25 Act. The federal court will take over the process

- 1 and impose a map of its own. The legislature will
- lose control of the map-drawing process. The
- 3 separate Singleton Plaintiffs and their lawsuit has
- 4 not been successful."
- 5 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- 6 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you,
- 7 Senator. If you'll give those to me, I'll make sure
- 8 they are entered into the record of the committee.
- 9 The Chair now recognize a gentleman,
- 10 Mr. Jones from Mobile.
- 11 REPRESENTATIVE JONES: Thank you,
- 12 Mr. Chairman. We've actually had presentation on
- 13 four different maps today, and I believe that they
- 14 all were toured remedy of the Court's ruling. There
- 15 have been different approaches to different things,
- 16 different goals. And I think that's fine. I really
- 17 appreciate all the information we've gotten today.
- 18 The one thing that concerns me though,
- 19 there are some maps that we have nothing on. We
- 20 don't know what's being proposed. And we go into
- 21 session on Monday, I'm very concerned about that.
- 22 While we talked about all the facts that we have and
- 23 the data that's been submitted. There is data that
- 24 has not been submitted. And I would really hope that
- 25 we could get that data before we get to the floor.

```
1
                    Because where we are at this point, we
 2
     have actually seen Plaintiff maps, three other maps,
 3
     and we've heard the arguments, which I think are very
     good arguments. Some argued for not splitting
 4
 5
     counties, some argued for precincts, some argued for
 6
     different things, all headed to one remedy.
     thing that concerns me, though, is rather than we're
7
8
     going to get something that's completely different
 9
     from everything we've seen here. That's what really
10
     -- it should concern all of us, who is sitting on
     this committee because we've been here two meetings,
11
12
     we've had a lot of information presented. I don't
13
     know how much information we can get presented now
14
     and Monday.
15
                    So, Mr. Chairman and Cochair, if you
16
     would, please address for us the process of being
17
     thoroughly informed on the other maps that's going to
     come before us. And the committee map also.
18
19
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE:
                                         Thank you,
                Again, I like to remind everybody that we
20
     Mr. Jones.
21
     have been pretty much overwhelmed with maps coming
22
          Today, we have finally adopted a set of
23
     quidelines that the committee can use to draw maps.
     We're going take those guidelines and we're going to
24
```

take the input we got today. We're going to take the

```
1 input that's come in through the Internet. I like --
```

- We just discussed this: We're going
- 3 to have a meeting 10:00 a.m. to look at a map. We've
- 4 been looking at all these maps and analyzed, want to
- 5 hear what people had to say, what members of the
- 6 committee, so.
- 7 Expect us to have something on Monday
- 8 morning. We'll get it to you as soon as we can. But
- 9 Monday we will have a meeting.
- 10 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: Does that mean
- 11 that when you say, we don't have a map, does that
- mean we, not y'all, we as a collective body will have
- 13 a map?
- 14 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: There will be a
- map for this committee to vote on. Yes.
- 16 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: And so will we
- 17 at that -- before the map is provided -- when is that
- 18 opportunity for those of us that are sitting around
- 19 as members of the committee having an opportunity to
- 20 participate to get something --
- 21 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: As soon as I get
- 22 something, I'm going to send it to you. I want to
- 23 get something out, but it's just hard trying to
- 24 justify to put a map out before we finished taking
- 25 input from the public.

```
1 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: My question is,
```

- 2 I think the point has been made several times here.
- 3 Is that we want to be collectively be a part of
- 4 whatever that process is, and when -- tomorrow is
- 5 Friday, and we're scheduled to be here on Monday. So
- 6 when you're talking about putting a map together, you
- 7 all as Chair we'll put the map together, or we as a
- 8 committee will have input in that process. What does
- 9 that look like? I understand the being overwhelmed,
- 10 but we also know that we had this deadline.
- 11 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: In this very
- 12 compress time frame that we've been working under,
- 13 less than 21 days, we've been doing everything that
- 14 we can. We're going to release a map on what we've
- 15 gathered here today, the input from everybody. We
- 16 will send it to members of the committee as soon as
- 17 possible as soon as we get our analyzes of the maps
- and the numbers together, and then Monday at
- 19 10:00 o'clock, we'll get here to vote. And everyone
- 20 will have an input to vote.
- 21 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: Mr. Chair?
- 22 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes. Let me get
- 23 -- Mr. Smitherman?
- MR. SMITHERMAN: Thank you,
- 25 Mr. Chairman. I'm want to kind of get a -- a clear

