Filed 2/5/2018 9:33:00 AM Supreme Court Middle District 159 MM 2017

## **OBERMAYER REBMANN MAXWELL & HIPPEL LLP**

Lawrence J. Tabas (PA Attorney ID No. 27815) Rebecca L. Warren (PA Attorney ID No. 63669) Timothy J. Ford (DC Attorney ID No. 1031863), *Pro Hac Vice* Centre Square West 1500 Market Street, Suite 3400 Philadelphia, PA 19102 (215) 665-3000 *Attorneys for Intervenors* 

## IN THE SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

:
:
:
:
:
: Docket No. 159 MM 2017
:
:
:

## Concurrence to Legislative Respondents' <u>Application for Disqualification</u>

For the reasons set forth in the application of Senator Scarnati and

Representative Turzai, the Intervenors<sup>1</sup> believe that Justice Wecht ought to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Brian McCann, Daphne Goggins, Carl Edward Pfeifer, Jr., Michael Baker, Cynthia Ann Robbins, Ginny Steese Richardson, Carol Lynne Ryan, Joel Sears, Kurtes D. Smith, C. Arnold McClure, Karen C. Cahilly, Vicki Lightcap, Wayne Buckwalter, Ann Marshall Pilgreen, Ralph E. Wike, Martin C.D. Morgis, Richard J. Tems, James Taylor, Lisa V. Nancollas, Hugh H. Sides, Mark J. Harris, William P. Eggleston, Jacqueline D. Kulback, Timothy D. Cifelli, Ann M. Dugan, Patricia J. Felix, Scott Uehlinger, Brandon Robert Smith, Glen Beiler, Tegwyn Hughes, Thomas

have disqualified himself from hearing and voting on this case, because, while a judicial candidate, he made public statements committing to rule against the 2011 Congressional Districting Plan. Pa. Rules of Judicial Conduct, §2.11(A)(5). The statements in question are not views Justice Wecht had expressed in published opinions or explanations of the views contained in such opinions. They were his specific views of the 2011 Congressional Districting Plan, made during his 2015 campaign for election to the Pennsylvania Supreme Court, explaining why he believed the Plan was invalid. Justice Wecht failed to disclose his public statements concerning the 2011 Congressional Districting Plan to the litigants, notwithstanding the belief he expressed regarding ethical duties of disclosure to ensure the integrity of the judicial system. See his dissenting opinion in Commonwealth v. Friedenberger, 2014 Pa. Super. Unpub. Lexis 1178. Because he did not voluntarily disqualify himself, Judge Wecht was under a similar duty of disclosure in this case. See Pa. Rules of Judicial Conduct, §2.11(C).

"A judge sworn to decide impartially can offer no forecasts, no hints, for that would show not only disregard for the specifics of the particular case, it would display disdain for the entire judicial process." Opening

Whitehead, David Moylan, Kathleen Bowman, James R. Means, Jr., Barry O. Christenson, Bryan Leib.

Statement of then Judge Ruth Bader Ginsburg to the Senate Judiciary Committee during her Confirmation Hearing, as reported in the New York Times, July 20, 1993, explaining why she would not answer certain of the Committee's questions.

Because the partisan gerrymander claim has already been heard and decided, it is too late for Justice Wecht to disqualify himself from hearing and deciding that claim. However, the Comments to Rule 2.11(A)(5) state, "A judge's obligation not to hear or decide matters in which disqualification is required applies *regardless of whether a motion to disqualify is filed.*" Since Justice Wecht should have disqualified himself, his subsequent consideration of the partisan gerrymander claim necessarily must be invalidated. *See Rohm & Haas Co. v. Continental Casualty Co.*, 732 A.2d 1236, 1260 (Pa.Super. 1999). For failing to disqualify himself when he was required to do so, this Court should invalidate Justice Wecht's vote to overturn the 2011 Congressional Districting Plan. In addition, Justice Wecht should be disqualified from any future proceedings in this case.

WHEREFORE, Intervenors respectfully request the invalidation of Justice Wecht's vote to overturn the 2011 Congressional Districting Plan.

Respectfully submitted,

## **OBERMAYER REBMANN MAXWELL** & HIPPEL LLP

<u>/s/ Lawrence J. Tabas</u> Lawrence J. Tabas, PA I.D. No. 27815 <u>/s/ Rebecca L. Warren</u> Rebecca L. Warren, PA I.D. No. 63669 OBERMAYER REBMANN MAXWELL & HIPPEL LLP Centre Square West 1500 Market Street, Suite 3400 Philadelphia, PA 19102 Phone: 215-665-3158 Email: lawrence.tabas@obermayer.com rebecca.warren@obermayer.com

Date: February 5, 2018