

**IN THE  
SUPREME COURT OF OHIO**

LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF OHIO, *et al.*,

Relators,

v.

OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, *et al.*,

Respondents.

Case No. 2021-1193

Original Action Pursuant to Ohio Const.,  
Art. XI

Apportionment Case

---

BRIA BENNETT, *et al.*,

Relators,

v.

OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, *et al.*,

Respondents.

Case No. 2021-1198

Original Action Pursuant to Ohio Const.,  
Art. XI

Apportionment Case

---

THE OHIO ORGANIZING COLLABORATIVE, *et al.*,

Relators,

v.

OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION, *et al.*,

Respondents.

Case No. 2021-1210

Original Action Pursuant to Ohio Const.,  
Art. XI

Apportionment Case

**MERIT BRIEF OF RESPONDENT THE OHIO REDISTRICTING COMMISSION**

Freda J. Levenson (0045916)  
*Counsel of Record*  
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.  
4506 Chester Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44103  
614.586.1972. x125  
flevenson@acluohio.org

Dave Yost  
Ohio Attorney General

Erik J. Clark (0078732)  
*Counsel of Record*  
Ashley T. Merino (0096853)  
ORGAN LAW LLP  
1330 Dublin Road  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

David J. Carey (0088787)  
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.  
1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203  
Columbus, Ohio 43206  
614.586.1972. x2004  
dcarey@aclu.org

T. Alora Thomas (PHV 22010)  
Julie A. Ebenstein (PHV 25423)  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
125 Broad Street  
New York, New York 10004  
212.519.7866.  
athomas@aclu.org  
jebenstein@aclu.org

Robert D. Fram (PHV 25414-2021)  
Joshua Gonzalez (PHV 25424-2021)  
Juliana Goldrosen (PHV 25193-2021)  
David Denuyl (PHV 25452-2021)  
Donald Brown (PHV 25480-2021)  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
Salesforce Tower  
415 Mission Street, Suite 5400  
San Francisco, California 94105-2533  
415.591.6000  
rfram@cov.com  
JGonzalez@cov.com  
jgoldrosen@cov.com  
ddenuyl@cov.com  
dwbrown@cov.com

Megan C. Keenan (PHV 25410-2021)  
James Smith  
Laura B. Bender (PHV 25192-2021)  
Alexander Thomson (PHV 25462-2021)  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
850 Tenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20001-4956  
202.662.6000  
mkeenan@cov.com  
jmsmith@cov.com  
bbender@cov.com  
ajthomson@cov.com

Madison Arent

614.481.0900  
614.481.0904 (facsimile)  
ejclark@organlegal.com  
amerino@organlegal.com

Special Counsel to Attorney General  
Dave Yost

*Counsel for Respondent The Ohio  
Redistricting Commission*

Dave Yost  
Ohio Attorney General

Bridget C. Coontz (0072919)

*Counsel of Record*

Julie M. Pfeiffer (006762)  
Michael A. Walton (0092201)  
Michael J. Hendershot (0081842)  
OFFICE OF THE OHIO ATTORNEY  
GENERAL  
30 E. Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
614.466.2872  
614.782.7592 (facsimile)  
Bridget.Coontz@OhioAGO.gov  
Julie.Pfeiffer@OhioAGO.gov  
Michael.Walton@OhioAGO.gov  
Michael.Hendershot@OhioAGO.gov

*Counsel for Respondents Ohio Governor  
DeWine, Ohio Secretary of State LaRose,  
and Ohio Auditor Faber*

W. Stuart Dornette (0002955)  
Beth A. Bryan (0082076)  
Philip D. Williamson (0097174)  
TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP  
425 Walnut St., Suite 1800  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-3957  
513.381.2838  
513.381.0205 (facsimile)  
dornette@taftlaw.com  
bryan@taftlaw.com  
pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
The New York Times Building  
620 Eighth Avenue  
New York, New York 10018-1405  
212.841.1000  
marent@cov.com

Anupam Sharma (PHV 25418-2021)  
James Hovard (PHV 25420-2021)  
Yiye Fu (PHV 25419-2021)  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
3000 El Camino Real  
5 Palo Alto, Square, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Palo Alto, California 94306-2112  
650.632.4700  
650.632.4800 (facsimile)  
asharma@cov.com  
jhovard@cov.com  
yfu@cov.com

*Counsel for Relators League of Women Voters  
of Ohio, et al., in Case No. 2012-1193*