- 1 picture, you know -- put the picture on their walls,
- 2 but I want to give a clear picture. Everything that
- 3 has been presented here today, has been presented in
- 4 the courts, but also by individuals, whether it be
- 5 Legislatures, whether it be citizens.
- 6 This map that we're talking about
- 7 having from the committee should be done by -- how
- 8 many people we got in here? 21? All 21 of us,
- 9 because there is no more individuals drafting a map
- 10 and presentations. Usually, if you can follow where
- 11 I'm headed. Even the preparation what is going to be
- 12 sent to us, we ought to be involved in it. Because
- 13 it's not individuals anymore. It's not like the map
- 14 I put up there that we're going to get it before
- 15 everybody, give everybody a chance to see it, and
- then everybody can think on it and vote on it.
- 17 The body of committee as one has all
- 18 these branches up here. And these branches have to
- 19 be connected in the work to present what the body is
- 20 going present, whether we present to our own selves,
- 21 them, or are other colleagues. So I'm kind of
- 22 following up what Representative Jones saying, but
- 23 I'm going more in depth.
- 24 When will we, because I don't want to
- 25 seem like I'm self-centered my own self, have an

```
1 opportunity through the continuing of the process to
```

- 2 get the documents ready to be presented going to be
- 3 involved, whether it be by Zoom, whether -- I don't
- 4 know -- whether it's Zoom, whether -- whether or -- I
- 5 think that -- I'm suggesting the work that's why
- 6 y'all get paid the big bucks as chairmen, but you all
- 7 got to sit down and come together on how you all are
- 8 going to pull that off because that has to be done
- 9 because this is the committee.
- 10 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I understand.
- 11 Agree with you totally. We've spent so much time
- 12 analyzing these maps before us and trying the analyze
- 13 the other maps that have been sent in. To pull
- 14 together the information, look at them, and analyze
- them see what's good and what's bad about them. As
- soon as we have something, we're going to release
- 17 them to you. I'm not trying keep anything hidden.
- 18 I'm just trying to get something to you as fast
- 19 possible.
- 20 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: I don't think you
- 21 are. I'm going to repeat what you just said. You
- 22 said we're going --
- 23 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: The attorney --
- 24 (Cross-talk.)
- 25 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Even if -- I'm

- 1 skipping what I'm saying and picking up what you just
- 2 said, even if the attorneys do what you saying they
- 3 going to do, those are our attorneys. They ain't no
- 4 parties' attorney. They're the committee's attorney.
- 5 As that attorney go through that work, I think I'm
- 6 hearing -- the input, what he filed and everything
- 7 else. We don't want to wait until Monday, 10:00
- 8 o'clock. If anybody is privy to add information, I'm
- 9 saying all of us should be privy at request, at
- 10 least.
- Now, can somebody respond to that for
- 12 me?
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Again, as soon as
- I can get something to you, I'm going to get it to
- you as far as possible. I'm working under a horrible
- 16 time crunch here, and it's --
- 17 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Let me help you
- 18 out --
- 19 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: And just adopt
- 20 your plan?
- 21 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: I understand what
- 22 you're saying -- ain't nobody trying to pressure you
- 23 or push you, I'm saying -- when that drip hit, I want
- 24 the drip. That's all I'm saying. I don't want you
- 25 to wake and the bucket fill up on Monday, here is a

```
1 bucket of water -- we're looking at this, saying we
```

- 2 got to move this. I want to know anything about
- 3 moving, I don't know where to move the --
- 4 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: That's the reason
- 5 I want to get something to you so that you can have
- 6 input on it.
- 7 Representative England?
- 8 REPRESENTATIVE ENGLAND: Thank you for
- 9 the recognition. Just being completely honest, this
- 10 is a really tortured process. And like, when I heard
- 11 you speaking about we're going to -- after the public
- 12 hearing is over, after the open meeting requirements
- are met, then we're going to go back in a room by
- 14 ourselves, draw a map, and then give it to you. And
- 15 by the time we -- whatever meeting we're having at
- 16 10:00 o'clock, you're going to hand us a map and say
- 17 vote on it. And unfortunately, by 10:00 o'clock, the
- only maps -- I'm just going to speak frankly here.
- 19 This process is to be open and transparent when the
- 20 map that we're all going voting on, wasn't done
- 21 transparently in the open.
- 22 And again, what I'm frustrated about
- is, you said it before. I'm not trying to say
- 24 anything about -- it's just the process. From the
- very beginning, it's been an us versus y'all sort of

