

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

CAROL ANN CARTER; <i>et al.</i> ,)	
)	
Petitioners,)	
)	
v.)	NO. 464 M.D. 2021
)	
VERONICA DEGRAFFENREID; <i>et al.</i> ,)	
)	
Respondents.)	
)	
PHILLIP T. GRESSMAN; <i>et al.</i> ,)	
)	
Petitioners,)	
)	
v.)	NO. 465 M.D. 2021
)	
VERONIC DEGRAFFENREID; <i>et al.</i> ,)	
)	
Respondents.)	

APPLICATION FOR INTERVENTION
OF PENNSYLVANIA SENATORS COLLETT, MUTH, STREET AND WILLIAMS

Pursuant to this Court’s December 22, 2021 Per Curiam Order and Rule of Appellate Procedure 1531(b), Pennsylvania State Senators Maria Collett, Katie J. Muth, Sharif Street, and Anthony H. Williams (collectively “Proposed Intervenors”) seek leave to intervene in the above-referenced matters (“Action”).

The Proposed Intervenors seek to intervene in the Action to protect their constitutional and legislative role in drawing and developing a reapportionment plan in response to the United States’ 2020 census data. In support of its Application for Intervention, the Proposed Intervenors state as follows:

PROPOSED INTERVENORS

1. Maria Collett is a State Senator from the 12th Senatorial District in Montgomery and Bucks Counties. Senator Collett is a member of the State Government Committee of the Pennsylvania Senate. She is also a resident and registered voter in Montgomery County, and a prospective candidate for reelection in 2022.

2. Katie J. Muth is a State Senator from the 44th Senatorial District in Chester, Montgomery, and Berks Counties. She is also a resident and registered voter in Montgomery County, and a prospective candidate for reelection in 2022.

3. Sharif Street is a State Senator from the 3rd Senatorial District in Philadelphia County. He is a resident and registered voter in Philadelphia.

4. Anthony H. Williams is a State Senator from the 8th Senatorial District in Philadelphia and Delaware Counties. He is a resident and registered voter in Philadelphia, a voter, and a prospective candidate for reelection in 2022.

5. Senators Collett, Muth, Street, and Williams are all of the members of the Democratic Party on the State Government Committee of the Pennsylvania Senate. Senator Street serves as the Democratic Chair.

CURRENT ELECTION DEADLINES, PETITIONER'S CLAIMS, AND BASES TO INTERVENE

Constitutional and Legislative Authority

6. As this Court is aware, Article 1, Section 2 of the United State Constitution requires that a census be taken every 10 years for the purpose of apportioning the United States House of Representatives. The Constitution delegates that task to state legislatures. U.S. Const. art. I, § 4 (“The Times, Places and Manner of holding Elections for Senators and Representatives, shall be prescribed in each State by the Legislature thereof.”) (emphasis added). Consistent with

Pennsylvania's constitution, Pennsylvania's congressional districts are drawn by the state legislature as an act, subject to veto by the Governor. Pa. Const. Art. III, § 4, Pa. Const. Art. IV, § 15.

7. As with all acts, the Congressional redistricting plan starts in one house in committee, is finally adopted, moves to the other body where it moves through committee, and eventually, after both bodies concur in language, is presented to the Governor for his signature. If the legislation is vetoed it is, of course, subject to a potential override.

8. In August 2021, the United State Secretary of Commerce delivered census-block results of the 2020 Census to the Pennsylvania Governor and legislative leaders. The census data confirmed that Pennsylvania will be allocated only 17 Members in the next Congress, one fewer than currently allotted. The data was further processed and only in a form that would support commencement of the mapmaking process in late-October 2021.

9. Because of the delay in the census caused by the pandemic, the entire process has been truncated in 2021-22. However, it is the intention of the Proposed Intervenors, and (as they understand it) their colleagues in the Legislature to adopt such legislation in time for presentation to the Governor for signature in January, or in any event, for signature no later than February 7, subject to theoretical changes to the election timeline discussed below.