Donald J. McTigue (0022849)  
*Counsel of Record*  
Derek S. Clinger (0092075)  
MCTIGUE & COLOMBO LLC  
545 East Town Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
614.263.7000  
614.368.6961 (facsimile)  
dmctigue@electionlawgroup.com  
dclinger@electionlawgroup.com

Aria C. Branch (PHV 25435-2021)  
Jyoti Jasrasaria (PHV 25401-2021)  
Spencer W. Klein (PHV 25432-2021)  
ELIAS LAW GROUP  
10 G St NE, Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20002  
202.968.4490  
202.968.4498 (facsimile)  
abranh@elias.law  
jjasrasaria@elias.law  
sklein@elias.law

Phillip J. Strach (PHV 2544-2021)  
Thomas A. Farr (PHV 25461)  
John E. Branch, III (PHV 25460)  
Alyssa M. Riggins (PHV 25441-2021)  
Greg McGuire (PHV 25483)  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &  
SCARBOROUGH LLP  
4140 Parklake Avenue, Suite 200  
Raleigh, North Carolina 27612  
919.329.3800  
919.329.3799 (facsimile)  
phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com  
tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com  
john.branch@nelsonmullins.com  
alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com  
greg.mcguire@nelsonmullins.com

*Counsel for Respondents Matt Huffman,  
President of the Ohio Senate, and Robert R.  
Cupp, Speaker of the Ohio House of  
Representatives*

Diane Menashe (0070305)  
*Counsel of Record*  
John Gilligan (0024542)  
ICE MILLER LLP  
250 West Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
614.462.6500  
614.222.3468 (facsimile)  
Diane.Menashe@icemiller.com  
John.Gilligan@icemiller.com

*Counsel for Respondents Senator Vernon  
Sykes and House Minority Leader Emilia  
Sykes*

Abha Khanna (PHV 2189-2021)  
William B. Stafford (PHV 25433-2021)  
ELIAS LAW GROUP  
1700 Seventh Ave, Suite 2100  
Seattle, Washington 98101  
206.656.0176  
206.656.0180 (facsimile)  
akhanna@elias.law  
bstafford@elias.law

*Counsel for Relators Bria Bennett, et al., in  
Case No. 2021-1198*

Peter M. Ellis (0070264)  
*Counsel of Record*  
M. Patrick Yingling (PHV 10145-2021)  
Natalie R. Salazar  
REED SMITH LLP  
10 South Wacker Drive, 40th Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
312.207.1000  
312.207.6400 (facsimile)  
pellis@reedsmith.com  
mpyingling@reedsmith.com  
nsalazar@reedsmith.com

Alicia L. Bannon (PHV 25409-2021)  
Yurij Rudensky (PHV 25422-2021)  
Michael Li (PHV 25430-2021)  
Ethan Herenstein (PHV 25429-2021)  
BRENNAN CENTER FOR JUSTICE  
AT NYU SCHOOL OF LAW  
120 Broadway, Suite 1750  
New York, New York 10271  
646.292.8310  
212.463.7308 (facsimile)  
alicia.bannon@nyu.edu  
rudenskyy@brennan.law.nyu.edu  
herensteine@brennan.law.nyu.edu

Ben R. Fliegel (PHV 25411-2021)  
REED SMITH LLP  
355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2900  
Los Angeles, California 90071

213.457.8000  
213.457.8080 (facsimile)  
bfliegel@reedsmith.com

Brad A. Funari (PHV 3139-2021)  
Danielle L. Stewart (0084086)  
REED SMITH LLP  
225 Fifth Avenue  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15222  
412.288.4583  
412.288.3063 (facsimile)  
bfunari@reedsmith.com  
dstewart@reedsmith.com

Brian A. Sutherland (PHV 25406-2021)  
REED SMITH LLP  
101 Second Street, Suite 1800  
San Francisco, California 94105  
415.543.8700  
415.391.8269 (facsimile)  
bsutherland@reedsmith.com

*Counsel for Relators Ohio Organizing  
Collaborative, et al., in Case No. 2021-1210*

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<b>Page</b>
TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....	ii
INTRODUCTION .....	1
STATEMENT.....	1
ARGUMENT.....	1
CONCLUSION.....	1

## **TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

Respondent The Ohio Redistricting Commission adopts and incorporates the Tables of Authorities set forth in (1) the Merit Brief of Respondents Governor Mike DeWine, Secretary of State Frank LaRose, and Auditor Keith Faber; and (2) the Merit Brief of Respondents Senate President Huffman and House Speaker Cupp.