1 thing. Because everybody else has been presenting 2 the maps that they believe best represents the State 3 of Alabama, give everybody a change represented, but the super majority has not. And ultimately -- I went 4 5 to school, and I majored in political science because 6 I don't do math. But in simple mathematics to know 7 that there are a lot more Republicans than Democrats 8 in the Legislator, and ultimately, your will be done. 9 If -- and you also mentioned something about the rules, the guidelines, that's going to be 10 quided principle on what you do so you didn't know 11 12 what the guidelines are going to look at before you designed or drew these new maps. But we're using the 13 14 same guidelines from 2021, and there was no illusions -- when I came into this and anybody came into this 15 16 room, we're going to amend those today. So it's very 17 disingenuous to me to suggest that those rules and us 18 adopting those rules prevented you from producing a 19 map when everybody across the world in New Zealand, Australia, and everywhere was able to produce a map 20 21 for us to at least get a look at. 22 Again, I just want to go on record 23 that this process, while giving the appearance of 24 being open and transparent is everything but. When

we vote on this map on Tuesday, I'm going to be

```
1
     obligated to vote against it because I don't have --
 2
     there's nothing to share with my constituents.
     There's nothing to know if it's compliant. One of
 3
     the rules -- one of the rules or one of the
 4
 5
     guidelines or amendments that we proposed required
 6
     some analysis of it. But when are we going to do
7
     that if the tamp is the first day of session?
8
                    So when are we going to get any
 9
     independent analysis to see if it remotely satisfies
10
     the Voting Rights Acts? Or if any percentages of the
     splits or whatever you come up with is compliant?
11
12
     again, it's just the general observation about the
     process, and what it's producing, but the way that
13
14
     this is going to end up is going to shut everybody
     out but the Republicans and the Legislatures and
15
16
     that's what going to eventually end up with a map
17
     that only the majority approved because everybody
     wasn't involved in the process. That's all I got.
18
19
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I like to point
     out, the reapportionment process is a bill. Every
20
21
     member of the Legislature has a right to introduce a
     bill. Every member of this committee can go to LSA
22
23
     and produce a map and introduce as their own bill.
     It's nothing that would preclude you from introducing
24
```

a competing bill in the process, and it can come on

```
1 the floor for a vote. I'm not denying you that
```

- 2 right.
- 3 So if you have a bill you would like
- 4 to produce, senators or whoever who wants to sponsor
- 5 bill, is more than welcome to sponsor a competing
- 6 bill.
- 7 REPRESENTATIVE ENGLAND: Just for a
- 8 point, though, the map that's coming is reported to
- 9 come from the committee, so I, and I know several
- 10 others, we're not likely to be involved in the
- 11 process that produces the map that comes from the
- 12 actual committee. So sure we're all free to
- introduce maps, but the ones you're going to see from
- 14 y'all, are the ones who have invented by the entire
- 15 public, had an opportunity to look at and actually
- 16 engage us on.
- No body is going to have an
- 18 opportunity to engage us on the map that's going to
- 19 be produced when the actual session started. We
- 20 don't do even do regular legislation in the regular
- 21 session that way, especially, with something as much
- jeopardy as attached as a new congressional map.
- 23 COCHAIRMAN: The 22 members of this
- 24 committee will be the first people who receive the
- 25 map, and you will get it as fast as I can possibly

```
1 humanly get it to you.
```

- 2 REPRESENTATIVE ENGLAND: But the point
- 3 I'm trying to make is, no one else in the state of
- 4 Alabama is going to be able to come here and address
- 5 the committee about that matter before we vote on it
- 6 and that's just unfortunate.
- 7 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: The public
- 8 hearing is -- Representative Almond?
- 9 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: Sorry. I have
- 10 a totally different question, and I'm sure I'm not
- 11 reading this correctly. But when I look at the --
- what's title CLC Map 1 and Singleton Congressional
- 13 Plan 3, and I look at Jefferson County 6, and I see
- 14 the population down there, and then I go over to the
- 15 Singleton Map 6 and we add three counties, and it
- says it's basically the same. I guess my question
- is, how could that be?
- 18 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Yes. Senator
- 19 Singleton?
- 20 SENATOR SINGLETON: What you see is
- 21 CLC, it bleeds over into Shelby just a little bit and
- 22 takes up almost 30-some thousand odd people. That
- 23 30-some thousand odd people in the Singleton makes up
- 24 those other three counties. That's why you see the
- 25 numbers are basically the same.