10. Under the current election schedule, the 2022 primary will occur on May 17, 2022. *See* 25 P.S. § 2753(a). For a May 17 election, the first day to circulate and file nomination petitions will be February 15, 2022. *See* 25 P.S. § 2868.

11. Although the Department of State has announced that it would like to have 21 days between adoption of a map and commencement of petition circulation, that period is not statutory or required. It apparently represents what the Department believes is a best practice. However, the

process of generating petitions already exists, or they could revert to candidate-typed petitions, and a 21-day window is not necessarily required.

12. If mapmaking is further delayed, the General Assembly has within its authority an alternative solution—to delay the 2022 primary and thereby extend the deadline for a map. Although such a delay is not currently desired by the Proposed Intervenors or, to their knowledge, their legislative colleagues, a postponed primary was adopted in 2020 and could be adopted again.

13. Notwithstanding the facts on the ground, or the language of the relevant Constitutions, Petitioners in this Action seek, as they have sought for almost a year, to prematurely shift the power to draw the maps from the constitutionally designated authority because of a foreshadowing belief that Pennsylvania courts will have to become mapmakers.

14. In so doing, Petitioners would interfere with and circumvent the responsibilities and duties of the General Assembly. It is the intention of the Proposed Intervenors, and to their knowledge and belief, the majority of their colleagues in both bodies (and of both parties) to fulfill their constitutional responsibility and adopt a map through legislation.

15. The Proposed Intervenors are the four Democratic members of the Senate’s State Government Committee, the committee with jurisdiction over the map-drawing legislation.

16. The Senate State Government Committee is in the process, on a bipartisan basis, of running an open, inclusive, and transparent mapmaking process.

17. It is well-settled that the “initial and preferred path [regarding drawing congressional maps is through] legislative and executive action.” *League of Women Voters*, 178 A. 3d at 821. However, if the General Assembly and Governor fail to timely approve a new congressional map, the Pennsylvania judiciary may eventually implement one. *See Mellow v. Mitchell*, 607 A.2d 204 (Pa. 1992).

18. The Proposed Intervenors recognize and understand that courts have a role to play in enacting a congressional reapportionment plan but the courts' role must necessarily be one only of last resort. The courts may intercede only if the General Assembly and the Governor fail to timely adopt a reapportionment plan. *League of Women Voters of Pa. v. Commonwealth*, 178 A.3d 737, 822 (Pa. 2018) (“[I]f the legislature and executive timely enact a remedial plan ..., our role in this matter concludes, unless and until the constitutionality of the new plan is challenged.”).

19. Though the 2022 election deadlines are approaching, Petitioners' claims come too soon and prematurely seek to circumvent the General Assembly's, and the Proposed Intervenors', constitutional authority. The General Assembly has not yet failed to meet the required deadlines to produce a new congressional map, nor has there been a gubernatorial impasse.

20. Rather, the General Assembly is in the process of drawing Pennsylvania's 17-member congressional map. On December 15, 2021, the House State Government Committee approved House Bill 2146. The map from House Bill 2146 is unacceptable to the Proposed Intervenors, but the bill is a vehicle for the constitutional process to conclude in sufficient time.

21. The members of the Senate State Government Committee are engaged in the process of drawing Pennsylvania's congressional map and the Proposed Intervenors are actively participating in that process. While there is not yet agreement, the constitutionally-mandated process continues.

22. The Courts may one day play a role in the 2022 reapportionment plan but that day has not yet come, and may never come.

23. Proposed Intervenors are working towards the General Assembly and the Governor enacting a new Congressional map by the January 30 date, thereby eliminating the need for a hearing or for this Court to select a reapportionment plan submitted by interested parties.

24. If, however, this does not occur, the Proposed Intervenors, as the Democratic leads on congressional reapportionment, and having spent months collecting input from citizens and experts, and working to understand the communities of interest across the Commonwealth, expect that they would submit a proposed map to this Court and otherwise participate in the tentatively scheduled January 31 hearing.

25. Absent permitted intervention, the General Assembly and every member of the Senate Democratic Caucus would risk being eliminated entirely from a critical constitutional responsibility.