## **INTRODUCTION**

Respondent The Ohio Redistricting Commission adopts and incorporates the introductions, statements of facts, arguments, and conclusions set forth in (1) the Merit Brief of Respondents Governor Mike DeWine, Secretary of State Frank LaRose, and Auditor Keith Faber; and (2) the Merit Brief of Respondents Senate President Huffman and House Speaker Cupp.

## **STATEMENT**

Respondent The Ohio Redistricting Commission adopts and incorporates the statement of facts and background set forth in (1) the Merit Brief of Respondents Governor Mike DeWine, Secretary of State Frank LaRose, and Auditor Keith Faber; and (2) the Merit Brief of Respondents Senate President Huffman and House Speaker Cupp.

## **ARGUMENT**

Respondent The Ohio Redistricting Commission adopts and incorporates the arguments set forth in (1) the Merit Brief of Respondents Governor Mike DeWine, Secretary of State Frank LaRose, and Auditor Keith Faber; and (2) the Merit Brief of Respondents Senate President Huffman and House Speaker Cupp.

## **CONCLUSION**

For the reasons set forth in (1) the Merit Brief of Respondents Governor Mike DeWine, Secretary of State Frank LaRose, and Auditor Keith Faber; and (2) the Merit Brief of Respondents Senate President Huffman and House Speaker Cupp, Respondent The Ohio Redistricting Commission respectfully requests that the Court dismiss the complaints in all three above-captioned cases with prejudice.

Dated: November 5, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

Dave Yost  
Ohio Attorney General

/s Erik J. Clark

Erik J. Clark (0078732)

*Counsel of Record*

Ashley Merino (0096853)

ORGAN LAW LLP

1330 Dublin Road

Columbus, Ohio 43215

614.481.0900

614.481.0904 (facsimile)

ejclark@organlegal.com

amerino@organlegal.com

Special Counsel to Attorney General Dave  
Yost

*Counsel for Respondent The Ohio  
Redistricting Commission*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that on November 5, 2021, a copy of the foregoing was served by electronic mail upon the following:

Freda J. Levenson, Esq.  
*Counsel of Record*  
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.  
4506 Chester Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44103  
614.586.1972. x125  
flevenson@acluohio.org

David J. Carey, Esq.  
ACLU OF OHIO FOUNDATION, INC.  
1108 City Park Avenue, Suite 203  
Columbus, Ohio 43206  
614.586.1972. x2004  
dcarey@aclu.org

Alora Thomas, Esq.  
Julie A. Ebenstein, Esq.  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
125 Broad Street  
New York, New York 10004  
212.519.7866.  
athomas@aclu.org  
jebenstein@aclu.org

Robert D. Fram, Esq.  
Joshua Gonzalez, Esq.  
Juliana Goldrosen, Esq.  
David Denuyl, Esq.  
Donald Brown, Esq.  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
415 Mission Street, Suite 5400  
San Francisco, California 94105-2533  
rfram@cov.com  
JGonzalez@cov.com  
jgoldrosen@cov.com  
ddenuyl@cov.com  
dwbrown@cov.com

Dave Yost  
Ohio Attorney General

Bridget C. Coontz, Esq.  
*Counsel of Record*  
Julie M. Pfeiffer, Esq.  
Michael A. Walton, Esq.  
Michael J. Hendershot, Esq.  
OFFICE OF THE OHIO ATTORNEY  
GENERAL  
30 E. Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
614.466.2872  
614.782.7592 (facsimile)  
Bridget.Coontz@OhioAGO.gov  
Julie.Pfeiffer@OhioAGO.gov  
Michael.Walton@OhioAGO.gov  
Michael.Henderson@OhioAGO.gov

*Counsel for Respondents Ohio Governor  
DeWine, Ohio Secretary of State LaRose,  
and Ohio Auditor Faber*

W. Stuart Dornette, Esq.  
Beth A. Bryan, Esq.  
Philip D. Williamson, Esq.  
TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP  
425 Walnut St., Suite 1800  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-3957  
513.381.2838  
513.381.0205 (facsimile)  
dornette@taftlaw.com  
bryan@taftlaw.com  
pwilliamson@taftlaw.com

Phillip J. Strach, Esq.  
Thomas A. Farr, Esq.  
John E. Branch, III, Esq.  
Alyssa M. Riggins, Esq.