- 1 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: So the CLC Map
- 2 1 --
- 3 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: It bleeds into
- 4 Shelby just a little bit.
- 5 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: Okay. Just
- 6 behind that little faint line?
- 7 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Makes up about
- 8 30 thousand people in Shelby.
- 9 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: So that makes
- 10 up for the other three entire counties?
- 11 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Those three other
- 12 counties. Perry, Hill, and Bibb, yep.
- 13 REPRESENTATIVE ALMOND: Okay. Thank
- 14 you.
- 15 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: The Chair now
- 16 recognizes Dorman Walker for closing statements --
- 17 Senator Bell has one quick question.
- 18 SENATOR BELL: On your Singleton
- 19 Congressional Map 3 talking about Jefferson County
- 20 whole, it could be just the ink on my paper. It
- looks like four comes in on the top part of Jefferson
- 22 County a little bit.
- 23 SENATOR SMITHERMAN: Just a very, very
- 24 little of it. Your ink is right.
- 25 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: A few thousand

```
1
     and 551 will pull it out -- in deviation --
 2
                    SENATOR BELL: I was, like, whoa, my
 3
     crayon went over the line.
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Now, the Chair
 4
 5
     now recognizes Dorman Walker for closing statements.
 6
                    MR. WALKER: Thank you, Chairman
     Pringle and Chairman Livingston and members of the
7
8
     committee -- I'm sorry. Can you hear me now?
9
                    Okay. I don't really have a closing
     statement. I do have some exhibits that I wanted to
10
     and was asked to put into the record. I got Exhibits
11
12
     A through S here. It'll take me a few minutes to go
     through each one is, or at your pleasure, I can put
13
14
     them as a group A through S and then give an index of
     that to the court reporter. Tell me which way you
15
16
     want me to proceed. Generally, these are exhibits
17
     that support the concept of community of interest
     based on the Gulf.
18
19
                    And there are -- there are four sets
20
     of these exhibits available for review by committee
21
     members in the reapportionment office in the big
     redistricting theater. And I recommend that you go
22
23
     by and look at them and see what they are so that you
     can see what the evidence is of a community of
24
```

interest there. So do you want me to identify these

```
one by one or just put them in as a group?
```

- 2 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: I think we can
- 3 take them as a group. Is that okay?
- 4 MR. WALKER: Okay. I'll give you an
- 5 index --
- 6 I'll put them in one by one. Exhibit
- 7 A is the Alabama Port Authority 2021 Economic Impact
- 8 Statement, dated October 2022. Exhibit B is the
- 9 Alabama State Port Authority Annual Compressive
- 10 Financial Report For Fiscal Years Ended
- 11 September 30th, 2022 and 2021. Exhibit C is a brief
- 12 history of USA, University of South Alabama. Exhibit
- D is a statement from a publication called Lagniappe
- 14 about it's coverage area. Exhibit E is a
- December 2022 article from Lagniappe, Mobile titled
- 16 "ALDOT says new bridge and Bayway are 'financially
- 17 viable.'" Exhibit F is an article from Al.com,
- 18 entitled, "Redistricting Alabama: How South Alabama
- 19 could be split up due to Baldwin County's growth."
- 20 Exhibit G is a scheduled for what's called, BRATS,
- 21 the Baldwin Regional Area Transit System, which shows
- 22 trip provided by BRATS to and from Mobile and Baldwin
- 23 County.
- 24 Exhibit H is an publication by BRATS,
- 25 called, "Baylinc Connects Mobile-Baldwin County

- 1 Public Transit Systems." Exhibit I is an Al.com
- 2 articled called, Business: Making connections with
- 3 public transit system. Exhibit J is the homepage
- 4 from the South Alabama Regional Planning Commission
- 5 website. Exhibit K is the identification of the
- 6 board of directors for the South Alabama Regional
- 7 Planning Commission.
- 8 Exhibit L is a list of the
- 9 jurisdictions that belong to the Alabama Regional
- 10 Planning Commission. Exhibit M is the 2022
- 11 Comprehensive Development Strategy adopted by the
- 12 South Alabama Regional Planning Commission. Exhibit
- 13 N is the testimony of former Representative Byrne
- 14 that he gave at the preliminary injunction hearing in
- 15 this case. Exhibit M is the deposition of Bradley
- 16 Byrne --
- 17 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: Sorry. You said
- 18 2022 that M was the economic development article and
- 19 that N was the testimony from former Representative
- 20 Byrne and --
- MR. WALKER: You know what? I have
- 22 some mislabeled. So M is 2022 2022 Comprehensive
- 23 Development Strategy adopted by the South Alabama
- 24 Regional Planning Commission. And what we'll call
- 25 M.1 is the deposition of Congressman Bradley Byrne