WHEREFORE, for the reasons set forth above, the Proposed Intervenors respectfully request the Court's permission to intervene in this Action.

Respectfully submitted,



Kevin Greenberg

A. Michael Pratt

Adam Roseman

GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP

1717 Arch Street, Suite 400

Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103

(215) 988-7818

greenbergk@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Proposed Intervenors
Senators Sharif Street, Maria Collett, Katie
J. Muth, and Anthony H. Williams*

December 28, 2021

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

Carol Ann Carter, Monica Parrilla,	:	464 MD 2021
Rebecca Poyourow, William Tung,	:	465 MD 2021
Roseanne Milazzo, Burt Siegel,	:	
Susan Cassanelli, Lee Cassanelli,	:	
Lynn Wachman, Michael Guttman,	:	
Maya Fonkeu, Brady Hill, Mary Ellen	:	
Balchunis, Tom DeWall, Stephanie McNulty	:	
and Janet Temin,	:	
Petitioners	:	

v.

Veronica Degraffenreid, in her official
capacity as the Acting Secretary of the
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania;
Jessica Mathis, in her official capacity
as Director for the Pennsylvania Bureau
of Election Services and Notaries,
Respondents

PROOF OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that this 28th day of December, 2021, I have served the attached document(s) to the persons on the
date(s) and in the manner(s) stated below, which service satisfies the requirements of Pa.R.A.P. 121:

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Service

Served: Devin Michael Misour
Service Method: eService
Email: dmisour@reedsmith.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: Reed Smith LLP
225 Fifth Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
412--28-8-3091
Phone:
Representing: Petitioner Amy Myers
Petitioner Amy Myers
Petitioner David P. Marsh
Petitioner David P. Marsh
Petitioner Eugene Boman
Petitioner Eugene Boman
Petitioner Garth Isaak
Petitioner Garth Isaak
Petitioner Gary Gordon
Petitioner Gary Gordon
Petitioner James L. Rosenberger
Petitioner James L. Rosenberger
Petitioner Kristopher R. Tapp
Petitioner Kristopher R. Tapp
Petitioner Liz McMahon
Petitioner Liz McMahon
Petitioner Pamela Gorkin
Petitioner Pamela Gorkin
Petitioner Philip T. Gressman
Petitioner Philip T. Gressman
Petitioner Ron Y. Donagi
Petitioner Ron Y. Donagi
Petitioner Timothy G. Feeman
Petitioner Timothy G. Feeman

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: Edward David Rogers
Service Method: eService
Email: rogerse@ballardspahr.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: 1735 Market Street
51st Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone: 215-864-8144
Representing: Petitioner Amy Myers
Petitioner Brady Hill
Petitioner Burt Siegel
Petitioner Carol Ann Carter
Petitioner David P. Marsh
Petitioner Eugene Boman
Petitioner Garth Isaak
Petitioner Gary Gordon
Petitioner James L. Rosenberger
Petitioner Janet Temin
Petitioner Kristopher R. Tapp
Petitioner Lee Cassanelli
Petitioner Liz McMahon
Petitioner Lynn Wachman
Petitioner Mary Ellen Balchunis
Petitioner Maya Fonkeu
Petitioner Michael Guttman
Petitioner Monica Parrilla
Petitioner Pamela Gorkin
Petitioner Philip T. Gressman
Petitioner Rebecca Poyourow
Petitioner Ron Y. Donagi
Petitioner Roseanne Milazzo
Petitioner Stephanie McNulty
Petitioner Susan Cassanelli
Petitioner Timothy G. Feeman
Petitioner Tom DeWall
Petitioner William Tung

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: John Brent Hill
Service Method: eService
Email: jbh@hangle.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: One Logan Square
27th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone: 215--56-8-6200
Representing: Respondent Degraffenreid, Veronica
Respondent Jessica Mathis
Respondent Jessica Mathis
Respondent Veronica Degraffenreid