Megan C. Keenan, Esq.  
James Smith, Esq.  
L. Brady Bender, Esq.  
Alexander Thomson, Esq.  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
One CityCenter  
850 Tenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20001-4956  
202.662.6000  
mkeen@cov.com  
jmsmith@cov.com  
bbender@cov.com  
ajthomson@cov.com

Madison Arent, Esq.  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
The New York Times Building  
620 Eighth Avenue  
New York, New York 10018-1405  
212.841.1000  
marent@cov.com

Anupam Sharma, Esq.  
James Hovard, Esq.  
Yiye Fu, Esq.  
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
3000 El Camino Real  
5 Palo Alto, Square, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Palo Alto, California 94306-2112  
650.632.4700  
asharma@cov.com  
jhovard@cov.com  
yfu@cov.com

*Counsel for Relators League of Women Voters  
of Ohio, et al., in Case No. 2021-1193*

Donald J. McTigue, Esq.  
*Counsel of Record*  
Derek S. Clinger, Esq.  
MCTIGUE & COLOMBO LLC  
545 East Town Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
614.263.7000  
614.368.6961 (facsimile)

Greg McGuire, Esq.  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &  
SCARBOROUGH LLP  
4140 Parklake Avenue, Suite 200  
Raleigh, North Carolina 27612  
919.329.3800  
919.329.3799 (facsimile)  
phil.strach@nelsonmullins.com  
tom.farr@nelsonmullins.com  
john.branch@nelsonmullins.com  
alyssa.riggins@nelsonmullins.com  
greg.mcguire@nelsonmullins.com

*Counsel for Respondents Matt Huffman,  
President of the Ohio Senate, and Robert R.  
Cupp, Speaker of the Ohio House of  
Representatives*

Diane Menashe, Esq.  
*Counsel of Record*  
John Gilligan, Esq.  
ICE MILLER LLP  
250 West Street, Suite 700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
614.462.6500  
614.222.3468 (facsimile)  
Diane.Menashe@icemiller.com  
John.Gilligan@icemiller.com

*Counsel for Respondents Senator Vernon  
Sykes and House Minority Leader Emilia  
Sykes*

dmctigue@electionlawgroup.com  
dclinger@electionlawgroup.com

Aria C. Branch, Esq.  
Jyoti Jasrasaria, Esq.  
Spencer W. Klein, Esq.  
ELIAS LAW GROUP  
10 G St NE, Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20002  
202.968.4490  
202.968.4498 (facsimile)  
abranch@elias.law  
jjasrasaria@elias.law  
sklein@elias.law

Abha Khanna, Esq.  
William B. Stafford, Esq.  
ELIAS LAW GROUP  
1700 Seventh Ave, Suite 2100  
Seattle, Washington 98101  
206.656.0176  
206.656.0180 (facsimile)  
akhanna@elias.law  
bstafford@elias.law

*Counsel for Relators Bria Bennett, et al., in  
Case No. 2021-1198*

Peter M. Ellis, Esq.  
*Counsel of Record*  
M. Patrick Yingling, Esq.  
Natalie R. Salazar, Esq.  
REED SMITH LLP  
10 South Wacker Drive, 40th Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
312.207.1000  
312.207.6400 (facsimile)  
pellis@reedsmith.com  
mpyingling@reedsmith.com  
nsalazar@reedsmith.com

Alicia L. Bannon, Esq.  
Yurij Rudensky, Esq.  
Michael Li, Esq.  
Ethan Herenstein, Esq.  
BRENNAN CENTER FOR JUSTICE

AT NYU SCHOOL OF LAW  
120 Broadway, Suite 1750  
New York, New York 10271  
646.292.8310  
212.463.7308 (facsimile)  
alicia.bannon@nyu.edu  
rudenskyy@brennan.law.nyu.edu  
herensteine@brennan.law.nyu.edu

Ben R. Fliegel, Esq.  
REED SMITH LLP  
355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2900  
Los Angeles, California 90071  
213.457.8000  
213.457.8080 (facsimile)  
bfliegel@reedsmith.com

Brad A. Funari, Esq.  
Danielle L. Stewart, Esq.  
REED SMITH LLP  
225 Fifth Avenue  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15222  
412.288.4583  
412.288.3063 (facsimile)  
bfunari@reedsmith.com  
dstewart@reedsmith.com

Brian A. Sutherland, Esq.  
REED SMITH LLP  
101 Second Street, Suite 1800  
San Francisco, California 94105  
415.543.8700  
415.391.8269 (facsimile)  
bsutherland@reedsmith.com

*Counsel for Relators Ohio Organizing  
Collaborative, et al., in Case No. 2021-1210*

/s Erik J. Clark  
*One of the Attorneys for Respondent The  
Ohio Redistricting Commission*