- 1 given in the Chestnut case. And N is the testimony
- 2 of Bradley Byrne at the preliminary injunction of
- 3 this case.
- 4 O is the deposition of former
- 5 Representative Josiah Bonner in the Chestnut case.
- 6 Again, testifying about the Mobile Bay community of
- 7 interest. And then I have three more, a few more
- 8 exhibits. Exhibit P is a letter from Mr. Blacksher
- 9 that I've been asked to read into the record.
- 10 Exhibit T is a memorandum --
- 11 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: Are you saying P
- 12 or a T?
- MR. WALKER: T as in tango.
- 14 REPRESENTATIVE HALL: So you skipped
- 15 Q, R, and S?
- MR. WALKER: Yes, I did. They may
- 17 have been pulled. Exhibit T as tango is from Craig
- 18 For, Etowah County Mayor's Association, Etowah County
- 19 Commission Chairman to the members of the committee
- 20 about keeping their area together. Exhibit R, as in
- 21 Romeo, is a letter from the Attorney General that
- 22 I've been asked to read. Exhibit S, as in Sierra, is
- 23 some talking points from the Mobile Chamber of
- 24 Commerce about the importance of the Mobile/Baldwin
- 25 County community of interest.

```
1
                    So I had three letters to read into
 2
     the records. One of those is from Mr. Ross, who
 3
     represented the lead attorney for the Milligan
     Plaintiffs and because he was here, I gave him that
 4
 5
     letter to put into the record, which he did. I have
 6
     a letter from Mr. Blacksher, the lead attorney for
     the Singleton Plaintiffs, and I have a letter from
7
8
     the Attorney General, who I think can fairly be
 9
     described as the lead attorney for the defendants.
10
     And I like to read those into the record, if I may.
                    I'll start with the letter from
11
12
     Mr. Blacksher. "Counsel suggest that we have no role
     to play in proceedings to remedy the Voting Rights
13
14
     Act violation affirmed by the Supreme Court, because
     the District Court deferred ruling on the Singleton
15
16
     Plaintiffs' claim that the 2021 enacted Congressional
17
     plan is an unconstitutional racial gerrymander. That
     is incorrect. As the Alabama Attorney General keeps
18
19
     reminding us, trial on the merits is still pending,
20
     and it may be necessary to decide the Singleton claim
21
     in order to enter final judgment. Singleton remains
     consolidated with Milligan and Caster, and paragraph
22
23
     5 of the District Court's order entered June 20,
     2023, says 'any set of Plaintiffs' may object to the
24
25
     remedial plan enacted by the Legislature.
```

```
1
                    The question before the Legislature is
 2
     whether a remedial plan that splits Jefferson County
 3
     and Mobile County along racial lines complies with
     both the Voting Rights Act and the Constitution.
 4
 5
     District Court's opinion says: The Legislature
 6
     retains 'flexibility' in their work, subject to the
     rule that a district drawn in order to satisfy
7
8
     Section 2 must not subordinate traditional
 9
     districting principles to race substantially more
10
     than is reasonably necessary to avoid Section 2
     liability." Then it cites the Singleton v. Merrill
11
12
     case.
13
                    Next paragraph, "At the hearing on
14
     June 27 I told the Reapportionment Committee that the
     Singleton plaintiffs support plans that do not split
15
16
     Jefferson County, specifically, Singleton Plan Number
17
     3 and the Campaign Legal Center (CLC) Plan Number 1.
     They show that it is not necessary to draw districts
18
19
     along racial lines in order to provide two
20
     'opportunity' districts, i.e., districts in which
21
     Black voters have a realistic opportunity to elect
     candidates of their choice. Counsel for the Milligan
22
     and Caster Plaintiffs contend that "the CLC Plan is
23
     not a viable remedy for the VRA violation because it
24
25
     does not provide Black voters with a sufficient
```