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: Kim M. Watterson
Service Method: eService
Email: kwatterson@reedsmith.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: 225 Fifth Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
Phone: 412--28-8-7996
Representing: Petitioner Amy Myers
Petitioner Amy Myers
Petitioner David P. Marsh
Petitioner David P. Marsh
Petitioner Eugene Boman
Petitioner Eugene Boman
Petitioner Garth Isaak
Petitioner Garth Isaak
Petitioner Gary Gordon
Petitioner Gary Gordon
Petitioner James L. Rosenberger
Petitioner James L. Rosenberger
Petitioner Kristopher R. Tapp
Petitioner Kristopher R. Tapp
Petitioner Liz McMahon
Petitioner Liz McMahon
Petitioner Pamela Gorkin
Petitioner Pamela Gorkin
Petitioner Philip T. Gressman
Petitioner Philip T. Gressman
Petitioner Ron Y. Donagi
Petitioner Ron Y. Donagi
Petitioner Timothy G. Feeman
Petitioner Timothy G. Feeman

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: Marcel S. Pratt
Service Method: eService
Email: prattm@ballardspahr.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: Ballard Spahr LLP
1735 Market Street, 51st Floor
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103

Phone: 215-864-8506
Representing: Petitioner Brady Hill
Petitioner Burt Siegel
Petitioner Carol Ann Carter
Petitioner Janet Temin
Petitioner Lee Cassanelli
Petitioner Lynn Wachman
Petitioner Mary Ellen Balchunis
Petitioner Maya Fonkeu
Petitioner Michael Guttman
Petitioner Monica Parrilla
Petitioner Rebecca Poyourow
Petitioner Roseanne Milazzo
Petitioner Stephanie McNulty
Petitioner Susan Cassanelli
Petitioner Tom DeWall
Petitioner William Tung

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: Michael R. McDonald
Service Method: eService
Email: mcdonaldm@ballardspahr.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: 1735 Market Street
51st Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone: 215-864-8425
Representing: Petitioner Brady Hill
Petitioner Burt Siegel
Petitioner Carol Ann Carter
Petitioner Janet Temin
Petitioner Lee Cassanelli
Petitioner Lynn Wachman
Petitioner Mary Ellen Balchunis
Petitioner Maya Fonkeu
Petitioner Michael Guttman
Petitioner Monica Parrilla
Petitioner Rebecca Poyourow
Petitioner Roseanne Milazzo
Petitioner Stephanie McNulty
Petitioner Susan Cassanelli
Petitioner Tom DeWall
Petitioner William Tung

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: Paul Keller Ort
Service Method: eService
Email: ortp@ballardspahr.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: 1735 Market Street 51st Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone: 215-864-8287
Representing: Petitioner Brady Hill
Petitioner Burt Siegel
Petitioner Carol Ann Carter
Petitioner Janet Temin
Petitioner Lee Cassanelli
Petitioner Lynn Wachman
Petitioner Mary Ellen Balchunis
Petitioner Maya Fonkeu
Petitioner Michael Guttman
Petitioner Monica Parrilla
Petitioner Rebecca Poyourow
Petitioner Roseanne Milazzo
Petitioner Stephanie McNulty
Petitioner Susan Cassanelli
Petitioner Tom DeWall
Petitioner William Tung

Served: Robert Andrew Wiygul
Service Method: eService
Email: rwiygul@hangle.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: Hangle Aronchick Segal Pudlin & Schiller
One Logan Square, 27th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone: 215--49-6-7042
Representing: Respondent Degraffenreid, Veronica
Respondent Jessica Mathis
Respondent Jessica Mathis
Respondent Veronica Degraffenreid

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: Robert Joseph Clark
Service Method: eService
Email: clarkr@ballardspahr.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: Ballard Spahr
1735 Market Street, 51st Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone: 215--86-4-8659
Representing: Petitioner Brady Hill
Petitioner Burt Siegel
Petitioner Carol Ann Carter
Petitioner Janet Temin
Petitioner Lee Cassanelli
Petitioner Lynn Wachman
Petitioner Mary Ellen Balchunis
Petitioner Maya Fonkeu
Petitioner Michael Guttman
Petitioner Monica Parrilla
Petitioner Rebecca Poyourow
Petitioner Roseanne Milazzo
Petitioner Stephanie McNulty
Petitioner Susan Cassanelli
Petitioner Tom DeWall
Petitioner William Tung