- 1 opportunity to elect their preferred candidates."
- 2 That is incorrect. We have provided you and the
- 3 Milligan and Caster Plaintiffs spreadsheets showing
- 4 that, based on statewide elections going back to
- 5 2012, CLC Districts 6 and 7 consistently elect
- 6 candidates favored by Black voters. Enclosed with
- 7 this letter is a summary of those results.
- 8 But legal issues aside, there are
- 9 reasons why the CLC plan, which is a modification of
- 10 Singleton 3, is good for all Alabama citizens. The
- 11 two most important communities of interest in this
- 12 state are the Black Belt and Jefferson County. CLC
- 13 Plan Number 1 places all of the majority-Black Black
- 14 Belt counties except Barbour County, in one district.
- 15 And it keeps Jefferson County whole. Jefferson
- 16 County has developed more biracial electoral
- 17 coalitions than has any other Alabama county, and
- 18 this is a trend that should be celebrated and
- 19 encouraged. Moreover, CLC plan Number 1 preserves
- 20 the Gulf Coast community of interest just as it is
- 21 drawn in the 2021 plan, as well as District 4 and 5
- 22 in north Alabama.
- We urge the Legislature to adopt a
- 24 plan that keeps Jefferson County and the Black Belt
- 25 whole, if the plan can be supported by evidence that

- 1 it performs to provide Black voters a realistic
- 2 opportunity to elect candidates of their choice.
- 3 Regards, James U. Blacksher."
- 4 And Mr. Blacksher includes a chart
- 5 that reviews election results that have a zero
- 6 deviation and CLC Plan would have performed elections
- 7 ranking to the 2022 Presidential election. I don't
- 8 see how I can meaningful read these to you, but I
- 9 will point out these are available. There are four
- 10 copies of this set of exhibits for you to review and
- 11 the reapportionment office. I think you also have a
- 12 copy of this letter in the package that was --
- 13 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: They're in the
- 14 record already.
- MR. WALKER: I'm sorry?
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: They're offered
- in the record already.
- MR. WALKER: Thank you.
- Next and last, I have the letter I
- 20 received this from the Attorney General. "Dear,
- 21 Mr. Walker, I write to respond to the July 11, 2023
- letter you received from the plaintiffs in Milligan
- v. Allen and Caster v. Allen. Their letter includes
- 24 several questionable representations and others that
- 25 are flat wrong. I write to ensure that the

- 1 Redistricting Committee and Legislature have a fuller
- 2 picture of the facts and law as the Legislature
- 3 considers adopting a new congressional map.
- 4 First, Plaintiff Evan Milligan has
- 5 repeatedly endorsed congressional plans for Alabama
- 6 that contain a percentage of black voting age
- 7 population (BVAP) below 50 percent in every district.
- 8 On September 16, 2021, he and his fellow plaintiff,
- 9 Khadidah Stone, told the Legislature that it should
- 10 adopt a plan introduced by Senator Bobby Singleton
- 11 (the Singleton plan) in which the districts with the
- two highest BVAPs had BVAPS of 40.5 percent and 45.8
- 13 percent, respectively."
- 14 That statement and a number of other
- 15 statements in this letter are footnoted. I'm not
- 16 going to read the footnotes, which tend to be
- 17 technical. But, again, this letter is available for
- 18 your review and you have it in your packages.
- Next, when the Milligan Plaintiffs
- 20 were before the U.S. Supreme Court last year, they
- 21 repeatedly endorsed the Singleton plan. In their
- 22 brief last summer, they were adamant that Alabama did
- 23 not need to create two majority-minority districts to
- 24 remedy the purported violation of Section 2. They
- 25 stated that the "Singleton Plan" was 'one option'

- 1 that kept 'Mobile and Baldwin together, and raised no
- 2 racial predominance concerns.' At oral argument, the
- 3 Milligan Plaintiffs' counsel stated that their
- 4 expert's 'race-blind' maps 'looked very similar to
- 5 the Singleton plan, which allowed for two crossover
- 6 districts where minority voters would have a fair
- 7 chance to elect their candidates of choice in at
- 8 least two districts.'
- 9 Later, he repeated the theme, saying
- 10 that Plaintiffs' maps were not one 'that anyone has
- 11 to adopt. There are maps out there in the Campaign
- 12 Legal Center amicus brief, in the Singleton plan that
- don't require maximization' of BVAP in two districts.
- 14 And to make sure the point wasn't missed he said
- 15 again: 'We'd be satisfied with something like the
- 16 Singleton plan, which Alabama's expert said would
- 17 give black voters at least a fair chance, not even a
- 18 guaranteed chance to elect their candidates of choice
- 19 in the Second District. That's merely what
- 20 plaintiffs are looking for.'
- Now, that they have secured an
- 22 affirmance from the Supreme Court, Plaintiffs are
- 23 looking for much more. They pretend like they never
- 24 endorsed a plan in which the two highest BVAP
- 25 districts were at 40.5 percent and 45.8 percent

```
1
     respectively. They now demand a plan that provides
 2
     not just a 'fair chance' to compete, but instead a
     quarantee of Democratic victories in at least two
 3
     districts. And in service of those goals, they
 4
 5
     misrepresent the nature of the Campaign Legal Center
 6
     (CLC) plans they previously touted. Plaintiffs say
     that 'the CLC Plan has not been proposed or endorsed
7
     as a remedy by' CLC, but the CLC amicus brief stated
8
 9
     clearly that the plans presented in their brief
10
     represented some of Alabama's 'remedial options.'
     Indeed, CLC labeled their maps in their brief as "CLC
11
12
     Remedial Map 1" and "CLC Remedial Map 2" and further
     clarified that 'maps already in the record' including
13
14
     'the Singleton Plan' were 'also available remedial
15
     options.'
16
                    Any assertion that CLC's maps were not
17
     presented as remedial options is demonstrably false.
     Other statements from Plaintiffs earlier in the
18
     litigation are also worth noting. The Milligan
19
20
     Plaintiffs told the District Court that most plans
21
     drawn for Alabama's congressional districts without
     basing lines on race would contain versions of
22
23
     Districts 2 and 7 with less than 40 percent BVAP, and
     that any plan in which any district had 50 percent
24
```

BVAP would be an 'outlier.' They further argued that

- 1 if one district had a BVAP of 50 percent, one would
- 2 expect the district with the second highest BVAP in
- 3 that map to have around 34.5 percent BVAP, and
- 4 certainly nothing as high as 40 percent. Yet now
- 5 they demand that Alabama adopt a plan with two
- 6 'outlier' districts.
- 7 Thus, as Jim Blacksher, counsel for
- 8 Senator Singleton, explained at the recent
- 9 Reapportionment Committee hearing, the Milligan and
- 10 Caster Plaintiffs' plans use race in a way that
- 11 likely violates the Constitution. He's right.
- 12 Plaintiffs' maps sacrifice neutral principles
- including compactness and maintaining the
- 14 long-recognized community of interest in the Gulf in
- 15 favor of race.
- The Milligan and Caster Plaintiffs
- 17 respond that the Supreme Court rejected the argument
- 18 that their plans are race-based. That's not true.
- 19 Only four Justices, not a majority, found that on the
- 20 limited record before the District Court, the Caster
- 21 Plaintiffs' mapdrawer did not cross the line from
- 22 mere consciousness of race to predominantly using
- 23 race. But five Justices did not endorse this view.
- 24 Justice Kavanaugh declined to join that portion of
- 25 Chief Justice Roberts's opinion and four justices

```
1
     expressly rejected it. As Justice Thomas explained,
 2
     'the plurality entirely ignore[d]' evidence that the
     Milligan Plaintiffs' mapdrawer used race
 3
     predominantly 'presumably because her own explanation
 4
 5
     of her method sounds too much like textbook racial
 6
     predominance. 'The plurality thus affirm[ed] the
     District Court's finding only in part and with regard
7
8
     to' Caster's mapdrawers' 'plans alone,' but his maps
 9
     are materially 'indistinguishable from [the Milligan
     maps], and it is those very design features that
10
     would require race to predominate.'
11
12
                    Adopting a plan in which race
     predominates might satisfy the Caster and Milligan
13
14
     Plaintiffs' statutory claim, but it would likely open
     the State up to claims that it has violated the
15
16
     Constitution's Equal Protection Clause. As the
17
     Supreme Court held just two weeks ago when it
     declared Harvard's race-based admissions policy
18
19
     unconstitutional, 'the core purpose of the Equal
     Protection Clause' is 'doing away with all
20
21
     governmentally imposed discrimination based on race.'
                    The Court was adamant: "Eliminating
22
23
     racial discrimination means eliminating all of it."
     It follows, the Court held, that 'race may never be
24
```