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: Shannon Elise McClure
Service Method: eService
Email: smcclure@reedsmith.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: 1717 Arch Street
Suite 3100
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Phone: 215-241-7977
Representing: Petitioner Amy Myers
Petitioner Amy Myers
Petitioner David P. Marsh
Petitioner David P. Marsh
Petitioner Eugene Boman
Petitioner Eugene Boman
Petitioner Garth Isaak
Petitioner Garth Isaak
Petitioner Gary Gordon
Petitioner Gary Gordon
Petitioner James L. Rosenberger
Petitioner James L. Rosenberger
Petitioner Kristopher R. Tapp
Petitioner Kristopher R. Tapp
Petitioner Liz McMahon
Petitioner Liz McMahon
Petitioner Pamela Gorkin
Petitioner Pamela Gorkin
Petitioner Philip T. Gressman
Petitioner Philip T. Gressman
Petitioner Ron Y. Donagi
Petitioner Ron Y. Donagi
Petitioner Timothy G. Feeman
Petitioner Timothy G. Feeman

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Courtesy Copy

Served: Anthony Richard Holtzman
Service Method: eService
Email: anthony.holtzman@kigates.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: K&L Gates LLP
17 N. Second Street, 18th Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17101
Phone: 717--23-1-4500
Representing: Possible Intervenor Jake Corman
Possible Intervenor Jake Corman
Possible Intervenor Kim Ward
Possible Intervenor Kim Ward

Served: Jeffry William Duffy
Service Method: eService
Email: jduffy@bakerlaw.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: Baker & Hostetler LLP
2929 Arch St., 12th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19104
Phone: 215--56-4-2916
Representing: Possible Intervenor Bryan Cutler
Possible Intervenor Bryan Cutler
Possible Intervenor Kerry Benninghoff
Possible Intervenor Kerry Benninghoff

Served: Kathleen Kotula
Service Method: Email
Email: kkotula@pa.gov
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address:
Phone: 717-783-1657
Representing: Other Kathleen Kotula
Pro Se: Other Kathleen Kotula

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

PROOF OF SERVICE

(Continued)

Served: Thomas W. King III
Service Method: eService
Email: tking@dmkcg.com
Service Date: 12/28/2021
Address: 128 West Cunningham Street
Butler, PA 16001
Phone: (72-4) -283-2200
Representing: Possible Intervenor Anthony Luther
Possible Intervenor Brandy Reep
Possible Intervenor Candee Barnes
Possible Intervenor David Ball
Possible Intervenor Evan Smith
Possible Intervenor James Foreman
Possible Intervenor James Thompson
Possible Intervenor James Vasilko
Possible Intervenor Jay Hagerman
Possible Intervenor Jeffrey Piccola
Possible Intervenor Joseph Renwick
Possible Intervenor Justin Behrens
Possible Intervenor Kenneth Lunsford
Possible Intervenor Kim Geyer
Possible Intervenor Kristine Eng
Possible Intervenor Leslie Oshe
Possible Intervenor Linda Daniels
Possible Intervenor Louis Capozzi
Possible Intervenor Mary Owlett
Possible Intervenor Matthew Stuckey
Possible Intervenor Michael Slupe
Possible Intervenor Pamela Thompson
Possible Intervenor Stephanie Renwick
Possible Intervenor Tammy Lunsford
Possible Intervenor Thomas Reep

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

/s/ Kevin Michael Greenberg

(Signature of Person Serving)

Person Serving: Greenberg, Kevin Michael
Attorney Registration No: 082311
Law Firm: Greenberg Traurig, LLP
Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 400
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Representing: Possible Intervenor Collett, Maria
Possible Intervenor Collett, Maria
Possible Intervenor Muth, Katie J
Possible Intervenor Muth, Katie J
Possible Intervenor Street, Sharif
Possible Intervenor Street, Sharif
Possible Intervenor Williams, Anthony H.
Possible Intervenor Williams, Anthony H.