used as a 'negative' and that it may not operate as a

- 1 stereotype.' But in Plaintiffs' Proposed Plans,
- 2 voters in Mobile County are divided from voters in
- 3 Mobile City because of their race and because of
- 4 stereotypes about how voters of certain races will
- 5 vote. The 'outright racial balancing' demanded by
- 6 the Caster and Milligan Plaintiffs is 'patently
- 7 unconstitutional.' Neither judges nor Legislatures
- 8 should be in the sordid business of pick[ing] winners
- 9 and losers based on the color of their skin.'
- 10 Thank you for your consideration.
- 11 Sincerely, Steve Marshall, Alabama Attorney General."
- 12 And again, I didn't read the footnotes
- in this. You have the full letter in your file and
- 14 all of these exhibits are available for your review
- in the reapportionment office. Thank you.
- 16 COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you,
- 17 Mr. Walker.
- 18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Mr. Walker, you
- 19 said that they're available in reapportionment
- 20 office?
- MR. WALKER: Yes, sir. There are four
- 22 packages just like this --
- UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We're supposed
- 24 to read those four before Monday? They're available
- 25 for you to look at --

- 1 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No, no. That's
- 2 not the question I asked. Are we expected to read
- 3 all of those before Monday?
- 4 MR. WALKER: If you want to see what
- 5 they say.
- 6 UNIDENTIFIED: Well, obviously
- 7 somebody didn't want us to see what they say, if you
- 8 brought them in today.
- 9 The other thing what is the -- what is
- 10 the purpose of the Attorney General's letter?
- MR. WALKER: I think it speaks for
- 12 itself.
- 13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It doesn't for
- 14 me. I mean, what's the purpose? I think we're
- 15 remanded to the District Court -- was this case
- 16 remanded to the District Court.
- MR. WALKER: It was.
- 18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. And this
- 19 statement that's made in the letter that he wrote is
- that he recant what happened in the Supreme Court?
- 21 We know what happened in the Supreme Court.
- MR. WALKER: Okay.
- UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: My point is, I
- don't understand how we are supposed to make an
- 25 intelligent decision with none of the information and

- 1 to come and bring it here at this, to think that we
- 2 all could review it by then, it's not going to
- 3 happen. I know that, and you know that. It's not
- 4 going to happen. So I'm trying to determine whether
- 5 we're really trying to make a determination on fact
- 6 or are trying to make a determination on data or we
- 7 already made a determination. Those are the things
- 8 I'm trying to determine, you know.
- 9 We sent some up there before. It was
- 10 floored, so the Supreme Court say. I wasn't sitting
- 11 there. It was floored. And now instead of taking
- 12 the time to get the correct information for everybody
- on the committee, it seems to me that we are rushing
- 14 to the end before we should get there. And I'm very
- 15 concerned about that. I brought this up earlier that
- 16 the data that's needed -- I would like to see the
- 17 data as the rest of the plaintiffs, like the maps
- 18 that were submitted and the data with that.
- 19 What other map is going to be drawn?
- 20 We're not going to be able to see all that there. Do
- 21 we have an expert that's going to put that together?
- 22 Those are the things that concern me about this
- process, Mister Cochairs. That's what concerns me.
- 24 And I think -- what will happen today is fair, it
- 25 should have been done that way, they brought us all

```
1
     the information they had, we can digest that.
 2
                    For what we haven't seen yet, I know
     and most of us here know, we're not going to get that
 3
     before it comes time for us to act on it. That's not
 4
 5
     fair at all. It's not fair for me to ask me to act
 6
     on something I know nothing about against something I
7
     have all the data. That's just not fair. I'm not
8
     directing this toward you, I was asking you a
9
     question, but I'm questioning this process as a
     whole. That's all I needed.
10
11
                    COCHAIRMAN PRINGLE: Thank you.
                                                      This
12
     hearing is adjourned.
13
                    (Meeting was adjourned at 5:04 p.m. on
14
                               July 13th, 2023.)
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE
2	STATE OF ALABAMA
3	ETOWAH COUNTY
4	I, Anna Ruffin, Certified Court Reporter and
5	Commissioner for the State of Alabama at Large,
6	hereby certify that on July 13, 2023, the above and
7	foregoing proceeding was taken down by me in
8	stenotype and the questions, answers, and statements
9	thereto were transcribed by means of computer-aided
10	transcription and that the foregoing, page 1 to 157,
11	represents a true and correct transcript of the said
12	proceeding.
13	I further certify that I am neither of
14	counsel, nor of kin to the parties to the action, nor
15	am I in anywise interested in the result of said
16	cause.
17	
18	/s/Anna Ruffin
19	Anna Ruffin, CCR Commissioner for the
20	State of Alabama at Large CCR# 694, Expires 09/30/2023
21	MY COMMISSION EXPIRES: 10/21/24
22	
23	
24	
25	